

1. Health And Social Services Committee Feb 5th 2020

2. Agenda

Documents:

[2.5.20 - HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES - AGENDA.PDF](#)

3. Meeting Minutes

Documents:

[HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES, 02-05-20.PDF](#)

Theodore Roosevelt Executive and Legislative Building  
1550 Franklin Avenue, Mineola, New York 11501

**HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICE COMMITTEE OF  
THE  
NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE**



**Hearing on  
Child Protective Services in Nassau  
County**

Committee Membership

*Rose Marie Walker – Chair  
James Kennedy – Vice Chair  
Laura Schaefer  
C. William Gaylor III*

*Delia Deriggi- Whitton -Ranking  
Arnold Drucker  
Joshua Lafazan*

**AGENDA**

**February 5, 2020  
7:00 PM**

1.	<b>Nancy Nunziata, LMSW Commissioner Department of Social Services</b>
3.	<b>PUBLIC COMMENT</b>

1

2

3

4

5

6 NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE

7

8 RICHARD NICOLELLO

9 PRESIDING OFFICER

10

11 HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES

12 COMMITTEE

13

14 LEGISLATOR ROSE MARIE WALKER

15 CHAIR

16

17

18 Theodore Roosevelt Building

19 1550 Franklin Avenue

20 Mineola, New York

21

22

23 February 5, 2020

24 7:11 P.M.

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

LEGISLATOR ROSE MARIE WALKER

Chair

LEGISLATOR JAMES KENNEDY

Vice Chair

LEGISLATOR LAURA SCHAEFER

LEGISLATOR C. WILLIAM GAYLOR

LEGISLATOR SIELA BYNOE

LEGISLATOR ARNOLD DRUCKER

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Before we  
3 begin I'm going to ask Legislator Colonel  
4 Gaylor to lead us in the pledge.

5 I will ask the clerk if he would  
6 please take the roll.

7 MR. PULITZER: Thank you madam.  
8 Health and Social Services Committee roll  
9 call. Legislator Joshua Lafazan is not  
10 present tonight. Legislator Arnold Drucker.

11 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Here.

12 MR. PULITZER: Filling in for  
13 ranking member Delia DeRiggi-Whitton is  
14 Ms. Bynoe.

15 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Present.

16 MR. PULITZER: Legislator C.  
17 William Gaylor III.

18 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Present.

19 MR. PULITZER: Legislator Laura  
20 Schaefer.

21 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Here.

22 MR. PULITZER: Legislator James  
23 Kennedy.

24 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Here.

25 MR. PULITZER: Joining us today

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 is Legislator Thomas McKeivitt. Chairwoman  
3 Rose Marie Walker.

4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Here.

5 MR. PULITZER: We have a quorum  
6 ma'am.

7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.

8 I would like to first just begin by  
9 thanking everyone for being here tonight.  
10 Sometimes during the middle of the week and we  
11 have a hearing there's very, very few people  
12 here but obviously this is very, very  
13 important and I'm very happy to see so many  
14 people here in attendance. I'd also certainly  
15 like to thank our Social Services Department  
16 for being here, and I believe we do have  
17 representation from the Health Department  
18 also.

19 We have read all about the  
20 heartbreaking tragedy that occurred in Suffolk  
21 County with the death of Thomas Valva. An  
22 eight year old child who died of hypothermia  
23 after being left overnight in a freezing  
24 garage by his father and his father's  
25 fiancée. Suffolk County is now undertaking a

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2       comprehensive review of its Department of  
3       Social Services to evaluate the policies,  
4       procedures and resources to avoid tragedies  
5       like this from happening again.

6                   Before we even knew Suffolk was  
7       doing that, we met and we said we need to meet  
8       here in our legislature. We need to meet with  
9       our department and hear what they have to  
10      say. Hear that they have everything they need  
11      to do the job that they have to do that lies  
12      in front of them. So that is really our  
13      purpose here tonight.

14                  We will meet with our Social  
15      Services Department and know that we have the  
16      resources and the support they need to protect  
17      all of our children. We have our commissioner  
18      Nancy Nunziata here and I thank you so much  
19      and your workers too. And you will explain  
20      your operations of how your department works  
21      and then answer any questions that we might  
22      have or the public might have. I'm going to  
23      ask Legislator Bynoe did you want to say  
24      anything quickly?

25                  LEGISLATOR BYNOE:       I'd like to

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    first start out by thanking you Madam  
3    Chairwoman for convening this very important  
4    special legislative hearing as it relates to  
5    the unspeakable tragedy of the death of Thomas  
6    Valva. We do think it is important that we  
7    are here today to make sure that our Nassau  
8    County Department of Social Services and also  
9    the Department of Health are resourced  
10   properly to carry out the important work of  
11   protecting the most vulnerable of our Nassau  
12   community residents, the children. Without  
13   further ado, I will turn the floor back over  
14   to you.

15                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:       Thank you.  
16    Like we said, we are not doing this out of  
17    suddenly thinking everything is wrong but we  
18    wanted to be proactive rather than reactive  
19    here in Nassau County.

20                   So, we are going to begin. I'm  
21    just going to let you know that we do have a  
22    three minute limit on our speakers when it  
23    gets to public comment time. Not that you're  
24    going to be silenced immediately but we will  
25    ask you after three minutes to wrap it up



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 because we do have a large crowd here tonight  
3 and we'd like to have as many people be able  
4 to speak as they can.

5 Just before the presentation starts  
6 by our commissioner, I'm going to ask if the  
7 president of our CSEA, Jerry Laricchiuta,  
8 would please come up and say a few words.

9 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Good evening  
10 Madam Chairwoman and the Health and Services  
11 Committee. I have to tell you, this is  
12 probably one of the most anxious and nervous  
13 committee hearings that this group and my  
14 union has ever attended and spoke at. What  
15 I'd like to do for a second here is we have to  
16 remember that this is revolving around an  
17 eight year old boy. An innocent eight year  
18 old child. I'd like to ask for a moment of  
19 silence just in respect and in prayer to  
20 Thomas Valva before we continue if that's all  
21 right with the chair.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Absolutely.

23 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Thank you.  
24 This is such a difficult I don't want to even  
25 call it an issue. It's part of life here on

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Long Island and this is involving our  
3 children. I raised three daughters. I have  
4 eight grandchildren right now ages eight  
5 months to nine years old. I couldn't imagine  
6 going through what this family is going  
7 through.

8 What I'm here to speak about though  
9 and you see this great group behind me. These  
10 are our DSS, Department of Social Services CPS  
11 workers. People that put their entire family,  
12 their minds, their lives on the line every day  
13 and their job is to make sure our children are  
14 safe and they really want that done 110  
15 percent right, not halfway done. So this is  
16 not about a political move or -- this is about  
17 life here and tragedy that happened because  
18 something went wrong out in the Suffolk. I  
19 don't know what and I'm not going to say  
20 what. Let them determine that.

21 But what we are trying to say in  
22 Nassau County we want to be a little  
23 prospective about that. We were here in  
24 October. These folks here have case loads  
25 that are way above the recommended average.

Regal Reporting Service  
516-747-7353

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And if you don't think that matters in social  
3 services and in CPS you are sincerely wrong.

4 I just had a chat with a few  
5 people. They were filling me in and telling  
6 me what goes on. Let's say the average is  
7 recommended between 12 and 16 cases each.  
8 Most of our CPS workers have over 20. 22,  
9 23. We have a few that are over 30. That's  
10 absurd and cannot be allowed. Cannot be  
11 accepted. Because their jobs are to  
12 constantly stay in touch with families and  
13 children. When they get contacted by an  
14 accusation, someone makes a complaint, they  
15 have 24 hours --

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.  
17 Let's let Jerry speak please.

18 MR. LARICCHIUTA: She's right.  
19 We do have unlimited funds, which brings us to  
20 the question of why are we having this  
21 conversation?

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'd ask  
23 everyone you are more than welcome -- excuse  
24 me.

25 MR. LARICCHIUTA: I will wait

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 until this is over.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'd ask  
4 everyone to give everybody else the courtesy  
5 of speaking.

6 MR. LARICCHIUTA: We're not even  
7 arguing with them. We're agreeing with them.  
8 We are agreeing with them that 75 percent of  
9 your salaries are paid for. That's what  
10 they're saying. I think. Can I make one more  
11 statement? I don't want to increase this  
12 anymore but they need to hear this because  
13 these people -- you see the vitriol that's in  
14 this room.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You have to  
16 understand that nothing you are shouting out  
17 is going on the record. If you would like to  
18 speak you are more than welcome to but you  
19 fill out a form and you will get to speak.

20 MR. LARICCHIUTA: We're not  
21 disagreeing with you.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We would like  
23 to hear what you have to say but we're asking  
24 you to please follow the protocol of the  
25 meeting.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Madam Chair,  
3 here is what we are trying to say. There's no  
4 reason to have case loads overloaded with 75  
5 percent of their salaries are subsidized by  
6 the federal and state government. Our  
7 children are too important to overlook this.  
8 Our commissioner, our new commissioner is  
9 very, very helpful at this and she cares.

10 I'm only agreeing with the fact  
11 that 75 percent of our workers' pay was  
12 subsidized. We should have more. A lot  
13 more. I'm sorry. We're going to shut it  
14 down. They're not going to let anybody  
15 speak. That's no way to show respect to the  
16 families that have gone through this tragedy  
17 either. I don't believe that's respect. We  
18 want to respect the children. We want to  
19 respect the families. But we represent the  
20 people that are doing their best. You cannot  
21 do a job if you're 50 percent staffed.

22 The bottom line is, look, help us  
23 get the staffing up so we don't have this  
24 tragedy in Nassau County. Please, we do not  
25 want to ever see any tragedy like this in

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Nassau County.

3 These CPS workers behind us they  
4 work hard. They dedicate their lives to this  
5 and they're losing sleep and they're having  
6 therapeutic sessions because of what happened  
7 to little Thomas and they don't want this to  
8 happen in Nassau. So please give us the  
9 staffing that we need.

10 And Commissioner Nunziata, thank  
11 you for everything that you've been doing. I  
12 thank you Madam Chair.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.  
14 I'm going to ask you one more time to please  
15 sit. So now we can have the presentation by  
16 our Department of Social Services. I ask you  
17 kindly to please not disrupt. There are many  
18 people in this room that would like to get up  
19 and speak and it's very difficult for us to  
20 move forward. I don't want to have put this  
21 in recess because you're shouting over  
22 everyone. I'm going to ask you kindly to  
23 please follow the rules that everyone else  
24 seems to be following.

25 And I'm going to ask now for our

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 commissioner to please give a presentation.

3 Jerry, thank you and I apologize  
4 that you had to be disrupted so many times and  
5 I thank you all the members who are here with  
6 you. Thank you.

7 Good evening Chairwoman Walker,  
8 Legislator Kennedy, members of the Health and  
9 Social Services Committee as well as  
10 Legislator Bynoe. I appreciate you having me  
11 here to discuss the child welfare services in  
12 Nassau County. It's my hope that at the end  
13 of this presentation you will have a clear  
14 picture of the scope of the program in Nassau  
15 County, the systemic response we have in place  
16 to address this very important issue and the  
17 ways in which you can assist us moving  
18 forward.

19 Before I begin my presentation, I'd  
20 like to introduce you to three key managers  
21 who are responsible for the child welfare  
22 services in the county.

23 Sitting at the end here is Maria  
24 Lauria. Maria was recently promoted to Social  
25 Services program coordinator. In this new

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 capacity Maria will oversee all child welfare  
3 programs, including Child Protective Services,  
4 foster care and adoption and preventative  
5 services. Maria is also the architect of the  
6 blind removal system which has been recognized  
7 nationally and has now been adopted  
8 statewide. Maria has been with the department  
9 over 30 years.

10 Jeannette Feingold to my left, is  
11 the director of Child Protective Services and  
12 she has been overseeing this department for  
13 the past nine years.

14 To my far right at the end is Terry  
15 McGuinness. Terry is the director of  
16 Preventative Services and CPS Ongoing  
17 programs. She has been supervising that unit  
18 for four years.

19 To my immediate right is Rudy  
20 Carmenati, who is the deputy county attorney  
21 for the Department of Social Services. He has  
22 been with the department for nine years. All  
23 of them will be available to answer questions  
24 as they come up today.

25 We come here this evening with a



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    very heavy heart over the events that have  
3    unfolded in Suffolk County with the untimely  
4    death of eight year Thomas Valva. As you  
5    know, the investigation is ongoing and  
6    therefore we cannot comment about that case.  
7    We are here to answer questions about Nassau  
8    County's Child Protective Services.

9                   Each day our CPS staff are charged  
10   with investigating reports of alleged abuse  
11   and neglect in the county. In 2019 we  
12   received an average of 680 reports per month  
13   of alleged abuse and neglect. The work is  
14   fast paced, it's very stressful and the stakes  
15   are very high.

16                  However, we are very fortunate in  
17   that we have a department that is well trained  
18   and dedicated and who work tirelessly to  
19   ensure that Nassau County's children are  
20   protected. With that, what I'd like to do is  
21   get into the power point presentation.

22                  So, the first slide is to give you  
23   some basic demographics. Nationally the  
24   picture is not a good one. Throughout the  
25   United States during FY 2018 there were 4.3

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2 million referrals to child protective service  
3 agencies throughout the country. That  
4 involved approximately 7.8 million children.

5                   In New York State, in 2018, there  
6 were 165,943 reports of child abuse and  
7 neglect. Which represented 37.5 children out  
8 of every thousand children were the subject of  
9 a potential abuse and neglect report. Where  
10 the cases were indicated, 30.7 per 1,000  
11 children in New York were victims of potential  
12 child abuse and neglect.

13                  Here in Nassau County we fall below  
14 the statewide average. In 2018 we had 6,370  
15 reported allegations of abuse and neglect.  
16 Which equates to a rate of 21.1 children for  
17 every thousand children in Nassau County.  
18 These would be confirmed cases where children  
19 were victims of abuse and neglect.

20                  What we know just from looking at  
21 these numbers is that this issue is clearly a  
22 national problem. We know it's a state  
23 problem. And what we know is that right now  
24 we take some solace, but certainly not much,  
25 in knowing that our numbers at least fall well

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 below the statewide averages.

3 I want to talk a little bit about  
4 the structure in our CPS department.  
5 Currently we have approximately 65 staff and  
6 we are bringing on more over the next  
7 hopefully couple of weeks if not months. We  
8 have four units. Each unit is headed by a --  
9 we actually have more than four units. We  
10 have four assistant directors. Those are  
11 those case supes three and they oversee a  
12 variety of staff in their unit. And what you  
13 will see is that the staff are pretty evenly  
14 spread out across the department. The  
15 division, as I said, is headed by Jeannette  
16 Feingold and she'll be speaking in a little  
17 while. But that's how we have structured the  
18 department.

19 We are bringing on 11 additional  
20 case workers. So, eventually if I were to do  
21 this organizational chart somewhere down the  
22 next couple of weeks or month we would  
23 probably have six different units. So we are  
24 definitely expanding the staff there.

25 I want to talk about the issue and

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    what we do but it's really important, you  
3    know, Jerry alluded to the staff that work  
4    there and I have to tell you it's a very, very  
5    special group. Our staff, our child  
6    protective staff, is probably one of the most  
7    dedicated group of people you will meet. Many  
8    of them have been working for the department  
9    for many years. They have dedicated  
10   themselves in trying to meet the needs of the  
11   families and children. They're very  
12   thoughtful when it comes to confidentiality,  
13   to coming to handling matters that are very,  
14   very delicate. And these are very delicate  
15   matters that they deal with. They're also  
16   very diverse and they're very representative  
17   of the communities in Nassau County that we  
18   work with. We have a couple of superstars  
19   among our staff.

20                   In 2019 --  
21                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:       Excuse me. I  
22    said it before, you are welcome to speak. You  
23    are not to shout out or you're going to have  
24    to make us stop this hearing. It's not your  
25    turn to speak and you are welcome to speak

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 when it's your turn but someone else is  
3 speaking. Give them the courtesy of  
4 listening. I'm going to ask again. I think  
5 you are being very disrespectful to many, many  
6 people in this room who want to continue the  
7 hearing. That's fine.

8 As I stated before, we will be  
9 having public comment after our presentation.  
10 But right now it is our commissioner's turn to  
11 speak and I would again respectfully ask you  
12 to sit down and to stop shouting out and let  
13 our commissioner and her staff finish the  
14 presentation.

15 MS. NUNZIATA: Thank you.

16 On the next slide what we tried to  
17 do is show the types of cases that we've  
18 received over the past few years. And if you  
19 look at those pie charts, what it shows is  
20 that our numbers have remained fairly stable.  
21 The largest percentage of reported cases,  
22 reported allegations that we get, are in the  
23 area of child neglect and child maltreatment.

24 Now, New York State Office of  
25 Children and Family Services defines child

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 maltreatment, child neglect, refers to the  
3 quality of care that a child is given from  
4 those that are responsible for that child.  
5 Things like lack of food, lack of clothing,  
6 lack of shelter, lack of medical care would  
7 all fall within that category.

8 If you take a look, more than 85  
9 percent of our cases that have come into the  
10 county over the past three years have been  
11 reports of potential lack of food, clothing,  
12 shelter, medical care, educational, neglect,  
13 things like that. Our cases of severe  
14 physical abuse or sexual abuse, though  
15 significant, do not represent the majority of  
16 our cases.

17 In terms of the next slide, it  
18 takes a look at some of the case load ratios.  
19 And the first box takes a look at the ratio,  
20 case ratios for Child Protective Services  
21 workers. Now, the numbers right now, we took  
22 a snapshot. Understand that the numbers  
23 you're looking at is a snapshot in time. So  
24 as of the beginning of this week there were  
25 1,086 active cases. These are cases that are

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 open and that are undergoing investigation.

3 We have currently 65 workers for an  
4 average of 16.7 cases. Now we are adding  
5 additional workers because we did receive  
6 approval for an 11 additional case workers.  
7 So, it's my hope that that ratio goes down.  
8 Mind you that the number we are presenting  
9 takes into account the entire CPS department.  
10 It's not just a portion of CPS. It's not just  
11 an investigative unit or the investigative  
12 units. It's the entire department, including  
13 all staff who work in CPS.

14 The second box speaks to the Child  
15 Protective Services ongoing. These are cases  
16 where there has been an indication of abuse  
17 and neglect and these families are working  
18 with us to try to -- where we are working with  
19 them I should say, to try to strengthen their  
20 family. We follow a number of these cases.  
21 Currently we have about 173 active cases in  
22 that unit. We have 18 case workers and they  
23 carry 9.6 cases a piece.

24 Then I thought that I would just  
25 also show you the foster care number. Foster

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 care number is not based on cases, it's based  
3 on individual children. So currently we have  
4 165 children in our custody, in our foster  
5 care system. We have 20 case workers assigned  
6 to those children for a ratio of 8.25 cases  
7 per worker.

8 There is a recommended, and you may  
9 have heard this, there is a recommended case  
10 load ratio for CPS workers and that's  
11 somewhere between 12 and 15 cases. That is a  
12 state recommendation. Though you must know  
13 it's not a state mandate. So we are in  
14 striking distance of that. We are hoping that  
15 as we continue to bring on additional staff  
16 that we will be able to lower those numbers.

17 The other thing that when you look  
18 at the case load ratio numbers we all have to  
19 understand is that there's a real ebb and flow  
20 to these numbers. Depending upon the month,  
21 depended on the week, the case load could be  
22 higher or lower depending on the amount of the  
23 reports that we get in. Also depending on the  
24 severity of the case. Sometimes we are  
25 definitely going to have workers that have



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    more cases than others. It may be because a  
3    particular worker has a certain skill set that  
4    we feel is better matched with a case that we  
5    have received.

6                   So, the numbers, you know, will  
7    change and the case ratios will change  
8    depending upon the amount of the cases that we  
9    are taking in, the amount of calls and the  
10   amount of cases that we are actively  
11   investigating.

12                  The bottom line is we have to  
13   investigate every single case that comes  
14   through. We get all of our cases through the  
15   state registry. Maybe the next slide  
16   Jeannette will walk you through the process.  
17   But for every case that comes through the  
18   state registry to us that case must be  
19   investigated. And there are various time  
20   lines where we need to complete that  
21   investigation.

22                  So, since I've been on board, which  
23   has been 90 days, I think it was just 90 days,  
24   staffing has been one of my priorities. I'm  
25   pleased to say that while we have not made all

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     the progress that we want to make we are  
3     definitely making progress. I've certainly  
4     got commitments from our fiscal folks that as  
5     we need additional people they are at the  
6     ready to assist us. Let's go to the next  
7     one.

8                   I'm going to turn the mic over to  
9     Jeannette right now and Jeannette will walk  
10    you through the process and really try to help  
11    explain what happens from the time that we get  
12    a case through making some kind of a  
13    determination.

14                  MS. FEINGOLD:     Thank you. So,  
15    the only way we can start an investigation is  
16    when a report comes in through the state  
17    central registry. Not a phone call to our  
18    local Department of Social Services but  
19    through the state central registry. Whereby,  
20    a call has to get called in through the 1-800  
21    number through Albany. That can happen either  
22    through a mandated reporter or through a  
23    person making a report to the state central  
24    registry.

25                  So when somebody makes a report, a

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 suspected allegation of neglect or abuse, a  
3 reporter at the state takes that report. They  
4 take that information, the demographics of the  
5 subject, the children involved, their date of  
6 birth, the address, the allegations. That  
7 information. They take that information and  
8 they send it back to Nassau County because we  
9 are just talking about Nassau County right now  
10 where the children live. Our registry unit in  
11 Nassau County takes that information and they  
12 verify that the children live in Nassau. And  
13 once our registry unit takes that information  
14 they send it to one of our investigative  
15 units.

16 I would like to share that we are  
17 open 24 hours a day. So we operate, just like  
18 I said, 24 hours a day. We can take our  
19 report at three o'clock in the morning. So we  
20 are on call just like that. When we take our  
21 report our report can be dispatched into one  
22 of our different units. I will explain how  
23 the process goes.

24 It can start off and it can go into  
25 one of our straight investigative units

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 depending upon the allegations at hand. If  
3 it's one of our specialty units, meaning if  
4 it's physical abuse with a child under the age  
5 of 13, it be could fractures, burns, a  
6 fatality, it will go into our severe physical  
7 abuse unit, which is housed out of Bethpage  
8 and works with our special victims, the  
9 police. That would be one of our units. If  
10 it's sexual abuse for an adult, perpetuating  
11 sexual abuse with a child, it would still go  
12 out of Bethpage with our sexual abuse team  
13 also working with the police.

14 If it's a court-ordered  
15 investigation where that can only be handled  
16 with a sitting family court judge would order  
17 a court-ordered investigation that would come  
18 to the court, that would go to a special  
19 court-ordered unit where they would call in  
20 the case and we would do a special  
21 court-ordered investigation.

22 Or when a case comes in during the  
23 night or a follow-up during the day, our night  
24 staff or emergency staff would handle that  
25 case. That unit does not carry a case load

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 but handles cases for follow-up during the  
3 evenings and at night and on the weekends.

4 We also have a family assessment  
5 unit. That's a nontraditional approach to  
6 investigations and that is where a family  
7 assessment response, where it's an engagement  
8 approach to investigations. Those are our  
9 different approaches to investigations.

10 Our other investigation unit is  
11 where it's not a specialty unit but we have  
12 eight additional investigation units that  
13 handle our investigations that come in.

14 And once we get a report for  
15 investigation we have 24 hours to begin our  
16 investigation. And our investigation begins  
17 with either a source contact or a face-to-face  
18 investigation. Once we have that, beginning  
19 our 24 hour contact, that's where we have to  
20 assess the safety of the child. That's where  
21 we begin our investigation. That determines  
22 the imminency of the child and the children at  
23 home. To assess the safety of the children.  
24 To make sure that there's no imminent danger.  
25 We go out and assess their safety and make

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 sure that there's no harm to the children.  
3 That the children can in fact remain in the  
4 home.

5 If need be, if we have to do a  
6 safety plan for the children, if we have to  
7 provide interventions in the home, if we have  
8 to provide some referrals, some resources and  
9 we continue to go out to the home continuously  
10 to make collateral contacts, to make visits,  
11 to interview everybody in the home. To  
12 interview school personnel, to interview  
13 medical providers, mental health providers.  
14 Whoever is involved with the family. To  
15 interview neighbors. To interview whoever is  
16 involved with the family.

17 Sometimes we need to make referrals  
18 and to make other provisions that are needed  
19 for the family at large. We need to make a  
20 seven-day safety assessment for the family.  
21 And in that seven-day safety assessment we  
22 need to document what was done and if the  
23 family is at any risk.

24 Now, might I add, through the  
25 investigation we need to continue to assess

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the safety of the family and document it. We  
3 continue through progress notes and continue.  
4 And if at any time we feel there is any risk  
5 we need to, if need be, go to court and file  
6 petitions. And if we have to, we might have  
7 to do a removal. But that is not our goal.

8 Our goal is to try at all times to  
9 keep the family together and to meet with  
10 family and offer any kind of resources. We  
11 always believe we look for the strength in the  
12 family and to work with the family and to  
13 utilize the skills necessary that the family  
14 does in fact have. What we do know is that  
15 all families do have strengths and skills and  
16 we utilize that.

17 On the outset we have 60 days to  
18 make a determination in any given case. So  
19 that's what we go on the outset of. As I  
20 stated, we go through, and for our  
21 investigation, we have to go through -- we  
22 work with the kids. We interview every  
23 child. We interview every parent. We  
24 interview people that aren't in the home and  
25 we continue forth with our investigation.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 If in fact we believe that the  
3 workers feel that we do have to have a removal  
4 we go forth and we have what's called our  
5 blind removal. Because no worker should have  
6 to feel that they have to make a decision on  
7 their own. We bring forth a team. And in our  
8 team it's met with administrators, with the  
9 director of children services, preventive  
10 services ongoing, our legal team, and we all  
11 meet together and discuss the case and offer  
12 services that need to be offered. Of if we  
13 need to have a removal, we bring forth that  
14 information and then we go forth and present  
15 that. And we present that to the court  
16 because the court is the one that makes the  
17 ultimate decision as to whether or not a  
18 removal will be upheld. Because it's the  
19 judges that make that ultimate final  
20 decision. Or in fact we can provide the  
21 resources that are necessary to keep that  
22 family intact.

23 Within our 60 days we have to make  
24 a determination for the case and our case can  
25 go in a variety of ways. We can make a



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     determination where the case would be  
3     unfounded. Where that there would be no  
4     credible evidence to substantiate the case.  
5     Our case could be unindicated and closed.  
6     Meaning that there would be some credible  
7     evidence to indicate the case but we are  
8     closing the case because the family was able  
9     to follow through with us and follow our  
10    recommendations. So we are able to close the  
11    case.

12                   Our case could be indicated and  
13    open and we are opening the case because the  
14    family was not able to work with us and we  
15    have to go to family court and file a neglect  
16    petition. So we have to take that route  
17    because we need the arm of the court. Or we  
18    have to indicate the case and open it and  
19    we're placing the children in foster care.  
20    Sometimes we just have to indicate an open and  
21    use our resources and refer the children to  
22    preventive services. Or we open the case to  
23    PINS because the family needs PINS diversion  
24    services. I think that might cover our  
25    investigation area.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. NUNZIATA: I just to want to  
3 give you an idea of the budget as it relates  
4 to our child welfare services.

5 So, the Department of Social  
6 Services, as you will see in this current  
7 slide, represents about 22 percent of the  
8 general fund budget. The next chart shows you  
9 that the services portion of the general fund  
10 budget, the personnel costs, are about 48  
11 percent. So again, that includes the Child  
12 Protective Services unit.

13 The next slide breaks out the  
14 budget, the current operating budget by  
15 category. The NIFA-approved budget that we  
16 have. I want to point you toward the  
17 authorized head count. So, we have an  
18 authorized head count for the department of  
19 576 employees. We currently have 545 on  
20 board. We are bringing another 18 on board.  
21 Of those 18, 11 are case work staff going to  
22 CPS. Currently we are 94 percent filled in  
23 terms of the authorized positions. 94 percent  
24 of those positions are filled and three  
25 percent remain vacant and we are actively

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 canvassing. We do have a civil service list  
3 already for case workers. We are in the  
4 process of canvassing that list so we can get  
5 these folks on board.

6 It does take a little bit of time  
7 because there is extensive training that CPS  
8 staff have to go through before they can  
9 actually begin working on cases, and I believe  
10 that's a seven week process. And it is a  
11 state-required training. So on-boarding  
12 people does take some time.

13 And we also, in addition to what  
14 the state provides, we also do a tremendous  
15 amount of supplementary training at the  
16 department for folks that are going into this  
17 unit. It's a highly specialized unit and we  
18 want our best trained folks there.

19 I think that is it for my  
20 presentation and certainly if you have  
21 questions or want to table them let me know.  
22 Thank you.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
24 Commissioner. I'm just going to start and  
25 then we will all be asking questions.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Legislator Muscarella has joined us also.

3 I know you're new to the department  
4 and you're new to Nassau County government.  
5 Have you had the opportunity to conduct a  
6 review of the policies, the procedures and the  
7 resources within CPS?

8 MS. NUNZIATA: I can't say that  
9 we have done a formal review but certainly  
10 I've been looking at every single department  
11 and certainly CPS is one on my list. It's at  
12 the top of my list. We've definitely been  
13 talking about the staffing from the minute I  
14 walked in to the position. Jeannette was  
15 extremely vocal in letting me know that we  
16 needed some additional staff. So,  
17 fortunately, I have been lobbying and talking  
18 to every single person I can speak to and we  
19 did get approval on those 11 staff and I'm  
20 hoping to get some additional.

21 That is probably our biggest  
22 resource that we have needed is actually the  
23 staffing. Like I said, many of our staff that  
24 we have on board have been doing this work for  
25 a while. So we have a pretty good, skilled

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 group of workers out there.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I know you  
4 said you have staff of 65 case workers,  
5 correct?

6 MS. NUNZIATA: 65 workers. CPS  
7 workers. Some of them are case workers. Some  
8 of them have other titles.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: How many of  
10 that staff would you say are actually case  
11 workers? Case workers that have a case load?

12 MS. NUNZIATA: Every single one  
13 of them. Plus we have the assistant directors  
14 and we have supervisors.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: All 65 of  
16 those are case workers? They have a case load  
17 of --

18 MS. NUNZIATA: They're field  
19 workers.

20 LEGISLATOR WALKER: What is the  
21 difference between a field worker and a case  
22 worker?

23 MS. FEINGOLD: Those are field  
24 workers. Those are 65 field workers.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Each one of

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 those has a case load? Every one of those 65  
3 workers has a case load?

4 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes.

5 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So that case  
6 load of what did we say we had, 1,086, that is  
7 divided, well, basically equally. Maybe  
8 someone has --

9 MS. FEINGOLD: That's an  
10 average. Those 65 case workers, when you say  
11 16.7, that 1,086 is averaged out over 65 case  
12 workers.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So somebody  
14 could have 18 and somebody could have  
15 whatever?

16 MS. FEINGOLD: Correct.

17 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Do any of our  
18 case workers have a larger number? Not even  
19 close to 16 or 18?

20 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes.

21 LEGISLATOR WALKER: What might  
22 that number be?

23 MS. FEINGOLD: Some might have  
24 30.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Why, if we

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   basically try to even it out, why would some  
3   have 30? It just concerns me. It's hard  
4   enough to have smaller case load and really  
5   devote -- and I'm not saying any of them are  
6   doing something wrong, but someone that has a  
7   case load of 30 is a lot different. That's  
8   almost double the amount of what somebody else  
9   might have.

10                   MS. NUNZIATA:       Sometimes what has  
11   happened -- again, this has been since I have  
12   been observing the department. We have lost a  
13   number of people and when you lose people it  
14   takes a while to bring people on. Those cases  
15   have to go somewhere. Often times then those  
16   cases go to the folks that are on staff.  
17   Again, it may not be the best system but we  
18   have to manage the case load. Whether staff  
19   are coming or going or retiring we still have  
20   to manage the case load.

21                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Right. So  
22   then are we really talking about 65 case  
23   workers or are there times there's only 40  
24   case workers or 30 something case workers?

25                   MS. NUNZIATA:       There could be

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   different -- depending on the point in time  
3   again the numbers could be different. But our  
4   case load is without a doubt some folks have  
5   larger case loads than others. What the hope  
6   is, is that as we bring additional people on  
7   we want to try to get the case load down for  
8   everyone to what the recommended standard is.  
9   That's what we are working on.

10                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     I would hope  
11   that we would do that. But I'm not really  
12   quite grasping -- we have 65 case workers  
13   you're saying.

14                   MS. NUNZIATA:       Right now, yes, we  
15   do.

16                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Yet some have  
17   a case load of 30. Some have a lot less and  
18   those numbers fluctuate. How do we some days  
19   have 65 and other days we have 40?

20                   MS. FEINGOLD:       You don't have  
21   that drastic drop, 65 to 40, number one. You  
22   might have 65 to 63. You have a drop because  
23   you have people who are out on maternity  
24   leave. You have a drop because people who are  
25   out on medical leave. That's why you have a



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 drop.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Right now do  
4 we have that drop? I really want to know how  
5 many --

6 MS. FEINGOLD: You have a drop  
7 between 65 to 62. That's what you have a drop  
8 of. When you count. When you count that.  
9 You have a drop because you count how many  
10 vacant lines you have because lines that can't  
11 be filled. That's where you have a count.  
12 That's where you have your count. You have a  
13 drop when you ask how come a worker has 30  
14 cases and a worker has 15. You have variation  
15 in case loads because you have workers that  
16 have different skill sets is one reason why  
17 there's a variation in case loads. We try to  
18 manage out the case loads. Cases are given  
19 out on a rotating basis. You have to be fair  
20 in how a worker gets a case.

21 A worker is given a case. When you  
22 get a case, a case is given out on a rotating  
23 basis within a unit. So that it's fair for  
24 every worker to get a case. That's how a case  
25 is given out. So, a supervisor manages a

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 worker and how they do a case. They work with  
3 their worker in doing a case. Some workers  
4 have a greater skill set and a supervisor  
5 works with that worker in handling their  
6 case. Some workers are much more proficient  
7 and we work with those workers in trying to  
8 get down their cases. And that's where we  
9 have some problem. We don't have 50 workers  
10 that have 30 cases. We don't have that. We  
11 have a couple of workers that have high case  
12 loads, and we are working with those workers  
13 to get those cases down.

14 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I hear what  
15 you're saying. My major concern is that if we  
16 are lacking the number of people that we need,  
17 I know you said we are hiring 11 more and it  
18 will take time for training and so forth. But  
19 if we need to be hiring 30 more or 40 more  
20 that's what we need to be looking at. Because  
21 when it comes to our children and the safety  
22 of our children and the safety of these  
23 families, we need to know that we have  
24 enough. We need to know that you have  
25 enough. Again, this isn't putting you on the

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 spot. If you need more we need to hear that  
3 you need more.

4 MS. NUNZIATA: Let me tell you  
5 what we did. We have approval for 11 and just  
6 last week or two weeks ago, I can't remember,  
7 I put in for another 20. So it is ongoing.  
8 We are putting in the request. I have a  
9 commitment that as we need the resources we  
10 will get them. So we have 11 approved. We  
11 have another 20 that just went in. Request  
12 for 20. 20 additional.

13 MS. FEINGOLD: This is a  
14 continuing process is what we need. We need a  
15 continuing training group that goes one after  
16 another after another. It's not a process  
17 where you hire 30 and then you just stop.

18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I get that.

19 MS. FEINGOLD: It takes a while  
20 to train people. Going up to Rensselaer to  
21 train people. And we continue with this  
22 process. It takes a good three years to make  
23 a case worker. This is a very, very difficult  
24 job to be a case worker. There's a lot of  
25 emotions involved. What our workers do to go

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     out there, the families that we service, we  
3     don't want to take these children. We want to  
4     build these families. We want to keep our  
5     children together. We're not there to rip  
6     families apart. We want to build these  
7     families. We want to support them. We want  
8     to keep them together. That's our job. We  
9     have families too. That's not what we want to  
10    do. But we can only do that with the  
11    resources that we have. We're people. We're  
12    human. But we need resources out there and we  
13    need to continue to do that.

14                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Jeannette,  
15    I'm not questioning -- I mean you all give 100  
16    percent and the care and the love that you  
17    have you want to do right. As do we. We want  
18    to make sure that you have every single thing  
19    possible that you need. Again, I don't want  
20    you to think we're questioning or we're saying  
21    like oh, you're not doing. If you need more  
22    to do what you have to do we have to know  
23    that. We have to know that to be able to give  
24    you more. To do everything we can to ensure  
25    the safety of these young children and these

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 families. So, that's where we are.

3 MS. NUNZIATA: I think I speak  
4 for everyone at this table in saying thank you  
5 for that support because we need the support.  
6 We need the additional staffing. We need all  
7 of you to support us in that effort. So thank  
8 you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I do have  
10 more but I know there's a lot of us here. I'm  
11 going to let others ask some questions.  
12 Anybody want to go first? Legislator  
13 Schaefer.

14 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: In this  
15 moment I just have one topic want to cover.  
16 So, you mentioned this word I think maybe  
17 once. I've certainly read about it quite a  
18 bit about it over the last couple of weeks,  
19 unfounded. It sounds like a word that's placed  
20 on a lot of situations and nothing is then  
21 done to help that child. That's what we're  
22 reading. That's what we are hearing. That's  
23 what we're seeing. I want to know what kind  
24 of scenario ends up in an unfounded. To me,  
25 I'm wondering that your hands aren't tied by

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 certain laws or things like that that you  
3 can't move further within a situation to take  
4 another step to help a child.

5 What would be an unfounded scenario  
6 situation? When would there be an instance  
7 where you weren't be able to move forward  
8 because of a law? These are things that we  
9 want to change in addition to getting you  
10 help.

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Probably Jeannette  
12 will be able to give you an example. But what  
13 I can tell you is that the difference between  
14 an indicated case and an unfounded case is  
15 credible evidence. We have to be able to show  
16 pictures and documents and all of that to try  
17 to get a case indicated. Sometimes we will go  
18 out on a case and we may find that -- people  
19 call in these cases for many, many different  
20 reasons. So sometimes we may get a case that  
21 says there is no food in the house. Okay?  
22 And that the children come to school hungry.  
23 Obviously we have to do an investigation.

24 We may go to the house and find  
25 that there is food in that refrigerator. But

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 we may go to the school and they may say the  
3 kid is always hungry. So then we have to  
4 continue to dig a little deeper to find out  
5 what is happening there. Then we have to  
6 widen the investigation.

7 So, we don't go and make a  
8 determination. As Jeannette said, we have 60  
9 days once we have determined that the child is  
10 not at imminent risk we have 60 days to  
11 decide. But our job is to produce for the  
12 courts credible evidence and then they decide  
13 what's credible.

14 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: After you  
15 have a situation like that, after you get say  
16 a phone call about something like that  
17 example, how long before you're going to the  
18 house to check on that?

19 MS. NUNZIATA: We have to go out  
20 in 24 hours on every call.

21 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Then I  
22 would assume you are interviewing a teacher at  
23 school as well to find out where they're  
24 coming from because they're making allegations  
25 of child abuse to start with?

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. NUNZIATA: Absolutely. We  
3 are interviewing everybody to make a  
4 determination as to what we're told by perhaps  
5 the parents and what is being told by the  
6 school or anyone else. We interview  
7 neighbors. We interview anybody that we need  
8 to speak to.

9 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: I know this  
10 is kind of a broad question. Where do you  
11 think a lot of the disconnect is? Where is  
12 there a disconnect that is resulting in  
13 situations like, God help us, this? I'm sure  
14 this is not the first time something like this  
15 has happened. I know it isn't. This is one  
16 that's in the news right now and this should  
17 never happen.

18 MS. NUNZIATA: It's really hard  
19 for me to comment on that because every  
20 situation is very different and it's very  
21 unique. Even a report of there's no food in  
22 the home, that kind of a report could look  
23 different depending upon the family and  
24 depending upon what is going on. So I can't  
25 say with 100 percent certainty where the gaps



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 are.

3 What I can say is that what we do  
4 is gather the information. If we have to go  
5 to court with it we give the court the  
6 information. They then make determinations  
7 and they make recommendations.

8 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: If you go  
9 to court with credible evidence how often do  
10 you find that the court ends up -- like what  
11 do they do? Do they mandate that you remove  
12 the child? Does it happen often? Does it  
13 not?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: Not always does  
15 the court agree with us.

16 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Even with  
17 credible evidence? What you're supposed to be  
18 producing?

19 MS. FEINGOLD: Absolutely. So  
20 when the court doesn't agree with us, they  
21 will order us, they will order the child  
22 returned to the home or with another party and  
23 will order us, the department, to do A, B, C  
24 and D and we will have to do that. That's  
25 what we have to do. We might not agree with

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 it and we might appeal. Which we have  
3 appealed in the past. But we have to follow  
4 the court's directive. We have done that in  
5 the past.

6 What everybody should know is that  
7 we also have certain mandates that we have to  
8 follow by OCFS because they're our governing  
9 body. And what people do not understand is  
10 that we cannot make any type of judgments.  
11 The law is it's a minimum degree of care of  
12 what the parent provides. So we might not  
13 like the way a parent parents a child or cares  
14 for a child, but it's a minimum degree of  
15 care. So as long as they're providing  
16 shelter, food, clothing, education and housing  
17 then it's okay. As long as they're meeting  
18 that minimum degree of care they're meeting  
19 the standard.

20 MS. NUNZIATA: One of the other  
21 things that I want to mention to you is that  
22 in light of recent events I have been asked to  
23 put together a child welfare panel. What we  
24 are doing is, we have a couple of leaders in  
25 the child welfare community here in Nassau

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 County that will be working with me to take a  
3 look at our system. Take a look at the system  
4 to see if there are any service gaps. See  
5 where we can make changes, make improvements  
6 et cetera. I have some of the names. I can't  
7 announce them yet but you will be hearing  
8 about that shortly.

9 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Whereabouts  
10 are the people going to be from?

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Actually they're  
12 from the provider community. People that --  
13 other organizations that have been doing this  
14 work for quite some time.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Jeannette,  
16 could I just ask you to, I know you said like  
17 a name is given to the state and then the  
18 state sees where the county is then you're  
19 notified. Is that the only way? Like if  
20 somebody calls the Department of Social  
21 Services and says -- if I picked up the phone  
22 and said, you know, my neighbor, the situation  
23 with my neighbor's house is really bad or  
24 whatever. Do you say to me like oh, you have  
25 to call this number in the state? Or can you

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 just address it immediately?

3 MS. FEINGOLD: The law is that we  
4 cannot go out and do an investigation without  
5 a report coming in to the state central  
6 registry. So we would discuss it with you.  
7 Tell you that a report has to be made to the  
8 state central registry. So we would go over  
9 that with you. We would give you the number  
10 to the state central registry and tell you  
11 that a report has to be made.

12 There are times, because we have  
13 our registry unit that talks to people, and  
14 because we are also an educational unit, our  
15 registry unit, so we speak to the public and  
16 help them. And also as a social services  
17 area, due to the new law, we do, if someone  
18 leaves a message on a machine we can't ignore  
19 that message, we then take that information  
20 and make a report to the state central  
21 registry. But we cannot just go out.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You have to  
23 go through the state?

24 MS. FEINGOLD: That is the only  
25 way that we can go out. A report has to come

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 through the state central registry. That's  
3 the law. Even the police can't call us and  
4 say I have this person yada, yada, yada. I  
5 tell the police you have to call the state  
6 central registry. First of all, the police  
7 are a mandated reporter so they should know  
8 better. But they have to make the report.

9 MS. NUNZIATA: Just a reminder.  
10 It's New York State OCFS, Office of Children  
11 and Family Services, that really sets all  
12 these mandates. We are kind of a branch or  
13 them. They monitor everything we do and we  
14 are answerable to them. So the process that  
15 Jeannette just laid out is their process that  
16 we must follow. We are mandated to follow.

17 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Legislator  
18 Kennedy.

19 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you  
20 Legislator Walker. Hi. Question just popped  
21 into my head based on what was just said. The  
22 challenges that you're faced with, do you feel  
23 that your mission is hindered by existing law  
24 or by policy or are there other things that  
25 you see as being getting in the way so to

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 speak?

3 MS. NUNZIATA: No. I don't think  
4 there's anything that I've seen on a local  
5 level that would get in the way. I think that  
6 the state -- remember, we have to essentially  
7 follow what they tell us when it comes to  
8 child protective services. So if there are  
9 any changes that are made in policy and  
10 procedure it's generated from New York State  
11 OCFS. That's the way that it works.

12 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: From the  
13 state. Okay. I was also wondering, do we or  
14 I should say how many case workers are in the  
15 county's employ who are trained to work with  
16 children who may not be able to communicate?  
17 Such as children with autism and other  
18 disabilities.

19 MS. NUNZIATA: I don't know the  
20 exact number but I can definitely get back to  
21 you and I will get back to you in writing.

22 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.  
23 I was wondering what kind of experience do  
24 some of the case workers have who -- there was  
25 mentioned that some case workers have as many

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    as 30 cases. I'm just curious as to what  
3    additional experience do case workers have  
4    that would get them to accumulate that many  
5    cases? And what is it that maybe some case  
6    workers might be missing and might need as far  
7    as training is concerned to put them in a  
8    position where they could handle more case  
9    load?

10                   MS. NUNZIATA:     The staff could  
11   vary in terms of, first of all, educational  
12   levels and experience levels. And what we do,  
13   again, regardless of where they are -- and in  
14   any department you're going to have folks that  
15   have been with the department for many years  
16   and have been doing CPS work for a long time  
17   and others that are new to the department. So  
18   our job really is to keep training people so  
19   that we can make sure that at some point  
20   everybody reaches a certain level of  
21   competency and comfortability with the work.

22                   The work in CPS is probably among  
23   one of the most difficult departments to work  
24   in. Just like our APS unit. These are folks  
25   that could be, you know, that are at high

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 risk, our children and our older adults. So  
3 the training becomes very, very important and  
4 we have a pretty robust training program.

5 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: One other  
6 question. As far as when case workers visit  
7 homes, I was just wondering what is the  
8 protocol speaking with the children, speaking  
9 with neighbors, teachers?

10 MS. FEINGOLD: First of all, when  
11 we get a case our case workers go out  
12 unannounced. They have training in  
13 interviewing skills to interview with the  
14 children. And it depends upon the  
15 allegations. Because at times they might  
16 interview, depending upon the allegations, to  
17 interview the children at school. Because you  
18 want to interview the children at a safe  
19 setting sometimes away from the parents. Even  
20 when they interview the children at home you  
21 want to interview them away from the parents  
22 so they feel comfortable in speaking with  
23 regard to the allegations.

24 They review the allegations with  
25 the children and the parents separately. They



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 interview them separately. They don't  
3 interview them together. And they review the  
4 allegations. So they ask them -- they read  
5 the allegations to them line by line. They  
6 read the allegation and they review it and ask  
7 them exactly what happened. Both with parents  
8 and with children. That's a traditional  
9 investigation for CPS.

10 For FAR, for the Family Assessment  
11 Response, because, if you recall, I said there  
12 are traditional investigations and FAR. The  
13 difference with FAR, because CPS is  
14 involuntary and FAR is a voluntary approach,  
15 FAR is a family approach and that's an  
16 engagement approach where you're not  
17 addressing allegations, you're addressing the  
18 fact that there is a concern. There is a  
19 concern. So how can we identify the concern  
20 and help find a resolution to it. So there's  
21 two different approaches. And FAR started in  
22 2012. So our FAR approach started in 2012.  
23 That's the difference.

24 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.  
25 That's all I have right now.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I know you  
3 said there are -- you have scheduled and  
4 unscheduled and especially when it comes time  
5 for investigation. But on a regular basis do  
6 the case workers go out and -- excuse me  
7 please -- do the case workers go out announced  
8 or unannounced? If I know I'm having company  
9 at my house I make sure I clean my house,  
10 everything looks nice. You have everything  
11 you need. Do you make unscheduled visits?  
12 This is when you have a case established. How  
13 often do you go? Do you go all different  
14 times of the day? Do you go in the evening?  
15 Early in the mornings?

16 MS. FEINGOLD: For investigations  
17 when we get a case it's unannounced and we go  
18 at all different times. The reason is you  
19 have allegations. So the whole point of the  
20 allegations is because you have to see what  
21 the allegations are and you want to see if in  
22 fact they're true or not true. So, some of  
23 the allegations could be that the house is  
24 filthy. There's dirty dishes all over the  
25 place. The clothes are all out. There's

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 drugs all over the place.

3 So if you're making an appointment,  
4 then the place could be sparkling clean and  
5 you're not going to be able to see if any of  
6 that is true. So we go unannounced. Further  
7 along down the case it could be that we make  
8 appointments. But for initial investigations  
9 that's how we do it. That's the protocol.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You don't  
11 think that would be beneficial to continue to  
12 do throughout? If you have a case that you go  
13 at all different times unannounced?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: That's what we do,  
15 unannounced. It depends on the  
16 circumstances. If we can't catch up with  
17 somebody eventually we make appointments. But  
18 during the night and weekends that's what we  
19 do. That's what we have to do.

20 MS. NUNZIATA: If I could just  
21 add, in the time that the case is active with  
22 us, that first 24 hours, seven days, 60 days,  
23 we are constantly monitoring that situation.  
24 If there are any changes or anything that we  
25 perceive that begins to be problematic, then

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   of course we may not keep appointments and we  
3   may just show up unannounced. Again, it  
4   depends on the circumstances. But know that  
5   we are monitoring those case at all times.

6                   MS. FEINGOLD:     Let me say this is  
7   very quick paced investigations. Cases are  
8   coming in and in and in. We don't have time  
9   to sit there and make appointments. The  
10  workers are in the field and they're getting  
11  another case. They're running from one case  
12  to the next case to the next case. They can't  
13  sit there and make appointments. That's what  
14  they're doing.

15                  On occasion an appointment is  
16  made. If there's an appointment at a school,  
17  something like that. School meeting or a  
18  meeting at a counseling agency or something  
19  like that. But they're running from one case  
20  to the next during investigations. It's  
21  different in a preventive program or ongoing  
22  where it's established case load where they  
23  have something like that. So it's a little  
24  different.

25                  LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Legislator

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Gaylor.

3 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Thank you  
4 very much. Couple of quick questions.  
5 Welcome to Nassau County by the way  
6 Commissioner. You come at a great time  
7 because it's a time where a new set of eyes  
8 can look at a system that may be  
9 overburdened. I don't know. Maybe not.

10 I'm most concerned by what I heard  
11 as far as your testimony concerning it's not  
12 the best system. What you hope for is to try  
13 to get numbers down. But what exactly is your  
14 plan? You should have a plan I would think, a  
15 very detailed plan, on how to reduce the case  
16 work load for somebody who has 30 versus  
17 somebody who has ten cases. To me it seems  
18 very easy. Just take a case away from  
19 somebody and give it to somebody else. You  
20 keep doing that until you average it out to  
21 what you think is appropriate. 12 to 15.

22 Because somebody with 30 cases,  
23 even if they have more experience or more  
24 training or more seniority, in my opinion  
25 would seem to be overworked, overburdened and

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 then maybe not able to do a thorough job as  
3 they would like to do because they've got to  
4 be running from one call to the next when  
5 they're getting in the car and moving.  
6 There's eight hours in a day. That's where I  
7 have some concern. I would like to hear your  
8 thoughts on what specifically is the plan to  
9 bring that average number down to prevent  
10 somebody from having 30.

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Last week I met  
12 with all of the CPS staff and one of the  
13 things that they brought up was exactly that  
14 issue. Which is they need help. They're  
15 happy to hear about the 11 staff that have  
16 been approved but that they need help.

17 One of the things I'm in the  
18 process of doing is taking a look at within  
19 the Child Welfare Unit and that unit where we  
20 can maybe move some cases. They really need  
21 help in the field because there's a lot of  
22 time spent when you've got to go out there and  
23 make those assessments.

24 So I am actively working on seeing  
25 where we can move some of those cases to

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   perhaps folks that work in child welfare  
3   services but don't have the extensive field  
4   work. I'm looking at that right now. The  
5   overall plan obviously is to continue to  
6   increase the staff and really do a rolling  
7   training.

8                   As I said to you, I already put in  
9   for another 20 positions because we lose  
10  people all the time. We lose people because  
11  of salaries or we have a fair number of people  
12  that retire or somebody gets sick. Those are  
13  things that we can't predict but we need to  
14  plan for.

15                   LEGISLATOR GAYLOR:  
16  Approximately, if you know, you may not, how  
17  many case workers have 30 or more cases  
18  currently?

19                   MS. NUNZIATA:     I don't know the  
20  number offhand but I can get back to you for  
21  sure on that.

22                   LEGISLATOR GAYLOR:     Do you think  
23  it's a dozen?

24                   MS. NUNZIATA:     No. It's a small  
25  number.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: On one hand?

3 MS. NUNZIATA: I think so.

4 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Do we provide  
5 some supervisory oversight to somebody with 30  
6 cases?

7 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes, we do.

8 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: And how? In  
9 what capacity?

10 MS. FEINGOLD: Let me see. Well,  
11 they're monitored quite closely. They're sat  
12 with. Their cases are reviewed. They're  
13 detailed daily basis on what they should be  
14 doing with their cases. On what they should  
15 be handing in on a daily basis. What cases  
16 they should be going out with. So they're  
17 really handled with kid gloves on what they  
18 should be doing.

19 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: As you've  
20 indicated you report to the state. Basically  
21 OCFS. Do you provide a monthly, a weekly a  
22 daily report on the activity?

23 MS. NUNZIATA: No. They actually  
24 gather our numbers as we enter into the case  
25 record system and all. They collect our data



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 and statistics. They issue reports.

3 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: You don't  
4 produce a report yourself?

5 MS. NUNZIATA: For them?

6 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: For anybody.

7 MS. NUNZIATA: Not for OCFS to my  
8 knowledge. But we receive plenty of reports  
9 from them. They collect our numbers because  
10 we use their system. Then when we get those  
11 numbers, if they give them to us however  
12 monthly or quarterly then I would be reviewing  
13 them with Jeannette and now Maria.

14 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Thank you.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Legislator  
16 Bynoe.

17 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you  
18 Chairwoman. Good evening Commissioner and  
19 those accompanied. I have a couple of  
20 questions in the interest of trying to make  
21 sure that the public has an opportunity to ask  
22 questions.

23 The more you call out the more time  
24 it's going to take me to get through my  
25 questions.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I want to talk a little bit about  
3 the training experience. You have 11  
4 positions that were previously approved. You  
5 requested an additional 20; is that correct?

6 MS. NUNZIATA: Correct.

7 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: That's 31  
8 workers. Explain to me what a training  
9 process looks like in terms of the time that  
10 someone is hired to the time in which they  
11 will actually be able to manage cases. What  
12 is the training period?

13 MS. NUNZIATA: I'm going to again  
14 refer to Jeannette because she has these folks  
15 and puts them right through.

16 MS. FEINGOLD: What happens, once  
17 they start, like we said, it's a seven-week  
18 core program up in Rensselaer. But when they  
19 start they first start with us. It's CBT  
20 training. They start on the computer. So  
21 they get a little familiarized with that.  
22 They go up to the Rensselaer. When I say  
23 seven weeks they go three days here. Then  
24 they're with us. They take some training in  
25 our agency. Three days up in Rensselaer.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Then when they are with our agency  
3 they do some in classroom training. They do  
4 some on computer training and they shadow some  
5 of our workers in the field. And they are  
6 sitting with our staff. They're reading case  
7 records. They're coming into removal meetings  
8 with us. They're sitting in case of the  
9 week. So they're following us around.

10 But the mere part is that they are  
11 going with out staff shadowing. They're not  
12 doing anything but they're shadowing. They're  
13 getting the experience trained. Not only with  
14 CPS but with foster care and preventive  
15 services. They're doing that. They're doing  
16 that for the first seven weeks. They're  
17 getting the full flavor of that.

18 Then infused with that they get  
19 domestic violence training. They get opioid  
20 training. They get substance abuse. They go  
21 to the safe center. So they also go with sex  
22 abuse. They go with physical abuse.

23 I don't know if you can hear me  
24 because of that.

25 But they get all of that training.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 So they get the full flavor on it. And not  
3 until I guess about four months into that then  
4 we give them one case. But the one case that  
5 they have they work with a case worker. So  
6 they go out and they do the interview. So  
7 when they do the interview with the case  
8 worker they do the interview as well as the  
9 case worker does the interview. So they each  
10 write up a progress note and they're with the  
11 training supervisor. Not only are they with  
12 the training supervisor, they're with the  
13 supervisor from staff development. So they  
14 have a dual person doing it.

15 So they're with a group of people  
16 amongst their peers as well. So they do  
17 that. And although they're done with --  
18 although I say seven weeks it's really 14  
19 weeks because of the three days on and two  
20 days off. So they do that. And with us it  
21 turns out to be nine months with Nassau for  
22 training.

23 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you for  
24 that thorough answer. One other question. We  
25 know that OCFS would state that you should

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have no more than 12 to 15 cases. Is there a  
3 professional standard that might differ from  
4 that?

5 MS. NUNZIATA: They recommended  
6 12 to 15 cases. As far as we know, there is  
7 no state mandate. All the state regs say is  
8 sufficient number of staff. They don't  
9 specify any particular mandate. So the  
10 recommended case load is 12 so 15.

11 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you very  
12 much.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We have one  
14 more legislator to ask questions and then it's  
15 public comment. Legislator Drucker.

16 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Thank you  
17 Chairwoman Walker. I will try to keep it  
18 brief.

19 Jeannette, Legislator Gaylor -- I'm  
20 sure that each of you when you have an  
21 opportunity to speak would like your comments  
22 to not be overshadowed by people shouting  
23 out. I would hope you would give the same  
24 respect.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I told you we

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have one more legislator to ask questions.

3 Then the public comment will begin.

4 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Let's wait  
5 it out.

6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I don't know  
7 what you're talking about 60 percent of the  
8 time. If I have to stay here until three  
9 o'clock in the morning to hear all of you I  
10 will.

11 Legislator Drucker. Give  
12 Legislator Drucker the courtesy. Legislator  
13 Drucker could have been finished with his  
14 questions by now and had the public speaking.

15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Jeannette,  
16 you talked about balancing the case load. Can  
17 you hear me?

18 Jeannette you talked about  
19 balancing the case load. This is a follow-up  
20 to Legislator Gaylor asked that question and I  
21 appreciate your answer. But you talk about a  
22 rotation and how you're assigning the cases.  
23 I'm curious how someone does get to 30 if  
24 you're doing a rotation. Why can't it be more  
25 balanced? Are you doing it per case deciding

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    which one a case worker is more qualified to  
3    handle or are you trying just to balance it  
4    out? I know Nancy you explained there are  
5    times when you are down some staffing. But  
6    when you're assigning the case load why can't  
7    it be more balanced? Why does there have to  
8    be such a disparity? Almost two to one. Does  
9    it have to do with qualifications or just the  
10   way your system -- how are you determining  
11   that ratio?

12                   MS. FEINGOLD:       When we assign  
13   cases it goes on a rotation so it's fair and  
14   equitable to all the case workers.

15                   LEGISLATOR DRUCKER:     How is it  
16   fair and equitable for someone to have 30 and  
17   someone to have 15?

18                   MS. FEINGOLD:       When there are  
19   times we pull a case out of rotation based  
20   upon the allegations if it might be more  
21   suitable due to the skills of a worker for  
22   them to handle a case. If we kept assigning  
23   cases to workers based upon their case load it  
24   would never be fair and equitable because of  
25   the way cases -- because of the way workers

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 would handle their cases. It would be unfair  
3 for workers. Because workers who handle cases  
4 quicker -- you just couldn't distribute cases  
5 that way because the way a case load works a  
6 worker couldn't handle a case load that way.  
7 It has to be a fair and equal distribution  
8 among cases to go that way.

9 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: So it's  
10 basically a subjective evaluation that you  
11 make on each particular case to determine  
12 which case worker could handle more cases than  
13 someone else?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: No. It's just a  
15 fair and equitable distribution. There are  
16 times when we pull cases from workers but it  
17 has to be an equal rotation just across the  
18 floor. Even when we distribute cases across  
19 the floor it has to be an equal distribution  
20 across the floor.

21 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: So the  
22 disparity then is fair and equitable in your  
23 opinion then when someone has 30 and someone  
24 has 15?

25 MS. FEINGOLD: That's the way the



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 case load is managed.

3 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: No. It's  
4 also the way it's assigned.

5 MS. FEINGOLD: No. Absolutely  
6 not. It's assigned fair and equitable.

7 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: That's what  
8 I'm asking you. How is assigned fair and  
9 equitable if someone has 30 and someone has  
10 15?

11 MS. FEINGOLD: It depends upon  
12 the management of the case.

13 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I guess  
14 we're going in circles there. Let me go to my  
15 next question. Before I get to that question,  
16 what has to occur before a report of abuse or  
17 neglect is determined to be unfounded? What  
18 actually has to happen.

19 MS. NUNZIATA: We have to do a  
20 complete investigation.

21 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: What are the  
22 factors that will lead you to make that  
23 determination after 60 days?

24 MS. NUNZIATA: It depends on  
25 whether we can provide credible evidence or

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 not as outlined by OCFS and the laws that  
3 mandate us.

4 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: You also  
5 stated that the reports can look very  
6 different depending on the circumstances when  
7 you conduct your visits or interview; isn't  
8 that correct.

9 MS. NUNZIATA: Sure. Every case  
10 is different.

11 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Would you  
12 agree that our teachers and our educators  
13 provide the most accurate, definitive  
14 assessment of a particular situation?

15 MS. NUNZIATA: I don't know that  
16 I can say that. I really can't comment on  
17 that.

18 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I  
19 understand. I imagine that, in my opinion,  
20 teachers and educators who see these kids come  
21 to school every single day can have a much  
22 better assessment of what's going on and they  
23 interview that one or two interviews that  
24 occur. I just wanted to know how much weight  
25 or reliance are you giving to reports that are

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 made by teachers and educators or that they  
3 corroborate a report of neglect or abuse?

4 MS. NUNZIATA: Listen, it depends  
5 on the case. One of the reasons why we do an  
6 exhaustive investigation that involves  
7 provides going to children's school and  
8 speaking to school staff is because obviously  
9 we want to hear what they say. So it  
10 definitely weighs into whether we believe we  
11 have the credible evidence. And certainly  
12 whether the court does. Because at the end of  
13 the day that's where it stops for us, at the  
14 court.

15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I appreciate  
16 that. The only reason I'm really asking these  
17 questions because we can't help but compare  
18 about what happened in Suffolk County and  
19 that's why I'm asking those questions. In  
20 those situations there were a lot of reports.

21 I'm going to defer. Not ask some  
22 of the other questions I have.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'm going to  
24 ask our first speaker to come to the  
25 microphone and I would ask Justyna Zubko-Valva

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 to come to the microphone. All I can tell you  
3 is that certainly our hearts go out to you and  
4 our thoughts and prayers are with you and just  
5 know that God bless you. We just want to do  
6 whatever we can.

7 MS. ZUBKO-VALVA: Thank you so  
8 much. I appreciate that. I'm running with a  
9 severe cold but I'm here obviously for my son  
10 Tommy because what happened to him was  
11 preventable. And I'm here on behalf of all  
12 other innocent children that are in the same  
13 position as Tommy and my two other kids were  
14 and obviously three other girls involved in  
15 the situation that cannot speak for  
16 themselves. They need extreme help because  
17 the people, the institutions supposed to  
18 protect them. Make sure they safe and  
19 actually were protecting the abusers.

20 It's hard to listen to explanations  
21 provided by Nassau County CPS in regards to  
22 understaffing. It's a problem for this  
23 organization. I think the biggest concern  
24 that we all should think about is the  
25 corruption inside the organization. As you

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 know, when it comes to corruption there is no  
3 room for justice. No room for truth. There  
4 is no room for unbiased. I mean, corruption  
5 just destroys everything. No matter what  
6 evidence you have in a case, no matter what  
7 arguments are you going to provide this based  
8 on 100 percent evidence, it's always going to  
9 be not enough.

10 And most of the time when it  
11 happened, my case, my cry for help for my  
12 children, was being turned against me. So let  
13 me just speak about my story a little bit.  
14 What happened to me and my children. Maybe  
15 this way you can all understand where I'm  
16 coming from. What happened in this case.

17 I just want to start from obviously  
18 many people have questions how come the  
19 children were removed from loving and caring  
20 mother who took care of them since they were  
21 born and how come this was possible. Well,  
22 when the divorce proceeding started obviously  
23 the first judge on the case, Judge Ricipiano,  
24 he did not even grant to the father overnight  
25 visitations based upon the evidence of

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 hardcore pornography addiction that I  
3 presented to the court. The case went to  
4 Judge Zimmerman.

5 Judge Zimmerman issued fictional  
6 temporary order of protection against me on  
7 September 6, 2017. That fictional document  
8 was not in the court minutes, not in the  
9 Department of Justice registry. Everything  
10 was done so immediately and brutally to remove  
11 my children from under my care and place them  
12 with the abuser father.

13 Two weeks later, on September 20,  
14 2017, another fictional order of protection  
15 was issued against me that allow me to have  
16 unsupervised visitation with my children based  
17 on the stipulation that was signed by all the  
18 parties involving Judge Zimmerman.

19 Now you see the contradiction in  
20 those two issued orders. First order  
21 completely depriving me from any contact with  
22 my children. Ability to even speak with them  
23 or contacting their school or place where they  
24 were living to the point that I was able to  
25 pick them up and actually spend few hours once

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 a week.

3 After Judge Zimmerman removed  
4 herself from this case and the case went to  
5 Judge Lawrence. Unfortunately that did not  
6 stop the corruption. In order to justify the  
7 removal of my children, the father filed false  
8 allegations against me with Suffolk County  
9 CPS. The case was opened. On January 14,  
10 2018 during one of my visitations I discover  
11 on Tommy, my angel who is in heaven now,  
12 enormous injuries on his body. The area of  
13 buttocks. I discover black and -- bruises,  
14 coagulated blood spots, injuries, dark red  
15 marks. I took a picture of it. I call my  
16 friend Kathy, who is my neighbor, to obviously  
17 see the signs of injuries.

18 After I drop off the kids to their  
19 father's home I reported the case to CPS.  
20 Unfortunately the CPS case worker, Michelle  
21 Clark from Suffolk County CPS, she retaliate  
22 against me and three days later she went to  
23 the court and file two neglect petitions. One  
24 against me and one against the father. The  
25 false allegations against me took me almost a

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 year and a half to defend myself in court.  
3 When I did not have attorney I presented  
4 myself. But I always extended for the truth  
5 and always had all the evidence in the case.

6 As a result of it, in April 12,  
7 2019, all the allegations, false allegations  
8 were dismissed.

9 Now in terms of the father he was  
10 never arrested. The children were never  
11 removed from under his abusive and sadistic  
12 care. As well as he only received regular  
13 order of protection and classes from the  
14 library. The punishment was a joke. You  
15 know, once that happened during the neglect  
16 proceeding, actually judge from Suffolk County  
17 Family Court he recognized that I was fit  
18 mother and he issued on March 6, 2018 he  
19 issued order that allow me to have  
20 unsupervised visitation with my children. He  
21 only told me to go to Nassau County Supreme  
22 Court Judge Lawrence and ask for schedule.

23 But Judge Lawrence, being obviously  
24 so enormously influenced by already corruption  
25 that was taking place in my case, refused to



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 obey the higher court order because the  
3 neglect case takes a priority over the divorce  
4 case. Then he purposely and deliberately did  
5 not allow me to see my children for almost two  
6 years.

7 I kept addressing on the record,  
8 and you can check the court minutes, every  
9 single time the severe abuse of my children  
10 from the hands of their father. I kept  
11 informing him, begging on the court records to  
12 immediately remove the children from under  
13 abusive, sadistic care of their father because  
14 the children are going to die. They're not  
15 safe. They come to school looking for food on  
16 the classroom floor. In the garbage. They  
17 wear diapers even though they were potty  
18 trained at two years old. At some point there  
19 are medical records that only show less than  
20 one percent body mass index which indicates  
21 almost starvation to death. Basically, all my  
22 cries for help for my children was just being  
23 dismissed and was left without any answer.

24 The attorney for the children, Dana  
25 McCabe, she always acted like the best friend

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 of my husband's attorney. There's no secret  
3 she's got very high powered brother who is  
4 very high powered person in FBI and all this  
5 connections, corruption, influence, caused  
6 Tommy to die.

7 I strongly stand by fighting for  
8 justice for Tommy. Having all those people  
9 who were involved in case involving my family  
10 who did absolutely nothing to help my  
11 children, who knew about the severe abuse, who  
12 completely failed to address my concerns, my  
13 enormous pleadings for help for my children, I  
14 want them to be held accountable. They should  
15 be charged criminally to the highest extent of  
16 the law. Just because somebody is a judge or  
17 prosecutor or holds this powerful position in  
18 the government it doesn't mean that somebody  
19 is above the law. Because we have to protect  
20 our children who cannot speak for themselves.

21 If it comes to Nassau County CPS,  
22 obviously I was dealing most of the time with  
23 Suffolk County CPS, which a lot of information  
24 that's in the media, the reports, the most  
25 severe reports, which I want to read you one,

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 were closed the next day without any  
3 investigation. Just as explanation was a  
4 duplicate report. That's why all CPS workers  
5 were able to go around the system to make sure  
6 the investigation is never going to be  
7 initiated. Even though they are responsible  
8 to conduct 60-day investigation. Interview  
9 all the people involved. Interview the person  
10 who reported the allegations.

11 The report that was filed on  
12 February 27, 2019, which was closed the next  
13 day without any investigation, was the report  
14 that was still filed when the father of my  
15 children had order of protection that was  
16 issued by Judge Shank. Unfortunately he was  
17 not arrested and the children were never  
18 removed from his abusive care.

19 The report reads, For the past week  
20 Anthony, nine years old, has been coming to  
21 school with his clothes and backpack soaked in  
22 urine. Anthony has been staying in the garage  
23 and is not allowed in his room due to him  
24 urinating in his bed. As a result of the  
25 child being soaked in urine, he has a fowl

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 odor and is extremely cold. Stepmother Angela  
3 and father Michael are aware that the child is  
4 arriving at school soiled and failed to  
5 adequately address the concern. The child's  
6 feet and hands are bright red, but it's  
7 unknown if this is a result of the child being  
8 soaked in urine. There are five other  
9 children in home, names and ages unknown, that  
10 have unknown roles at this time.

11 Obviously the seven day follow-up  
12 was never completed. It actually, on this  
13 report, which I have a document, it says the  
14 termination was suspended and closed as  
15 duplicate. That's how those CPS case workers  
16 got away with not investigating this extremely  
17 severe report of abuse, which, as you know,  
18 what caused Tommy's death, hypothermia in the  
19 garage. So there were already indicators that  
20 the children were kept in the garage, that the  
21 CPS knew about it since February. But I  
22 believe it was for much longer period of  
23 time.

24 The next report filed not even a  
25 month later also closed without any

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 investigation. Also closed as a duplicate and  
3 also the termination was listed here as  
4 suspended.

5 Anthony, nine, is on the autism  
6 spectrum. For the last couple of weeks the  
7 stepparent Angela and father Michael have  
8 encouraged Anthony to scream and keep quiet  
9 while getting off the bus. The stepparent and  
10 father do not adequately feed Anthony or  
11 Thomas, seven years old. As a result, the  
12 children have lost weight. The children are  
13 frequently hungry, beg for food and eat food  
14 out of the garbage.

15 As a formal punishment, the  
16 stepparent and father forced Anthony to stay  
17 in the garage for excessive periods of time.  
18 There is no heat in the garage and is cold.  
19 On unknown date, Thomas sustained bruise on  
20 his left eye. No explanations were provided  
21 making the injury suspicious. The stepparent  
22 and father will be made alleged subject and  
23 mother, obviously me, and listed all other  
24 children unknown.

25 The last report -- obviously those

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 reports to my knowledge are on 20. There are  
3 probably more but those are the ones that I  
4 requested the records from state central  
5 registry. They were provided to me.

6 The last report was filed November  
7 18, 2019. CPS had 60 days to investigate. In  
8 this report, I was on the phone with actually  
9 the supervisor of the CPS case worker Jen  
10 Montal, January 7th. Which was ten days  
11 before Tommy's death. And I beg her to not  
12 close those reports because there is a history  
13 of severe abuse and she has to look back and  
14 she has to follow each report that was filed.  
15 And if the children are not going to be  
16 removed they going to die. They're not safe  
17 where they are.

18 She only told me that children have  
19 scratches on their faces because they play  
20 football. That's what the father claimed. I  
21 said to her that it's impossible because when  
22 you play football you wear helmet on.  
23 Whatever she was trying to through the  
24 information transparent to me was completely  
25 different than what the report stated. I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 going to read you the report.

3 Thomas, age eight, has bruises and  
4 abrasions all over his face.

5 So he wasn't scratched, right?

6 Anthony, age ten, has bruises near  
7 his left eye and ear. Explanation for the  
8 injuries are suspicious in nature. Therefore  
9 Michael father and Angela, mother of those  
10 three girls, will be the alleged subjects.  
11 Thomas and Anthony are treated differently in  
12 the family. The mother and father ration how  
13 much food Tommy and Anthony are allowed to  
14 eat. As a result, the children are very pale  
15 and underweight. The children are always  
16 hungry and begging for food. The loss of  
17 Angela age six, Gia age seven -- I'm not going  
18 to obviously list. And me an unknown.

19 What I can tell you from my  
20 personal experience, the only way you can help  
21 children is to stop the corruption that does  
22 exist inside the CPS. Inside the court  
23 system. We're talking about the web of  
24 corruption. We're talking about courts,  
25 police, DA's office, CPS.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I went everywhere begging for help  
3 for my children. I file numerous complaints  
4 hoping that there is only one person, one  
5 institution who's going to fight for my  
6 children, who is going to hear my story and  
7 they going to interview what is the time to  
8 save my kid's life. This was preventable.

9 In 2016 there was severe strong  
10 allegations with regard to sexual abuse of my  
11 children. I went to Cohen's Children's  
12 Hospital where the specimen was taken  
13 obviously from three of my children. The  
14 doctor who did obviously the kids he told me  
15 he has to hold the test results and give it to  
16 the detectives to be tested. Those specimens  
17 were never tested. The Nassau County  
18 detectives never came to pick up to be given  
19 to the lab.

20 Then you have the reports where my  
21 son was coming to school bent in half, with  
22 his tushy hurts, with finger marks on his  
23 arms. The children were sexually abused and  
24 father and Angela receiving enormous amounts  
25 of money under accounts ranging from 30,000 to



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 130,000 a month.

3 I do hope there's going to be  
4 federal investigation in regards to extreme  
5 abuse of my kids. Extreme. What those kids  
6 went through God only knows. It's going to  
7 take such a long time for their healing  
8 process to be completed. But there are more  
9 children out there that needs to be saved.  
10 More loving parents that are the victims of  
11 this corrupted system. All the judges in my  
12 case have to be held accountable. We still  
13 have Donna McCabe on the case, who completely  
14 failed to help my children. Who laugh at me  
15 when I address the abuse of my kids with the  
16 courts.

17 We still have Ed Heep in Suffolk  
18 County Child Protective Services supervisor is  
19 actually overseeing now the case involving the  
20 death of Tommy. Why? Why do people who  
21 should be in jail are still working? Still  
22 have jobs.

23 So, just want to at the end thank  
24 you everybody for love and support you have  
25 been extending to us, me and my family. It

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 means so much to us. I know Tommy touched so  
3 many hearts of so many people who truly care  
4 about the children. Truly care about kids  
5 being placed in loving and safe environment.  
6 And I do hope that this is going to bring  
7 changes. So let the change begin. Thank  
8 you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We are going  
10 to move along with public comment. Our next  
11 speaker is Thomas Liotti.

12 MR. LIOTTI: Thank you very  
13 much. I appreciate the fact that the  
14 legislature is having this meeting tonight,  
15 and I know some of you very well. And I think  
16 if this were a courtroom I would probably have  
17 a slightly different question that I would  
18 pose to CPS and DSS. That question would be,  
19 why didn't someone listen to Justyna? And  
20 what caused the system to break down? That  
21 wasn't answered tonight. We heard a lot of  
22 bureaucratic folderol about the process and so  
23 forth. But that specific question about what  
24 happened here to protect Thomas or not protect  
25 Thomas was never answered by CPS or DSS. Not

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 even asked. I'm going to try to answer that  
3 question now.

4 I'm an attorney. I am Thomas  
5 Liotti. A proactive attorney in private  
6 practice for more than 42 years throughout the  
7 state and nation. Usually representing  
8 individuals and causes.

9 While the horrors of the Valva case  
10 have driven home a point for some of us about  
11 alleged neglect and incompetence of CPS and  
12 DSS in cases of domestic violence and child  
13 abuse, your focus, if honest, should also be  
14 on a corrupt system that allows for the  
15 nomination of judges who have paid for their  
16 judgeships, who are chosen by political bosses  
17 and lobbyists like Al D'Amato. Who are in  
18 some cases cross-endorsed with no prior  
19 judicial experience, like Justice Joseph H.  
20 Lorentz who should be immediately removed and  
21 suspended without pay from his position as a  
22 supreme court justice. The same should happen  
23 with respect to Justice Hope Zimmerman, who I  
24 understand has retired and basically run for  
25 the hills.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 But these are problems within the  
3 system. It is a system not based upon merit  
4 and independence. It is a system based upon  
5 dependence where political parties depend for  
6 their existence on campaign contributions and  
7 in return dole out judgeships as a reward. It  
8 is a corrupt system that allows for campaign  
9 contributions to judicial campaigns by  
10 lawyers, forensic psychologists and  
11 accountants and attorneys for children,  
12 lobbyists and litigants who expect and do  
13 receive corrupt, favorable rulings and  
14 assignments from a corrupt judiciary that  
15 knows who has contributed to their campaigns.  
16 A judiciary which does not disclose those  
17 contributions or recuse themselves when  
18 parties or lawyers come before them to collect  
19 the favors for the contributions they have  
20 made.

21 A part of the corrupt system are  
22 bar associations and their judiciary  
23 committees that go along with these illicit  
24 practices. All lawyers, if not railing  
25 against these practices, are a part of a

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 corrupt system and defy their oaths to uphold  
3 the Constitution.

4 There is no psychological screening  
5 of judicial candidates. Judicial candidates  
6 are not required to demonstrate their  
7 sensitivity to women's and children's issues  
8 or even to show a modicum of respect or  
9 politeness or the capacity to learn about  
10 these issues and humbly admit to what they do  
11 not know. Instead, we have too much arrogance  
12 in a political and judicial system run by  
13 political bosses.

14 I have been a village justice for  
15 29 years. I am registered as a blank. When I  
16 run for office every four years I do so under  
17 my own party. The judicial independence  
18 party. I do not solicit or accept campaign  
19 contributions. I do not spend my own money.  
20 I encourage others to run against me. No one  
21 has except for my first campaign. I run on my  
22 record, which is what all judicial and other  
23 candidates should do. Thank you very much.

24 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.  
25 Jennifer Melnick.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. MELNICK: First, I want to  
3 offer my condolences to Thomas Valva's mother  
4 and brothers.

5 My name is Jennifer Melnick. I'm a  
6 psychotherapist in private practice and a  
7 forensic social worker. I'm on the assigned  
8 counsel for attorneys for children's mental  
9 health panel where I'm appointed on cases in  
10 family court on Long Island and the city. The  
11 majority of cases I work are on abuse,  
12 neglect, delinquency and PINS cases and nearly  
13 all of them I have been in contact with  
14 associated CPS workers.

15 What I have encountered through my  
16 contact with Nassau County CPS in my opinion  
17 extends beyond an issue of case load and leads  
18 in to questions about training, supervision  
19 and checks and balances.

20 The cases I'm brought in on are  
21 already in family court. I have been involved  
22 in cases where there were allegations of  
23 significant educational neglect where CPS has  
24 been actively involved for an extended period  
25 and where the CPS worker had no knowledge that

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the children have educational service needs  
3 and that they have extensive IAPs that were  
4 not being adhered to.

5 On other cases where housing was  
6 the only barrier to reunification, the CPS  
7 worker refused to assist the parent in  
8 navigating the housing services department  
9 within the same centralized building and the  
10 child continued to languish in out-of-home  
11 care. Basic oversight ensuring adherence to  
12 the Family Court Act and OCFS guidelines would  
13 have assisted in easily progressing these  
14 cases and providing less detrimental  
15 outcomes.

16 Generally speaking, the family  
17 court process is not natural for families.  
18 Counties outside of Nassau are by no means  
19 problem free. But in other counties there are  
20 layers of OCFS services and best practices in  
21 place in an effort to insulate families with  
22 preventive services. To my knowledge, there  
23 are minimum intensive home-based OCFS services  
24 and I have no where in many cases to refer  
25 clients to unless they can travel.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 It is unrealistic to expect that  
3 weekly or biweekly home visits or office  
4 visits in a centralized location as opposed to  
5 scattered site field offices will allow for an  
6 accurate or complete picture of what's going  
7 on and ensure that kids are safe at home.

8 On another note, Suffolk County and  
9 New York City have interdisciplinary,  
10 institutionalized legal services representing  
11 children in court so that there are more eyes  
12 and ears actively involved behind the scenes  
13 on cases beyond the scope reported by CPS from  
14 court date to court date.

15 In Nassau County, where independent  
16 lawyers for children either don't know or  
17 don't access assigned counsel specialized  
18 services, there is not a loud enough voice for  
19 children questioning the action or lack of  
20 action by CPS and this puts kids at risk.

21 When there is a devastating injury  
22 or fatality, full communities go on notice.  
23 Everything is questioned and there's an  
24 impetus for change. It should never have to  
25 come to this.



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 As a resident of Nassau County, I  
3 hope to see a redistribution of resources that  
4 put safety of children and service needs of  
5 their families, particularly in underserved  
6 and oppressed communities, ahead of  
7 centralized models. And in my capacity on the  
8 mental health panel, I'm committed to  
9 continually helping to institute the necessary  
10 changes on both micro and macro levels one  
11 case at a time. Thank you.

12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Dolores  
13 Feliciano.

14 MS. FELICIANO: Evening. I stand  
15 before you all tonight as a true witness to  
16 the corruption of CPS and our family court  
17 system. January 2020 has marked seven years  
18 since this team wrongfully and unjustifiably  
19 took and then placed my daughter into harm's  
20 way. In brief this is our story.

21 I sent this to New York Post, NYAG  
22 press office, Governor Cuomo, Gloria Alfred,  
23 News 12, Geraldo, Fios News, Fox News. I was  
24 invited to be on Dr. Phil's show. Newsday  
25 reporter who took my story and turned it into

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 CPS excuses for their wrongdoings. This was  
3 written August 10, 2016.

4 After four years of being  
5 victimized by their harassment, neglect, lies  
6 and horror, I decided to take the Suffolk  
7 County CPS to Supreme Court of Appeals. In  
8 2012 the agency had neglected to investigate  
9 an open case called in by my daughter's  
10 pediatrician regarding having been abused in  
11 her father's household. Additionally, the  
12 Fifth Precinct child advocate agency felt  
13 compelled to call CPS due to my daughter's  
14 distressful phone calls. Yet stated that they  
15 couldn't open a case because there was no  
16 physical evidence.

17 Since I challenged the county on  
18 their negligence of that case, they had talked  
19 their way into getting an OP, order of  
20 protection, granted against me without an  
21 investigation. Furthermore, having both my  
22 children taken away from me and their home in  
23 order to cover up their mistakes. How they  
24 did this was another horrific story itself.

25 Yet my oldest was returned home

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     soon after trying to get them to prove their  
3     accusations when in reality they withdrew from  
4     an indication hearing while vacating the OP  
5     and supervised sibling visits. How can this  
6     be if I was accused of being harmful? The  
7     county had gone out of their way to try and  
8     have me either go broke, break down or be  
9     arrested to have this closed. Not to mention  
10    the people they used to help them to cover  
11    up. Court attorneys, medical evaluation,  
12    forensic evaluation, civilians, politics,  
13    media and last but not least, retired law  
14    enforcement.

15                   My trial against them -- please let  
16    me finish -- my trial against them was  
17    granted. The testimony was poor due to no  
18    fact finding and contradicting inaccurate  
19    medical evaluation. Yet a trial ceased to  
20    commence. Two months later my attorney  
21    forfeited to cross-exam the doctor, the county  
22    and to further with the trial. Instead  
23    conspired with the county to have me coerced  
24    to primarily take stipulations in order for  
25    them to want to withdraw the case when they

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 had already withdrew from an indication  
3 hearing.

4 After five attorneys and my entire  
5 life savings, I realized that I needed to turn  
6 to the aid of the Supreme Court of Appeals.  
7 How can I, a noncriminal, school official, as  
8 well as a security official having had a ten  
9 year background in security checks, kept from  
10 seeing my child unjustifiably by the courts  
11 for three years now. That was back in 2016.

12 The appellate division took my case  
13 and granted me a court-appointed attorney. I  
14 wrote this myself. I wrote this petition  
15 myself. Evidence from A through Z.

16 After the review of all court  
17 documents, my attorney submitted a brief  
18 stating that the trial court, the county and  
19 my trial attorney had erred and that my due  
20 process rights were violated due to  
21 ineffective assistance of counsel.

22 The case is presently being  
23 reviewed by the highest court of appeals in  
24 Albany and still at this time my youngest  
25 daughter is being wrongfully kept from seeing

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 me, her mother, and additional family. I  
3 don't want my child to be another statistic  
4 before anything becomes aware to the public.

5 So if anyone has ever been or is in  
6 the similar horrific situation, please speak  
7 out and let's try to get something finally  
8 done about the corruptive, terrorist, very  
9 politically run controlled family courts and  
10 county CPS system.

11 By the way, I've already tried  
12 contacting our congressman and was told by an  
13 intern that he doesn't get involved with the  
14 courts. Furthermore, I received a brush off  
15 from a legislator back in 2011 when reporting  
16 the situation. I'm presently still reaching  
17 out to broadcast news and editors to state the  
18 problem. Yet still no bite. Instead I'm  
19 being told that this is a very common story  
20 and that I needed something sexy to catch  
21 their ears and eyes of the public.

22 They have managed to manipulate,  
23 influence and deceive the corrupted family  
24 court system to work along with the  
25 perpetrators, a retired NYPD ranking officer

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 married to the father of my child to hide  
3 their abuse upon her. The favoritism of their  
4 money and work status has kept my daughter in  
5 harm's way for the past five years and  
6 continues today.

7 Parental alienation is what's going  
8 on right now. And I don't believe that the  
9 schools are not involved as well. Teachers  
10 are limited to what they are allowed to  
11 report.

12 My daughter has also been kept from  
13 food deprivation. I will not go into the  
14 horrific false allegations that were put upon  
15 me about what my daughter had gone through.  
16 Her birthday is September 19th. She shares  
17 what Tommy went through and more.

18 This is my first time ever being  
19 able to speak my story and I've tried since  
20 2010. I became my own paralegal. I've  
21 learned about what our system is. And it  
22 saddens me to know that these people who are  
23 trying to do a good job have so limited  
24 vices. Our Congress needs to change this  
25 system. They put it there. I was told by a

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 CPS supervisor calling one weekend with my  
3 daughter's behavioral -- excuse me -- that if  
4 I wanted change I would have to talk to  
5 Congress.

6 2010 I created two Youtube videos.  
7 Please check out family justifiably torn  
8 apart. There are many that I found the same  
9 title as mine. I made this card. Put it on  
10 all cars, train stations, workplaces. I may  
11 be risking my job right now but you know  
12 what? I don't care. I don't care. My oldest  
13 was taken and I will end with just this. I  
14 love you sweetheart. She had wanted to speak  
15 to the judge which, by the way, was first John  
16 Kelly then Bernard Chen. She wrote this when  
17 she was 13.

18 When I was growing up in middle  
19 school I heard a lot about Child protective  
20 Services, or CPS, from my peers, though they  
21 did not know what CPS truly was, it protects  
22 us. They had laughed and made jokes about it  
23 though I never knew why. I thought CPS was  
24 also a good thing. Helping kids and making  
25 things right for families. I was wrong.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 One day out of the blue I was  
3 called down to the guidance office. Sitting  
4 in a room with my principal and vice  
5 principal -- I will not mention names -- and  
6 the CPS worker. You are going to a group home  
7 was the first thing he had said to me.  
8 Although we met one other time before in  
9 guidance just to discuss some things which was  
10 rudely done while my school was in session.

11 I was not expecting this. I was in  
12 shock. I was scared. Desperately waiting an  
13 explanation, he had said an order of  
14 protection was placed against my mom for  
15 failing to miss a court date. I didn't  
16 believe him. When he took me to the group  
17 home I was shy and still in shock. It was  
18 nice place. Well kept to itself. However, I  
19 was still terrified and helpless. Every night  
20 I remember crying in my bed asking why and  
21 how. My mom never misses a court date I  
22 thought. What does this have to do with me?  
23 Did I do something wrong? What's going to  
24 happen now?

25 I was so happy when I got the



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    opportunity to visit my sister at the social  
3    services building a while later. We had  
4    always laughed together there, ignoring most  
5    of the intimidated glares from some  
6    supervisors and security people. I brought  
7    toys to her and gifts on holidays and fun  
8    games we could play. I was so overjoyed to  
9    see her and so was she when she saw me.  
10   However, I heard her frequently ask me when am  
11   I going home to mommy? I would reply we are  
12   working on things. We'll try to make things  
13   better for all of this.

14                   Also, when I had given her a snack  
15    she would tell the supervisors please don't  
16    tell Michelle I'm eating and drinking this.  
17    They would ask why not? She would stutter and  
18    be nervous to tell them an answer. I can now  
19    say as a big sister I've seen Melanie's  
20    reflection from the other house and I strive  
21    to help my mom in bringing us together again.

22                   I now say that CPS stands for  
23    changing people's statements instead of Child  
24    Protective Services. Being in the past  
25    experiences that led me and my mom that we had

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    to deal with them. I have so badly wanted to  
3    talk to the judge about my feelings towards  
4    all this. Honestly, I can say I'm fed up. I  
5    cannot believe this procrastination in this  
6    and I'm growing very impatient. All I want to  
7    see is my sister home and happy with us. This  
8    has gone on way too long with this. I must  
9    state that I am very disappointed in all of  
10   this and the people working with this. I am  
11   still waiting with my mom to see at least some  
12   improvement with this case and we want to see  
13   things turned out for the better for us and  
14   for Melanie.

15                   It's notarized and signed by her.  
16                   I will end with this and thank you  
17    very much for waiting. I have two favorite  
18    quotes. In every truth passes three stages  
19    before it is recognized. In the first it is  
20    ridiculed. In the second it is opposed. In  
21    the third it is regarded as self evident.  
22    Arthur Shopenhaur.

23                   My second. Man who walks with  
24    integrity walks securely. Man who walks in  
25    crooked path will be found out. And that is

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 unknown.

3 In God we trust and we are taught  
4 to trust the people that we see before us. We  
5 need to do something immediately. We need to  
6 call Congress. We cannot do this alone.  
7 Please. Thank you.

8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Marie Tooker  
9 is it? I apologize if I'm saying any name  
10 incorrectly.

11 MS. TOOKER: Good evening  
12 everybody. I had a speech but after hearing  
13 CPS, which I feel was a violation of our  
14 Eighth Amendment, cruel and unusual punishment  
15 inflicted upon many of that have PTSD that  
16 have experienced our children being stolen or  
17 the unthinkable.

18 All that are saying here one thing  
19 that I just heard from a CPS worker sitting  
20 behind me, she made fun and said three  
21 minutes, three minutes. Now I know other  
22 people were disrespectful but they're supposed  
23 to be above and beyond courteous and  
24 respectful. And if she could be that way in  
25 the public like that what is she like when

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     she's on her job with having no compassion for  
3     anybody's feelings. Especially that woman who  
4     was just speaking about still not having her  
5     child.

6                   I come from Suffolk County and I  
7     went before the legislature yesterday. And I  
8     think the most important thing is that no one  
9     is recognizing that Judge Tantone he gave full  
10    custody to the father of this horrific  
11    situation that has happened. But what he  
12    erred at, what he made a grave error at, is  
13    that he gave temporary custody, emergency  
14    temporary custody to Justyna. And I'm going  
15    to stand here now and beg all of you, I've  
16    already wrote letters, I begged, I pleaded, I  
17    beg all of today you want change? You want to  
18    see that you have care and you have compassion  
19    and you have a moral compass? God, please  
20    call, write, go there, get Judge Tantone to  
21    change his decision and give full custody to  
22    Justyna with prejudice so she never has to go  
23    into the corrupt, horrific, sick court ever  
24    again. We already know that it's corrupt. It  
25    is already known. You already know. Here it

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 is. Everything that they said is already in  
3 every report you possibly can see on the web.

4 This time is for the public. You  
5 need to hear what's happening behind the  
6 scenes with mommies who are suffering. Who  
7 are losing their children. Something that is  
8 irreparable. Something that you cannot  
9 erase. It's a silent disability that you  
10 never get over.

11 God gave you your children. You  
12 need to protect them. And when the  
13 authorities, the powers that be, are so  
14 corrupt they stop you from protecting your  
15 children, where is our asylum? Where is the  
16 American parents' asylum from our own  
17 government?

18 God please, I beg all of you, it's  
19 not about us today. It's not about me and my  
20 story and what I experienced. I saved my  
21 children. I was strong enough. I saved my  
22 children. My animals were sacrificed  
23 instead. Today it's about Justyna.

24 All I want to know, everybody, how  
25 many people want her to have full custody

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 now? Full custody. Nothing more. And every  
3 judge arrested. There are a full things that  
4 need to be done. That's the most important.  
5 I'm sorry everybody. Excuse me. I don't want  
6 to take your time I just want to say a few  
7 more things.

8 Perjury needs to be prosecuted. As  
9 soon as there is a false claim and you prove  
10 it -- they said they need credible evidence.  
11 As soon as it's false go arrest that person  
12 for perjury. We demand video recordings and  
13 videos in the courtroom. What are you hiding  
14 if you don't want it to be video recorded? We  
15 need the Bar Association and the corrupt  
16 judiciary to be investigated by the Department  
17 of Justice. We need to abolish immunity.

18 We need drug and alcohol testing to  
19 every powers that be that are in office. They  
20 need to be evaluated and they need to be  
21 tested for the Constitution.

22 And one more thing. Bribery is  
23 rampant. It's paid to play all the way.  
24 Thank you sir with all my heart. I had met  
25 the first gentleman attorney that finally

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 stood up to you bullies. Because a black robe  
3 is a bully and he has all this power to take  
4 your life away. Please, with all my heart,  
5 get her full custody. Do it now. Do it now.  
6 Thank you.

7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
8 Marie. Dawn Corrigan.

9 MS. CORRIGAN: Hello. My name is  
10 Dawn Corrigan and just about eight years ago I  
11 found myself at the mercy of the family court  
12 system in Suffolk County. Many mothers like  
13 myself find themselves at the mercy of this  
14 cruel, corrupt and unjust system.  
15 Fortunately, I was able to navigate the  
16 corruption. I withdrew my petition for full  
17 custody of my children. I put an order to  
18 show cause because the supervising judge,  
19 David Feinlick, called CPS from my petition,  
20 which had absolutely no allegation of abuse,  
21 neglect or child maltreatment and CPS showed  
22 up at my house. I wound up going to the  
23 Second Department because Judge David Feinlick  
24 refused to hear my order to show cause. He  
25 had no legal basis to have CPS come to my

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 house to begin with. And I won in the Second  
3 Department.

4 I won because I fought and because  
5 I knew. Had I not done that I could have been  
6 any one of these people here. I stayed in a  
7 sick situation because my children were at  
8 risk because this judge abused his power. You  
9 can look it up yourself if you'd like.

10 The family court system, the  
11 judges, the law guardians and CPS are  
12 unethical in all of their actions. I did my  
13 own research after this terrible situation.  
14 They're destroying families. No one can get  
15 through any of this insanity with CPS.

16 In my recent discoveries I have  
17 found that it's become known to me actually  
18 that in multiple townships in Suffolk County  
19 the town officials are enlisting the Suffolk  
20 County Police Department and Child Protective  
21 Services to help them steal homes. I know  
22 this to be true. The town shows up at a set  
23 residence. They have registries now for  
24 people that are in foreclosure and for people  
25 that are just late with their mortgages. And



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 they're targeting minorities, they're  
3 targeting women, children. They're targeting  
4 people in lower social economic areas.

5 They show up to a house and they  
6 have CPS there and they have the ASPCA to  
7 steal their animals. They're literally  
8 ordering people out of their homes by  
9 threatening them and intimidating them and  
10 instilling fear and telling parents that if  
11 you don't leave within five or ten minutes we  
12 are going to steal your children. We are  
13 going to take your children. This is  
14 happening.

15 Parents don't want to vacant their  
16 properties. They threaten them with arrest  
17 and they're taking children and stealing  
18 people's homes under the guise of zombie  
19 home. They have no jurisdiction to do this.  
20 They have no search warrants and they're  
21 illegally searching people's properties and  
22 illegally seizing their properties and  
23 illegally seizing their homes and their  
24 children.

25 I'm here today to bring awareness

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   of this horrendous crime that's happening in  
3   our communities, and I want everybody to know  
4   that CPS was sent to my house on a fishing  
5   expedition. And had they spent more time  
6   investigating real allegations of abuse from  
7   some of these parents and stop wasting time  
8   coming to my house for false, trumped up  
9   charges. Ridiculous. You can look it up. If  
10  you want to see the report you can just go.  
11  Corrigan versus Suffolk County Child  
12  Protective Services and Suffolk County. Go  
13  look it up. I one in the Second District. He  
14  had no jurisdiction to call CPS to go to my  
15  house. You know how many people he does that  
16  to? He's retired now. But they're all doing  
17  it. It's a racket because they're making  
18  money. Every child has about ten or 15 jobs  
19  attached to them, between social workers and  
20  law guardians and case workers and case  
21  managers. It's ridiculous. It's just a way  
22  to make money.

23                   So anyway, I just wanted to finish  
24  with this by Robert F. Kennedy. Every time we  
25  turn our heads the other way when we see the

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    law flouted, when we tolerate what we know to  
3    be wrong, when we close our eyes and ears to  
4    the corrupt because we are too busy or too  
5    frightened, when we fail to speak up and speak  
6    out we strike a blow against freedom, decency  
7    and justice. Thank you.

8                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Thank you  
9    Dawn. Sara Keenan.

10                  MS. KEENAN:     I am here as another  
11    grieving mother. Yet tomorrow my daughter  
12    will be dead six years. Lana choked, was  
13    resuscitated at home and brought to South Side  
14    as a precaution. There began a slew of  
15    medical misadventures leading to a slow six  
16    week death for my child. A child abuse  
17    specialist named Dr. Jamie Hoffman Rosenfeld  
18    from Cohen's Hospital reported that I possibly  
19    shook my daughter. Child abuse specialists'  
20    reports are not verified by CPS.

21                  My two sons were immediately  
22    removed and I was left a mother spinning, not  
23    understanding how my life was being pulled  
24    apart in a family court system that left me  
25    with less rights than an arrested criminal.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The medical examiner's report came  
3 back showing absolutely no signs of injury.  
4 Yet the county ignored the evidence and put me  
5 to trial in front of Bernie Chang anyway. Let  
6 me repeat. CPS took it upon themselves to  
7 ignore the Special Victims Unit, the Suffolk  
8 County DA's Office, as well as the New York  
9 City Medical Examiner and put me on trial for  
10 shaking my daughter to death anyway.

11 There are no constraints on family  
12 court. There is no oversight and they're left  
13 with far too much power in the hands of  
14 unqualified people.

15 I'm currently in active litigation  
16 with both Suffolk County and Northwell in  
17 federal court. The only reason I could obtain  
18 standing was because I had the money to fight  
19 the system and refuse to say I was negligent.  
20 So many CPS victims are forced to take the  
21 neglect plea to get their children back from  
22 foster care leaving them with no civil rights  
23 recourse.

24 CPS workers need to be given the  
25 tools to do their jobs. They are a farce.

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 They have absolutely no investigational  
3 training but are looked upon by the court for  
4 all pertinent case investigation and  
5 evidence. This alone is absurdly flawed. The  
6 very people sent to investigate use cookie  
7 cutter forms for submission to family court  
8 suggesting removal with only hearsay as their  
9 motivation. Article 10 of the Family Court  
10 Act leaves them with a breath of power far  
11 beyond their training. And what is left is a  
12 system that clamors to cover its constant  
13 errors and interference in the lives of  
14 innocent families with only the children as  
15 victims. Thank you.

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
17 Sara. Kathy Cole.

18 MS. COLE: Hi. I just wanted to  
19 before, I was going to say before you hit my  
20 timer can I say something quick? I was at the  
21 legislative meeting yesterday and I've worked  
22 personally with a few of the legislators  
23 regarding this issue and I really wish that  
24 the meeting was done flipped. Yesterday at  
25 the meeting the public was allowed to speak

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 first. The CPS workers, the commissioner  
3 heard what everyone had to say and then that  
4 generated the questions. You need to hear  
5 from the victims to know where the problems  
6 are.

7 So, I'm here to give Thomas a  
8 voice. I started this Facebook group. I met  
9 with Justyna. I've been with her to court. I  
10 never met her before. So, we're here to give  
11 Thomas a voice.

12 My name is Kathy Cole, and I have  
13 been a contractor for schools in New York  
14 State and New York City and many other states  
15 across the nation specific to school gym  
16 safety issues. I became a whistleblower after  
17 reporting noncompliance and safety violations  
18 mandated by law in New York State to protect  
19 the kids. Laws that were enacted because two  
20 children were crushed and killed in their  
21 school gym electric divider. One here on Long  
22 Island. She was nine years old. Her name was  
23 Deanna Moon.

24 The safety violations and dangerous  
25 issues, much like this case, are not limited

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 to Nassau or Suffolk County. They are  
3 systemic throughout the nation. It took  
4 several deaths and horrific accidents to get a  
5 national attention for the June safety issue.  
6 Specifically the last step of a child in  
7 Virginia, Wesley Lapicki, only nine years old,  
8 was crushed and killed in a school gym divider  
9 on May 18, 2018. Wesley's death was the spark  
10 that lit national reform on this gym safety  
11 issue.

12 I pray and we promise, Justyna,  
13 that Thomas' death will be, which was  
14 preventable and tragic, will be the spark that  
15 will bring systemic changes to the agencies  
16 that are entrusted with our most beloved  
17 children.

18 I am now working with the national  
19 agency in DC to set a minimum safety standard  
20 for the safety issue in the school gyms. Over  
21 20 years of working to expose and rectify the  
22 issues, it is time for change in that arena  
23 and it is time for change in CPS and family  
24 court.

25 In 2014, I started a radio show,

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   All Facted Up. There is no pun in that name.  
3   I had all the facts and they fell on deaf  
4   ears. Just like this case, there was  
5   government abuse, cover-ups and just massive  
6   dysfunction at the highest levels of New York  
7   State and New York City departments of  
8   education.

9                   Money won't solve this issue. You  
10   need to account for every dollar that is spent  
11   before you throw money at an already  
12   dysfunctional system.

13                  After my first radio show I was  
14   inundated with frantic calls from both moms  
15   and dads begging me to help expose the  
16   corruption, abuse and cover-ups in CPS and  
17   family court systems here on Long Island. I  
18   literally stopped my radio show in good faith  
19   so that I could focus on my gym safety issue.  
20   I knew I could make change there. I didn't  
21   know how to make change here, then, in 2014.

22                  While I watched News 12 and other  
23   channels and I witnessed the horror of Tommy's  
24   death, the image of those parents calling me  
25   and begging me to help them with the



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2       corruption and the abusive power in CPS and  
3       the court system came back to haunt me. I  
4       immediately had a call to action meeting at my  
5       home with the hopes of springing something  
6       into action. Very shortly after I was  
7       contacted and asked to come to court last  
8       Monday for the temporary hearing for Justyna,  
9       Geno and Mike regarding their children, the  
10      parents in that house of horrors.

11                   I'm documenting dozens of victims  
12      that are reaching out again. Stories in both  
13      Nassau and Suffolk County. I have literally  
14      spent over 100 hours the past probably week  
15      listening to tortured parents fearing for  
16      their children's safety.

17                   I went to and spoke at the Suffolk  
18      County Legislature yesterday and I truly hope  
19      that you're going to have a joint task force  
20      and Long Island will be the spark for national  
21      reform. And we all beg you to please demand  
22      an external investigation into the agencies  
23      that failed Thomas.

24                   I'm just going to end with this.  
25      One of the most powerful scenes in a movie

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     that I believe changed me forever was in the  
3     movie A Time to Kill. A young black girl in  
4     the deep south many years ago was abducted by  
5     white men. She was raped and brutalized and  
6     left for dead. Her father wound up killing  
7     the rapists. His lawyer, during his trial,  
8     asked the jury to please close their eyes. To  
9     imagine this child being brutally raped,  
10    almost killed, tortured and left for dead.  
11    Now imagine she was white. And the jury set  
12    the dad free.

13                   I ask you now to close your eyes.  
14    To think about what Tommy went through and now  
15    imagine he was your son. We don't have a  
16    choice but to act. Let Thomas's death be the  
17    spark that lights national reform.

18                   Justyna did give me some ideas when  
19    I met her in the court. The first thing I  
20    said was how could Thomas be alive today? And  
21    without hesitation it was videotaped  
22    investigation for the parents and the  
23    children. Because there are false -- and I'm  
24    not blaming anybody, no one wanted Thomas to  
25    die. But if you're tired, if you're

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    overworked, if you don't have the skills and  
3    you're writing reports that children's lives  
4    depend on, they need to be videotaped so that  
5    if there is a he said she said it's there.

6                   I'm happy to tell you that the  
7    Suffolk County Legislature is already looking  
8    into appropriating funds for the proper video  
9    equipment. That's what we were told  
10   yesterday.

11                   Another thing that I think you  
12    touched on -- I'm sorry, I don't know your  
13    name -- about unfounded. So, unfounded could  
14    be that they go to the door after this 24-hour  
15    period that they have and no one is home.  
16    That's unfounded. It could be that they knock  
17    on the door and the parents say you can't come  
18    in. That's unfounded. Seventeen calls  
19    begging for Thomas's life was unfounded. We  
20    have a huge, huge problem. Thank you very  
21    much.

22                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Thank you  
23    Kathy. Debbie Lyons.

24                   MS. LYONS:        Good evening. My  
25    name is Debbie Lyons. I'm the director of the

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Child Advocacy Center at the Safe Center. We  
3 are grateful to be here this evening to share  
4 our experience working closely with the Nassau  
5 County Department of Social Services and  
6 particularly Child Protective Services. At  
7 the Safe Center, we serve victims of child  
8 abuse, domestic violence, sexual assault and  
9 human trafficking. DSS is an essential  
10 partner in this work and without their support  
11 we could not provide vital services such as  
12 our child advocacy center, safe housing for  
13 domestic violence victims, the county's victim  
14 hotline and services for victims of child sex  
15 trafficking.

16 Unlike many counties around the  
17 state, Nassau County DSS has committed two  
18 specialized investigative units that are  
19 collocated at our Bethpage facility. These  
20 case workers have completed hours of  
21 additional training on developmentally  
22 appropriate and trauma-informed approaches to  
23 working with children and families impacted by  
24 abuse. They're tasked with responding to some  
25 of the most complicated abuse reports and work

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 side by side with a team of criminal justice  
3 professionals to investigate allegations of  
4 child sexual and severe physical abuse. In  
5 2019 alone we jointly responded to nearly  
6 1,000 allegations of abuse at the child  
7 advocacy center.

8 We are here tonight because of a  
9 tragic child fatality. If we truly wish to  
10 understand what happened it is important to  
11 put CPS into context. Child Protective  
12 Services does not operate in a vacuum. They  
13 rely on the community to identify and report  
14 signs of abuse. On departmental policy to  
15 dictate what workers are allowed to do. And  
16 on judges for final approval of CPS  
17 intervention.

18 In addition, state level guidance  
19 regarding child protective interventions have  
20 a significant impact on the degree to which  
21 workers are empowered to intervene.  
22 Collectively, we can do more to educate our  
23 community on responding to concerns and to  
24 advocate for more effective child protective  
25 policy at the local, state and federal level.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 There is no greater tragedy for our child  
3 protective system and no outcome which they  
4 work harder to avoid than the death of a  
5 child. It sends a ripple of emotion through  
6 the community which can make us want to find  
7 an immediate solution and place blame. It is  
8 important that we are not reactionary, but  
9 rather thoughtful and deliberate in order to  
10 create lasting change that keeps children  
11 safe. This would be a true testament to  
12 Thomas Valva's memory. Thank you.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
14 Debbie. Regan Murphy.

15 MS. DILIBERTO: I have been  
16 working in tandem here to represent Jacqueline  
17 Francetti and her daughter. My name is Dee  
18 Jae Diliberto. Thank you for allowing us to  
19 have this opportunity tonight.

20 I graduated from law school  
21 recently and I filed for divorce after my  
22 first semester of law school, which was over  
23 nine years ago. My custody case is ongoing.  
24 I served a New York State Supreme Court  
25 internship. I worked in health law policy

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 clinic. I served a postgraduate fellowship at  
3 Lawyers for Children. I'm working with the  
4 New York State Assembly on promoting judicial  
5 and legislative reform. And I started a  
6 foundation while I was in law school called  
7 Raising the Bar for Families where I advocate  
8 pro bono for people who are going through  
9 divorce, custody and domestic violence.

10 I can't discuss the details of my  
11 ongoing nine-year custody battle but I can  
12 tell you a summary of my divorce proceedings.

13 Through my divorce I learned that  
14 the system is not applying the laws and the  
15 standards and procedures equally. I was  
16 comforted by my law school dean, my  
17 professors, attorneys and other people who  
18 would say that the system was so greatly  
19 broken. The state has spent tens of millions  
20 of dollars on a commission under former Chief  
21 Justice Judith Kaye called the Miller  
22 Commission which defines specifically ways  
23 that we can improve the system. But they  
24 haven't implemented those ways and children  
25 are still being harmed and killed.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 In my case, my husband made over  
3 \$20 million during our marriage. I ran out of  
4 money to pay my legal fees after I had spent  
5 over \$350,000. Despite the fact that I had a  
6 prenup and post-nup that was depositive of 95  
7 percent of the equitable distribution. But  
8 the courts deprived me and my children of  
9 orders of child support, spousal support and  
10 attorney fees for almost eight years. After I  
11 ran out of money, my husband was only paying  
12 us a voluntary amount of child support that  
13 was \$2,642 a month. While he was paying about  
14 \$55,000 a month on his own expenses. I was a  
15 full-time mom going to law school, a pro se  
16 litigant and the subject of multiple CPS  
17 investigations. I've always had full custody  
18 of my children but I don't know how long  
19 that's going to last.

20 Fortunately, I graduated, I passed  
21 the bar and my children are alive. It's not  
22 the same for my friend Jacqueline Francetti.  
23 Regan Murphy and I are here to tell you her  
24 story.

25 MS. MURPHY: Good evening. My



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 name is Regan Murphy. I'm a close family  
3 friend of Jacqueline for over 30 years. She's  
4 unable to attend this hearing this evening but  
5 her voice is critical when talking about child  
6 protection from abusive and murderous parents  
7 in Nassau County and New York State. I'm  
8 going to read her statement to you.

9 I'm Jacqueline Francetti. I am  
10 Kiera's mom. This is Kiera. Three years ago  
11 my beautiful, fiercely independent 28 month  
12 old daughter Kiera, who loved Elmo and Mickey  
13 Mouse, was murdered. She was the subject of a  
14 custody case in Nassau County Family Court.  
15 Kiera was shot twice in the back while she  
16 slept by her father. He then set fire to his  
17 home and he committed on suicide. Kiera's  
18 murder was 100 percent preventable.

19 Many were involved in Kiera's  
20 case. If anyone had proper training, had  
21 knowledge of family violence or frankly even  
22 cared about her, Kiera who would be alive  
23 today.

24 When I walked into Nassau County  
25 Family Court for the first time I thought

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Kiera would be protected. That the health and  
3 safety of our children would be top priority.

4 I was wrong and now Kiera is gone forever.

5 MS. DILIBERTO: Let me tell you  
6 Kiera's story through the words of Jacquelyn  
7 Francetti.

8 When I notified the Nassau County  
9 Family Court that I was being stalked,  
10 repeatedly harassed, threatened, verbally and  
11 emotionally abused, the family court judge,  
12 Daniel Peterson, yelled at me to grow up.  
13 Despite my fears and clear evidence of  
14 domestic violence, coercive control abuse,  
15 rage issues and her father being suicidal, Dr.  
16 Larry Cohen, the forensic evaluator, dismissed  
17 that her father was suicidal and recommended  
18 joint custody because he believed a father  
19 should always play a role in the child's  
20 life. Or death. And her father did play that  
21 role. He shot Kiera twice in the back while  
22 she slept.

23 Nassau County Protective Services,  
24 we laugh when we say protective services,  
25 noted that he had overly aggressive play

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 style, anger and rage issues, cursed and  
3 threatened Jacqueline in front of the baby and  
4 was suicidal. But nonetheless, they concluded  
5 that there was no domestic violence and they  
6 claimed the case was low risk. I want to know  
7 what CPS deems high risk.

8 Jacqueline notified Kiera's  
9 attorney, the attorney for the child, Glynn  
10 Cocaleo, many times. She told him that things  
11 were wrong. The father of the baby was not  
12 following court orders or medical directives,  
13 which is physical abuse. She told them that  
14 there was emotional distress when Kiera would  
15 return to the mother and the father was  
16 becoming more and more unhinged.

17 At their last hearing for Kiera,  
18 Judge Daniel Peterson actually said this is  
19 not a life or death situation. Judge Peterson  
20 you were wrong. Every person involved in  
21 Kiera's case is still practicing. Not one  
22 person has been reprimanded, sanctioned or  
23 moved from practice. So it's safe to say that  
24 the body count of children being murdered will  
25 increase.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Kiera's case was a textbook. Too  
3 many children are being murdered by a mother  
4 or father due to the failings of the New York  
5 State Family Court system. Transparency and  
6 accountability are desperately needed. The  
7 Office of Court Administration hopes that you  
8 will write Jacqueline off. They hope that you  
9 will write off all the other murdered children  
10 as isolated incidents. Had the Office of  
11 Court Administration taken action years ago,  
12 Kiera and many other children would be alive  
13 and playing today.

14 Sadly, 81 percent of abusers are  
15 getting custody or unsupervised visitation.  
16 81 percent. The Nassau County and New York  
17 State Family Court systems are failing.  
18 Jacqueline is begging you to step up, step in  
19 and make change. We need to turn around what  
20 is now being called the New York State fatal  
21 court system instead of the family court  
22 system. Child safety is not complicated.

23 Jacqueline and everyone here today  
24 wants to work with you to usher in the changes  
25 right away. Jacqueline just returned from

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Albany where she spent four days working with  
3 the New York State Assembly. Based on Kiera's  
4 story alone, five bills will be introduced  
5 this session.

6 Here in Nassau County what can you  
7 do to move this forward? What are the next  
8 steps? Let us honor Kiera and all of the  
9 children who have been needlessly murdered.  
10 Their little voices cannot be silenced. Their  
11 stories must be heard. We will not go away  
12 quietly. It's time for a change. Thank you  
13 very much for your time and attention to  
14 this.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
16 Regan and Dee Jae. Andrea Bergin.

17 MS. BERGIN: Hi. Thank you for  
18 having us. I'm hear to speak on behalf of  
19 myself as well as the FCLU. I just want to  
20 thank Justyna and all the other parents and  
21 everybody that have told their story. I think  
22 it's so important and it needs to be heard.

23 I can't say how incredibly  
24 disappointed I am that DSS was allowed to  
25 leave. It's fine. If you aren't going to let

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    the people speak first then it should have  
3    been known that they had to wait because  
4    otherwise this is a farce.  If they do not  
5    hear what the concerns are, we were just  
6    supposed to listen to them and the excuses  
7    they have of why everything is okay.  But they  
8    can't listen to us about what the problems  
9    are.  That bothers me very much.  And it seems  
10   like this is kind of just a meeting just to  
11   pacify angry people, not to actually cause any  
12   change and that's very disappointing because I  
13   had a lot of hope for this.

14                   Another thing that makes me think  
15   this is that there was an email, there was a  
16   newsletter email sent out the other day from,  
17   I'm sorry, Ms. Schaefer.  It announced this  
18   public hearing following the tragic death of  
19   Thomas Valva and the details for this  
20   meeting.  At the end it actually read, after  
21   the announcement Legislator Schaefer said this  
22   hearing will serve as a checkup on an already  
23   phenomenal Health and Social Services  
24   department.  We need to make sure they have  
25   the proper resources and staffing that they

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 need to be successful.

3 Now, very quickly, an email was  
4 sent out to recall that previous email. Which  
5 is understandable because you have the death  
6 of a child in the same paragraph as  
7 phenomenal. That seemed to be a little bit of  
8 a juxtaposition there. Again, that, combined  
9 with DSS leaving and not having to hear  
10 anything, just shows that I have very little  
11 faith that anything is going to change here.  
12 It has to go through to these people. They  
13 have to understand. You have to hear this.  
14 This is dangerous.

15 What happened to Justyna and her  
16 son is a nightmare. It is the worst possible  
17 outcome of what can happen in a custody case.  
18 But it's not an anomaly. And there are a lot  
19 of other kids out there that are being abused  
20 and neglected and ignored and it feels like  
21 they still are.

22 I know this is in the news. I know  
23 you wanted to hold a meeting. But is anything  
24 going to get done or is it just for show?

25 I understand that CPS has their

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 hands tied to a certain extent. I'm sorry  
3 that they're understaffed, overworked,  
4 underpaid. But parents shouldn't have to pay  
5 for these bureaucratic issues with a child's  
6 life. That is not acceptable.

7 I know there are plenty of  
8 wonderful CPS workers out there. But you know  
9 what? You heard yourself tonight. Some of  
10 them have 30 children, 30 families. That is  
11 insurmountable and impossible to monitor  
12 properly. It can't be done. It needs to  
13 change. There were a lot of different  
14 institutions and people who were neglectful  
15 and horrific in this case. Judge Zimmerman  
16 Lorentz, Chang, Donna McCabe. And out of CPS,  
17 June Johnson, Michelle Clark. There are a  
18 number of other people who were responsible.

19 I know CPS was saying this happened  
20 in Suffolk County, it was mostly Suffolk  
21 County, but it started here and it doesn't  
22 matter. The problem, the corruption it runs  
23 all through. It doesn't matter what county  
24 we're in or honestly what town, what state.  
25 It's here. It's destroyed. It's broken.



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 It's corrupt. And it needs to be fixed. I  
3 really am praying to God that something gets  
4 done.

5 And again, I'm so disappointed that  
6 all of the CPS and all of DSS left before  
7 anyone spoke. Honestly, you should be ashamed  
8 that you let that happen. Thank you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
10 Andrea. Eva George.

11 MS. GEORGE: Good evening. First  
12 of all, I want to say my condolences to  
13 Justyna. And I just want to say the whole  
14 town and many of the country is grieving with  
15 you. We are so sorry for your loss.

16 I also have ongoing custody battle,  
17 so I am unable to really talk too much about  
18 that. But I also went through a divorce here  
19 at the supreme court from March 2015 with  
20 Judge Zimmerman. I fled abuse in June 2015  
21 with my three children. Which were also  
22 abused by their father. Including myself.  
23 And I trusted my faith basically in the hands  
24 of the family court to protect my children.  
25 And little did I know that when that journey

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 started, which he already stated before it  
3 started that nobody is going to believe you.  
4 No judge is going to believe you. I'm going  
5 to take everything from you.

6 And so many times these abusers and  
7 these domestic violence cases or sometimes  
8 women are allowed to manipulate the system  
9 constantly over and over again.

10 As a mother, the more I spoke my  
11 children are in danger the more I started  
12 losing my children and the more I was silenced  
13 in the court system. I was forced to give  
14 them first supervised visits. Which they did  
15 not even want. My son, who was beaten by his  
16 father, was forced to have a supervised visit,  
17 even that he did not want and he probably had  
18 said that to his law guardian. He wanted a  
19 supervised meeting. He actually attacked. He  
20 was hitting his father because he was so  
21 angry.

22 I had my daughter, who was then  
23 nine years old, after every supervised visit  
24 or a forced phone calls, there were forced  
25 phone calls every other day that I was not

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    allowed to be in a room because they were  
3    thinking I'm interfering with the phone  
4    calls. My daughter would start beating  
5    herself repeatedly. Throwing things. And  
6    this is a typical girl who was joyful, played  
7    gymnastics and there was not much anything I  
8    was able to do to protect her. The more I  
9    started to protect them the more he cried  
10   parental alienation.

11                   Parental alienation is one of the  
12    number one things that abusers are allowed to  
13    use in the court system to silence the victims  
14    and silence the mothers or sometimes the  
15    fathers who are trying to protect their own  
16    children. I had no voice. In order to  
17    protect -- instead of me for the courts to  
18    protect my children from them, I had to prove  
19    in court that I'm not alienating my children  
20    from their abuser. That's awful. That's very  
21    sick.

22                   Instead of them concentrating on my  
23    husband abusing the children or being a danger  
24    to me, all I was forced to do time and time  
25    again in a hearing and the stipulation is

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 showing that I am taking them, I'm forcing  
3 them, even though my son used to hide in the  
4 trunk of the car sometimes refusing to come  
5 out of the car to go to supervised meetings.  
6 But if I didn't do that, I would have been  
7 held in contempt of the court and I would have  
8 more endangered my children. So if I  
9 protected my children I would have harmed my  
10 children more by protecting them. How  
11 confusing.

12 Now, eventually, after they stopped  
13 supervised visits with my children after my  
14 son attacked his father in a supervised visit  
15 and I'm shopping for Christmas gifts in  
16 Target. The supervisor called that he is  
17 about to call the police. That my son is not  
18 calming down. I couldn't even go pick him  
19 up. I can hear him in the background  
20 screaming pick me up, I don't want to be  
21 here. I couldn't even go pick him up because  
22 the supervisor wasn't even done. But that  
23 prevented in some of those things eventually  
24 stopped the supervised with the two older  
25 ones.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 But then I had a six year old who  
3 was unable to speak for himself and didn't  
4 understand or did not communicate. They  
5 protected the two older ones but they did not  
6 protect my little one, which continued  
7 supervised visits. And eventually, after  
8 three months, started getting unsupervised  
9 visits with his father. Now you have two  
10 older siblings who are terrified seeing their  
11 younger brother me dropping him to  
12 unsupervised visits. How traumatizing is that  
13 for older siblings to see that? That they  
14 know what this man has done to them and there  
15 is nothing that I could have done because then  
16 I would have been alienating my child from his  
17 father. That's bigger crime than abuse in  
18 this day.

19 But basically it took one of those  
20 unsupervised visits. My son came home  
21 alleging a situation that his dad did. I took  
22 him to the law guardian. I took him to the  
23 psychologist. Because we're in a court  
24 proceeding. I'm taking him to all these  
25 places that I need to do just to protect

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 them. And he told his story basically what  
3 was happening. And I believe one of those  
4 things sparked a CPS investigation with my  
5 son.

6 Even after the fact that CPS  
7 investigation started, they still forced me to  
8 make my son go to unsupervised visits with his  
9 dad. And when the day came my son was so  
10 scared but there was nothing I could do. He  
11 screamed, he cried, he pulled my hair. He's  
12 five, six years old begging me mom, don't make  
13 me go. I'm trying to plead with the father he  
14 doesn't want to come. He said bring him.  
15 This is exactly how the other two were going  
16 to come. Kicking and screaming. They don't  
17 care.

18 Eventually I started taping this  
19 situation that was happening and it was  
20 basically enough. And at the end of the  
21 screaming with my son my son said I told the  
22 law guardian and I told the psychologist I  
23 don't want to go. Which were the same people  
24 that said a couple of days before that my son  
25 wants to go. I was screaming with my lawyer

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 two days before there's no way my son wants to  
3 go. He's lying. No. You have to make him  
4 go.

5 I took that recording and I emailed  
6 it to the law guardian, to my lawyer and to  
7 the psychologist and that was the last time my  
8 son had an unsupervised visit with his dad.  
9 Due to a very good lawyer fighting for me and  
10 I think eventually who realized my situation  
11 was very dire for my children. I got full  
12 custody of my children in 2017.

13 But I'm in my third round of  
14 custody battle with the same, and I have to  
15 live through this nightmare time and time  
16 again and it never probably ends. Something  
17 needs to be done. We need to believe the  
18 mothers and sometimes the fathers who say that  
19 there's abuse. Their victims need to be  
20 protected and the children need to be  
21 protected. Children need a voice. Thank you  
22 for your time.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
24 Eva. Annetta Korszum.

25 MS. KORSZUM: I am a survivor of

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    Child Protective Services in Nassau County.  
3    Forty years ago I was five years old. Taken  
4    away from my immigrant parents that didn't  
5    know how to speak English. I stand here  
6    before you to say that I made it. I am a  
7    survivor. That I will not go into detail as  
8    to what I had to go through in order to  
9    survive.

10                   One thing I learned when I trained  
11    as an emergency medical technician, a nurse,  
12    as well as having a master's in business  
13    administration and finance, the most valuable  
14    lesson I learned whenever you want the answers  
15    you always have to follow the money.

16                   Many years ago, Ms. Walker, I sent  
17    you letters on how more services were needed  
18    for this disabled concerning violence. You  
19    did nothing. As far as I'm concerned, the  
20    blood of Thomas Valva is on your hands.

21                   One of those people was my father.  
22    Today is my father's birthday. I visit him at  
23    Holy Root Cemetery at St. Bridget's in  
24    Westbury. He would have been 84 years old.  
25    He was yet another victim of how great a job



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Nassau County is doing.

3 Today I am here as a voice for  
4 Thomas Valva. An eight year old autistic boy  
5 who now speaks for the children, the disabled  
6 and those that have suffered and lost their  
7 lives before it was their time in Nassau  
8 County at the hands of a generation and a  
9 group of people that were empowered to serve  
10 the people of this county. In fact, have done  
11 quite the opposite. Instead financially  
12 benefitted themselves in their positions of  
13 power and titles.

14 To paraphrase the words of a 16  
15 year old activist known as Greta Thunberg, who  
16 spoke and addressed the United Nations. You  
17 have stolen my dreams in childhood with your  
18 empty words. How dare you. You have failed  
19 us. But the young people are starting to  
20 understand your betrayal. The eyes of all  
21 future generations are upon you right here  
22 right now. If you choose to continue to fail  
23 us, I say we will never forgive you for what  
24 you have done. We will not let you get away  
25 with this. Right now is where we draw the

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 line. The world is waking up to these  
3 abuses. Change is coming whether you like it  
4 or not.

5 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
6 Annetta. Marilyn Paulis-Kneski.

7 MS. PAULIS-KNESKI: Good  
8 evening. I come to you as a recently retired  
9 detective from the NYPD. I spent the last 12  
10 plus years of my 20 year career investigating  
11 child abuse cases in the county of Queens. By  
12 all means, there are deficiencies at every  
13 level and every agency. Right now we have  
14 this one to highlight maybe some of the  
15 deficiencies that we have in our system right  
16 now.

17 I'm sad that DSS did not stay to  
18 hear what I have to say or even explain a  
19 couple of things. They threw up a couple of  
20 figures on the board saying 87 percent of  
21 their cases in 2019 were maltreatment and  
22 neglect and only ten percent were physical,  
23 two percent sexual.

24 A lot of cases come in as  
25 maltreatment and neglect. That's just like

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 scraping the surface. There's a whole iceberg  
3 underneath. When you do a forensic interview  
4 with a child they're going to reveal more  
5 information as you go forward. How many of  
6 those 87 percent numbers have been changed to  
7 the side of physical or sexual abuse? I don't  
8 think they answered that question. It was  
9 never posed.

10 There are cases when they go out --  
11 I know CPS has a hard job being overworked. I  
12 myself have done over maybe 1500 cases in my  
13 12 year career that were specifically assigned  
14 to me in addition to me helping other team  
15 members. It's hard when you have multiple  
16 families and you're inundated and the cases  
17 don't stop coming in and maybe you're the only  
18 person working that night. Which has happened  
19 on occasion.

20 These children, are they being  
21 interviewed in a special location? You had  
22 the director of the CAC before, the Child  
23 Advocacy Center, and they do a  
24 multidisciplinary process where you come in  
25 and you have a neutral person interview the

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 child in a child-friendly neutral  
3 environment. We're not going into the house  
4 and interviewing when the offender is in the  
5 other room. We're not going into the school  
6 where there's rules and regulations and you're  
7 already told if you talk about that bruise  
8 you're going to be taken away. There's a  
9 problem right there with the way we are doing  
10 interviews I believe.

11 If you can, when you do have your  
12 overview with them again, ask them about  
13 implementing an instant response team. New  
14 York City does it. I don't believe Nassau  
15 County does. So instant response is when you  
16 do get this call from the state central  
17 registry and it funnels down and you have a  
18 case where there's an allegation of physical  
19 abuse and there is a visible injury, your  
20 child should have been brought to the CAC and  
21 interviewed by a forensic interviewer. It  
22 should not have been marked as duplicate.  
23 That child was failed on that part. That's  
24 the deficiency.

25 Any type of sexual abuse or any

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 innuendo of sexual abuse the child should be  
3 interviewed in the CAC. Where there is  
4 someone who know how to do a forensic  
5 interview of a child and is not asking where  
6 the offender might still be present.

7 I think it was you, Legislator  
8 Gaylor, that asked if you can move 30 cases  
9 and distribute it out. That's very hard. The  
10 CPS worker has a rapport with the family and  
11 you pass the buck on to somebody else that new  
12 case worker has to start new with that family  
13 and it becomes difficult for that family. So  
14 it's not like a file you pick up here. You  
15 have to start all over and get a rapport with  
16 that family and that child. The children are  
17 paramount here. We have to focus on what's  
18 best for them.

19 The Child Advocacy Center prevents  
20 multiple interviews by multiple agencies. You  
21 have everybody come together and get to  
22 observe what one forensic interviewer does an  
23 interview with a child and it prevents the  
24 trauma from happening over again. But it also  
25 helps everyone gain information at the same

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 time. I thank you very much for my time.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you so  
4 much Marilyn. Francesca Amato.

5 MS. AMATO: Hi. My name is  
6 Francesca Amato of Punish 4 Protecting  
7 Incorporated. I'm not only here today to  
8 grieve and stand with the mother and siblings  
9 of Thomas Valva, but before I even say that I  
10 also want to say to you the only good that can  
11 come out of this is that your son is the voice  
12 for countless millions and millions of  
13 children. That's the only good. For that I  
14 don't even have words for you mom.

15 I'm here to inform all of you that  
16 this horrendous tragedy could have been  
17 avoided if there was any accountability in the  
18 system. I want to let everybody to know right  
19 now I don't negotiate with terrorists.

20 For 12 and a half years I have  
21 worked as a family rights advocate across the  
22 nation and have kept a data base of the  
23 countless families that have suffered from the  
24 most egregious decisions made by judges which  
25 have resulted in making matters a thousand

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 times worse if there was even any real issue  
3 at all to begin with.

4 During and after separation and at  
5 a time when emotions may peak these bad actors  
6 intentionally exasperate conflict by placing  
7 their pecuniary interests before our  
8 children.

9 Family courts and the Title Four  
10 judges target everyone and do not  
11 discriminate. It doesn't matter if you are  
12 black, white, yellow, blue, rich or poor. All  
13 are subjected to this unless we effectively  
14 stop it now. I have witnessed many times  
15 where the courts have granted unfettered  
16 access to actual known abusers which have  
17 resulted in the perpetual harming of children,  
18 and never once ever proceeding to the side of  
19 caution. I court watch judges all over the  
20 state and country and I'm appalled every day.  
21 I watch CPS workers falsify records and lie in  
22 every single courtroom I've ever sat in for 12  
23 and a half years.

24 So I really would have the real  
25 nitty-gritty statistics because I see it with

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 my eyes for 12 and a half years. I work with  
3 the families. And you want to talk about case  
4 overload? Talk to me about case overload. I  
5 work without pay. I do this for the families  
6 and beg and plead for judges and CPS and  
7 whomever to save and protect these families.  
8 I have been to the Department of Justice, the  
9 FBI. You name it. I spoke before Congress.  
10 I spoke before the New York State Attorney  
11 General's Office. I served Letitia James on  
12 the 21st 28 pages of federal crimes against  
13 all our families.

14 Tonight you didn't see anybody  
15 foaming from the mouth. You didn't see any  
16 mothers with needles hanging out of their  
17 mouths. You've see articulate mothers who  
18 have clean, safe backgrounds restrained from  
19 protecting their children. This is disgusting  
20 and appalling and it's been going on for six  
21 decades. There is no reform for this system.  
22 The only thing that needs to be done is  
23 abolish and arrest and prosecute every single  
24 judge, CPS worker and anybody else that's  
25 complicit to these crimes.



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 When the American people didn't  
3 vote this in 1962 that means this is treason  
4 and it's never going to work. You can't have  
5 a justice system, a fake jury, no jury rather,  
6 no evidence-based practices, a judge that  
7 makes all the decisions and you can't have  
8 that when the people never voted it in. That  
9 is a disgrace. That's actually completely  
10 federal crimes on American soil. Therefore,  
11 you can't fix it. You can't reform it. The  
12 trillions and trillions of dollars that you  
13 put into it it's all nonsense and we don't  
14 want to hear it anymore. We're disgusted with  
15 all of this.

16 I've witnessed the unfettered  
17 access given to abusers and mothers and  
18 fathers that are protective are the ones that  
19 are restrained from their children. So don't  
20 tell me, don't ever tell me that they proceed  
21 to the side of caution because they do not  
22 ever.

23 The truth is that these Title Four  
24 courts prey on the families that they claim to  
25 protect while receiving funding under the

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   administration of Children and Families.  
3   Their own admittance, 88 percent of sex  
4   traffic children come from your organizations  
5   and you're all one body. Family court, CPS,  
6   ACS, I don't care what name you give it.  
7   Foster care. Forced adoption. The black  
8   market of the adoption industry. You are all  
9   one body. You all work together. That's what  
10  you do and we've had it.

11                   These judges have all violated  
12  their oaths of office and are continually  
13  depriving people of their constitutionally  
14  protected rights. In the family court, which  
15  was never, again, voted in by the people,  
16  family show up to have their rights violated  
17  daily. For years we always have heard from  
18  all of the authorities and people in office  
19  that they do not have jurisdiction. Or that  
20  you need to find an attorney. No offense to  
21  you because we love you by the way. If we had  
22  people like you we wouldn't have these  
23  problems. And that they do not have  
24  jurisdiction or that you need to find an  
25  attorney for the crimes committed against you

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     that are being rendered as a civil matter by  
3     them.

4                   Under the ASFA Act of 1997, the  
5     removal of children was incentivized. This  
6     system of zero percent, yes zero percent,  
7     accountability has ripped families apart and  
8     has more blood on its hands than our worst  
9     terror attacks combined due to your greed.

10                  I am here today to say that we the  
11     people of the state of New York are sick of  
12     this tyranny. Countless people have contacted  
13     the State Attorney General Letitia James in  
14     the past to no avail. I'm sure all my  
15     families back here can agree to that, right?

16                  We recently put her on notice on  
17     the 8th and on the 21st, 2020 with a sworn  
18     affidavit. Due to these courts being devoid  
19     of the Constitution, they currently are the  
20     cause of severe human rights abuses and  
21     continually torture families through the  
22     falsehoods and manufactured conflicts.

23                  Parents are punished for protecting  
24     their own old flesh and blood while officers  
25     of the court, who swore to protect and serve

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 us, are intentionally depriving parents of  
3 their rights day in and day out.

4 Being a parent is a constitutional  
5 protected right. Any judge knowingly  
6 depriving a person of their rights while  
7 acting under color of law is committing  
8 treason. I work as a national advocate and  
9 can tell you that some of these judges are  
10 involved in more than just their misconduct in  
11 the courtroom. These are judges that are  
12 involved in covering up the deaths of children  
13 in other states.

14 I stand with thousands and  
15 thousands and thousands of families after both  
16 my son and I were targeted and continue to be  
17 targeted by Anthony McGinnity and have come to  
18 realize that this is the gateway to child and  
19 human trafficking. This is the door to child  
20 trafficking. Period.

21 New York ranks fifth in the nation  
22 for human trafficking. The Hudson Valley is  
23 number one. Family courts empower narcissists  
24 and the judges in this venue do whatever they  
25 wish under the guise of the children's best

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 interest standard. Narcissists are empowered  
3 and perjury is highly encouraged in family  
4 court. Why would we want to give these people  
5 anymore chances? The only answer to this is  
6 abolish and arrest.

7 The issue is that the people don't  
8 truly know about family court, CPS, ACS or  
9 whatever, ASS, name you want to give them,  
10 until it's too late. Once CPS gets involved,  
11 anything is possible. Once family court gets  
12 involved anything is possible. They  
13 intentionally tear apart families and get  
14 rewarded for it. I consider them to be child  
15 predator services. This system that is based  
16 off greed has totally been exposed now.

17 I have dedicated my life to  
18 stopping this system after having understood  
19 that it preyed on those it claims to protect.  
20 My biggest fear is that there may be people  
21 here asking for reform of these courts, which  
22 we saw tonight, but make no mistake, this is  
23 not a father or mother issue. It is not an  
24 isolated issue at all. These courts are not  
25 broken. They are designed this way to ensure

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 that the state is receiving unlimited access  
3 to federal grant money. They do not need  
4 anymore funding. They need to be cut off.

5 This system can no longer  
6 continue. CPS, ACS, family court workers are  
7 so quick to remove children and often falsely  
8 claim that a parent abused or neglected their  
9 children but they're abused in the system and  
10 they're abused by being ripped from their  
11 families. That's abuse under Ace research, a  
12 first childhood experiences. Then go on to  
13 place children in foster care where they go on  
14 to be physically, emotionally, mentally and  
15 sexually abused.

16 Parents are affected daily by this  
17 injustice system of family court. I am the  
18 author of a two-time best selling book called  
19 Punished for Protecting, The Injustice System  
20 of Family Court.

21 This is a system based off fraud  
22 and decent and more than often children are  
23 placed in harm's way. We all must have a  
24 moral compass and obligation to end this  
25 nightmare. I strongly advocate for the repeal

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 of the Family Court Act, abolishment of the  
3 family courts and arrest every single last  
4 judge, every single last person that's  
5 involved. These are crimes. They have  
6 victimized our families. Ignorance of the law  
7 excuses no one.

8 You can find me on Punish 4  
9 Protecting, Punish for Being a Parent dot com  
10 or on Facebook at Francesca Amato. And I just  
11 want to read off some judges besides Judge  
12 Zimmerman and all the other judges involved  
13 that have been a part of the death of this  
14 child and this poor mother what she had to  
15 deal with. And I'm so proud of your  
16 strength. I know you have faith in God.

17 Anthony McGinnity of Ulster  
18 County. Maryanne Meisel Ulster County. Terry  
19 Savona, Ulster County. Joan Picarillo, Queens  
20 County. Lauri Currier-Woods, Orange County.  
21 Joan Posner, Dutchess County. Michael  
22 McGuire, Sullivan County. Tracy McKenzie,  
23 Dutchess County. Sharon Lavallo, Erie  
24 County. Mary Tarantelli, Chemung County.  
25 Spiro Pines, Broome County. Michael Sullivan,

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Chautauqua County. Alana Grubell, Kings  
3 County. Peter Delizzo, who wants to give a  
4 child to a man who is a pedophile and he's  
5 actually wanted on the Interpol. He wants to  
6 give full custody of this child who is being  
7 protected in Russia.

8 John Starry, Staten Island. John  
9 Brennan, Herkimer County. Leonard Steinman,  
10 Nassau County. Matthew Cooper, Jennifer  
11 Sketcher, Amy Ingram. These are some of the  
12 child attorneys that lie constantly. Referee  
13 Marilyn Sugarman. Janet Defiori, Chief Judge  
14 of New York State. Who's been told by all of  
15 my victims for years and years and years  
16 what's going on. They know what's going on.

17 Lawrence Marks, Peter Matrone,  
18 Debra Caplan. Patrick O'Sullivan. Sorry.  
19 I'm Italian. And I tried to do it within  
20 three minutes but I know didn't make that.

21 But that's the list. That's some  
22 of the worst of the worst. But they're all  
23 worst. Judge Morganthal.

24 Also part of my team is here  
25 today. I have licensed social workers,



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 retired New York State Police, Constitutional  
3 experts, doctors. You name it. Families that  
4 are ripped apart. Dorothy's been put through  
5 hell through this county. She's been  
6 literally put through hell. ACS is torturing  
7 her. It's disgusting what's going on and  
8 we've had enough of it. We want to see them  
9 shut down and held accountable. These are  
10 good, good families. They're not on drugs.  
11 They're not abusers. They're good families.  
12 All we want to do is protect our children and  
13 you all lie to us and tell us that you're  
14 protect them by stealing them and endangering  
15 them. It makes no sense. Abolish. Arrest.

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you  
17 Francesca. Elizabeth Petrakis.

18 MS. PETRAKIS: Good evening  
19 legislative panel. Thank you for having us.  
20 I would like to send my sincere condolences to  
21 Justyna. I'm heartfelt. Just horrible. I'm  
22 a mother of three. My name is Elizabeth  
23 Petrakis. Mother of three. Resident of Old  
24 Brookville, Nassau County. I'm here to just  
25 inform you guys about a few things.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Fact. There's one divorce to every  
3 2.4 marriages in the United States. The fear  
4 of the unknown during divorce continues to  
5 affect millions who face divorce each year  
6 feeling lost, confused and alone due to the  
7 lack of resources. Divorce has been linked to  
8 emotional and financial destruction. Drugs  
9 and alcohol abuse, domestic violence, child  
10 abuse, suicide and even the murder of a spouse  
11 or a child. There are over one million  
12 children affected by divorce each year.

13 Fact. When there are no real  
14 resources people feel overwhelmed, lost and  
15 alone. It is at those darkest hours that  
16 terrible things can happen, including suicide,  
17 homicide of a spouse or child or even a family  
18 member. Divorce is not only financially,  
19 emotionally and physically devastating but  
20 also divorce kills.

21 I'm not a lawyer but I have had  
22 firsthand experience representing myself just  
23 as Justyna and other women here, and men I'm  
24 sure, in my own divorce case that lasted  
25 approximately ten years in Nassau County. It

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 was before Honorable Judge Anthony Falaga as  
3 well as before Honorable Judge Stacy Bennett.

4 My case dragged out over many years  
5 and cost over \$700,000 in legal fees. Due to  
6 in part the frivolous motion practice by both  
7 parties' counsel and adjournments by the court  
8 month after month, year after year. I  
9 realized soon that I was not only fighting my  
10 spouse, I was fighting my lawyers. I was then  
11 fighting the judges. Judges who didn't have  
12 all the facts. Yet wrote decisions based on  
13 misrepresentations by law guardians regarding  
14 my children.

15 It was finally after almost ten  
16 years, after severe physical, emotional and  
17 financial devastation that our case was  
18 appointed a referee by the judge. It was  
19 miraculous. The referee was given an outline  
20 of issues to address with counsel and the  
21 parties by the judge. Both parties' counsel  
22 were forced to sit and present all of the real  
23 issues that were outstanding to the referee  
24 and they were given a prompt deadline to  
25 comply with options for solutions. My husband

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 and I had no choice but to sit down and  
3 discuss the problems. Financial problems and  
4 dealing with children issues and we had to  
5 come up with solutions.

6 The referee would also assist to  
7 resolve issues and a settlement would be  
8 reached. Before an unbiased referee was  
9 appointed to our case help and resources were  
10 scarce to none. I too was lost and alone. I  
11 soon realized that so many people were in my  
12 shoes and I knew something had to be done.

13 In 2013 I created a company called  
14 Divorce Prep School. What Divorce Prep School  
15 is it provides a three-hour educational  
16 seminar to empower and protect men, women and  
17 children through the knowledge of certified  
18 professional panelists. Just like you guys  
19 are sitting there on a panel. The panel  
20 included four judges, lawyers, financial  
21 planners, child psychologists, mediators, life  
22 coach, family therapist, forensic accountant  
23 and more as people would navigate through the  
24 arduous process of divorce. They could find  
25 resources and guidance from these certified

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 experts so that they could stay in control of  
3 their lives and not feel alone nor overwhelmed  
4 before, during or after divorce.

5 The problem. In Nassau County  
6 alone there are approximately 5,000 divorces  
7 filed each year. That means there are 10,000  
8 individuals who are in need of guidance and  
9 resources. Prolonged divorced cases cause  
10 emotional, physical prolong and financial  
11 devastation, and even death to litigants,  
12 their children and their families.

13 I know firsthand that the courts  
14 haven't done anything to fix this problem.  
15 The courts are also overwhelmed. They're  
16 backlogged and they need help. While many  
17 people are pointing the fingers at the courts  
18 for what happened in this terrible case, and I  
19 know it's easy to point fingers, I have to say  
20 that there's a problem that needs a solution.  
21 The truth is that it's not only the judges'  
22 faults entirely. The fact is that the judges  
23 and courts need more resources of their own  
24 and they are in need of an innovative solution  
25 that can help to ensure that something like

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 this that never happens again.

3 What happened to me after ten years  
4 of litigating when the judge finally appointed  
5 a mediator, not a mediator a referee, for us  
6 to deal with issues, that was the only time  
7 something got done on our case. That was the  
8 only time we were able to resolve issues.

9 I am proposing and I would like to  
10 formally and respectfully request that you,  
11 the legislative panel of representatives,  
12 collectively sign to sponsor an emergency bill  
13 to Congress that will empower and protect the  
14 lives of divorcing individuals and their  
15 families through the knowledge of experts by  
16 mandating the attendance of every divorcing  
17 litigant to a three-hour informational  
18 seminar. By implementing mandatory attendance  
19 of litigants litigants would be able to find  
20 resources from experts. The solution is that  
21 litigants attendance would also provide  
22 substantial funding to the courts. If the  
23 issue is that there is no money for the courts  
24 to hire mediators or referees -- I'm talking  
25 hiring appointed referees to each case of a

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 litigated case. Anyone who files for divorce  
3 has to not only attend a divorce prep program  
4 or something of that nature, but also needs to  
5 be appointed by the judge a referee and/or a  
6 mediator.

7 My proposal would also raise over  
8 \$1 million each year for each court that this  
9 program is in and that money could be  
10 allocated to hire mediators and referees.

11 If the question is what is the  
12 problem? Is there a solution? Do any of you  
13 up there, we're hearing all night that there  
14 are problems. Do any of you on the  
15 legislative panel have a solution in mind? I  
16 think that we don't have a solution but I have  
17 found a solution. I have worked tirelessly on  
18 this. I have a passion. I have a fire inside  
19 of me to help save lives and I have been  
20 working on this since 2013. I know deep down  
21 in my soul that a program that would be  
22 mandated by Congress, signed by the President  
23 of the United States mandating every litigant  
24 to attend a three-hour educational program and  
25 also be assigned referees and mediators for

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 their divorce cases things would be moved  
3 along very quickly.

4 And additionally, a specialized  
5 task force dedicated to assisting and  
6 overseeing the hiring and progress of  
7 mediators and referees as well as making sure  
8 that cases are getting the attention they  
9 deserve are moving ahead.

10 Here's the question. What is the  
11 solution? It's not abolish and arrest because  
12 everybody up there on the panel they're not  
13 going to abolish and arrest judges. We need  
14 solutions. People need --

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Can we give  
16 everyone the courtesy.

17 MS. PETRAKIS: I also have to let  
18 you know that it's true that judges don't  
19 allow litigants to speak and lawyers often  
20 times do not represent the real issues that  
21 need to be addressed. And cases get adjourned  
22 and adjourned month after month, year after  
23 year and that's why families fall apart. Law  
24 guardians that can be biased are appointed to  
25 cases and it's terrible what can happen to



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 families. It's terrible that people are  
3 dying. Spouses are killing spouses. Fathers  
4 are killing their children. Vice versa. It's  
5 terrible. When cases become acrimonious this  
6 is what happens.

7 I would like to just let you know  
8 that I have requested that this bill be  
9 sponsored by other legislators. And I had  
10 sent out many letters to and including Nassau  
11 County Executive Laura Curran, Chief  
12 Administrative Judge Lawrence Marks, Chief  
13 Honorable Judge Janet Fiori, Chief  
14 Administrative Judge Vito Caruso, Peter King  
15 and others.

16 Now, I received a response just the  
17 other day from Vito Caruso's chambers stating.

18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: If you could  
19 just kind of wrap it up.

20 MS. PETRAKIS: I just want to say  
21 thank you. That they said thank you  
22 Mrs. Petrakis. Thank you for your email.  
23 However, Judge Caruso would like to decline to  
24 hear anything further of how you would like to  
25 implement something into the courts to help

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 save lives.

3 That to me is very disturbing, and  
4 I would like to ask again, respectfully  
5 request, that you all as a panel collectively  
6 sign to sponsor an emergency bill that would  
7 empower and protect the lives of divorcing  
8 litigants. And I would like for everyone here  
9 in the public to sign a petition. Thank you.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.  
11 Evette Stark.

12 MS. STARK: I don't have anything  
13 officially prepared. But it's ironic that I'm  
14 following the last speaker. I just want to  
15 say that the family and the divorce courts  
16 involving CPS and every other known entity  
17 they operate with judges in these so-called  
18 family courts. They're really admiralty  
19 courts and these are administrative. They're  
20 not even judges with jurisdiction. They  
21 violate the rights of the children in the  
22 courts and myself as an adult just coming out  
23 of a ten-year divorce. However, I was sued  
24 for \$9 million last week for slandering my  
25 lawyer ex-spouse. Part of the inside crowd.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 So, in reference to anything  
3 involving family court and divorce court, I  
4 think both of these courts need to be killed  
5 and all of the people working for them need to  
6 go to jail. Because, and I will tell you why,  
7 because these are incentivized courts to  
8 weaponize children with parents. That's  
9 number one.

10 I just want to say I'm in  
11 solidarity with many people who are here.  
12 Because I have also gone to the congressional  
13 hearing and I have also marched with many  
14 different groups in Washington DC. The  
15 Million Parent March, the Punishment 4  
16 Protection Group that's here and also For The  
17 Children people, as well as the American  
18 Families and the American Parents March.

19 I have been to Charles Schumer's  
20 office with ten people and met with his  
21 assistants and talked about child protective  
22 services and divorce court. You know what?  
23 They are two sides of the same coin. And the  
24 same abuses and the same deprivation of rights  
25 and the same twisting intrinsically of the

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 facts that happen. Extrinsically and  
3 intrinsically. Intrinsically everything is  
4 twisted so the facts are wrong. Then the  
5 court uses these facts extrinsically to give  
6 you no money or to force the sale of your home  
7 or to take your children away from you and put  
8 them with abusive parents who are like  
9 psychotic and are not being evaluated properly  
10 by Child Protective Services.

11 I was forced to go to a referee  
12 trial and I have a traumatic brain injury and  
13 I have many physical problems. I walk with a  
14 walker and I'm scheduled to hopefully have  
15 surgery in a week on my back and even my  
16 shoulder. But I have a lawyer spouse who's  
17 threatening to through me out of my house  
18 because my judge, Matthew Cooper in New York  
19 City, along with Janet DiFiori who knows me  
20 very well because I wrote to her for many  
21 years, is threatening to throw me out of my  
22 house.

23 Before I go I just want to say two  
24 things and I want to read some judges' and  
25 lawyers' names.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 First of all, the federal law, the  
3 US code titled 18 Section 242 very clearly  
4 states that any public official who violates  
5 anyone's rights is committing a felony and  
6 should go to prison for up to a life term or  
7 receive the death penalty depending on the  
8 circumstances. And then, I don't know if  
9 there's a record here or not but I definitely  
10 want these names put on the record.

11 In 2016 I wrote a letters about  
12 Child Protective Services and divorce court.  
13 I wrote letter to Loretta Lynch, who was the  
14 attorney general of the United States at that  
15 time. Preet Bahara, who is now teaching at  
16 NYU, the US Attorney's Office from the  
17 Southern District of New York. The Honorable  
18 Andrew Cuomo, governor of New York State, who  
19 needs to be removed. James Como, director of  
20 the FBI headquarters, who's involved in some  
21 of this impeachment stuff with Trump. Eric T.  
22 Schneiderman Esquire, who was the New York  
23 State Attorney General and seemed to be  
24 abusing women or had some issues with some  
25 violence towards women.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Cyrus R. Vance, who is a New York  
3 County District Attorney's Office. David  
4 Crowley, who is the assistant district  
5 attorney. Senator Brad Hoilman, who is from  
6 district in Greenwich Village in New York  
7 City. Liz Krueger. Lamonte Montgomery. And  
8 Letitia James, who I'm going to serve on  
9 Friday in support of the Punished 4  
10 Protecting. She was the city public advocate  
11 then. Now she's the attorney general. Wait  
12 until I serve these papers on Friday.

13 Congressman Jerrold Nadler. And I  
14 had a cc go to counsel member Corey Johnson in  
15 District Three who is in Chelsea, just next to  
16 Greenwich, who I know personally. I know many  
17 of these people personally because I don't  
18 just live in my area. I protest. I show up  
19 at town meetings. I'm very involved with  
20 seniors in my community. I'm just appalled by  
21 the continuation of the abuse and the  
22 corruption and the violence of the child  
23 protective services system, the family courts  
24 and divorce courts. And I just want to  
25 read -- I'm almost done -- I just need to read

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 a few more people's names on the record.

3 Matthew Cooper. Actually I don't  
4 give these people any honorable names okay.  
5 It's Matthew Cooper. He's an administrative  
6 judge in an admiralty court. Jennifer  
7 Schecter. Who just got like a promotion to  
8 the supreme court who held a \$6 million  
9 slander suit against me from my husband, a  
10 lawyer. It was dismissed. But she held it  
11 for a year and a half. So the referee judge  
12 could use that against me. Against all my  
13 Facebook information. Going to court with  
14 many of the people that are here. And I told  
15 the truth. She dismissed it because the  
16 corruption is the truth.

17 Whatever this panel is presenting  
18 is mumbo-jumbo. Half of you probably need to  
19 go to jail. I don't know how many people on  
20 this panel are pedophiles. A lot of this, a  
21 lot of the information here and the underlying  
22 system of business is about pedophilia and it  
23 is about trafficking children and it is about  
24 human abuse. Not just for children but for  
25 the adults.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay. You  
3 have to wrap it up.

4 MS. STARK: No. I want to read.  
5 You will let read these names because these  
6 are your judges that run your courts.

7 Debra Caplan, who oversee the clerk  
8 of the court and ignored all my letters for  
9 all the attorneys and judges oaths of office  
10 and their bonds. Peter Multon. Lawrence  
11 Marks. Referee Marilyn Sugarman. She should  
12 be shot. Janet DiFiori ignored me for so many  
13 years. Matthew Cooper again.

14 I want to say that my husband,  
15 Richard Katz, needs to be added here. Jeffrey  
16 R. Schissel, his accountant. I have not  
17 included bankers by the way. These are just  
18 lawyers. Jonathan Andrew Rappaport. Preston  
19 Anvrams Leshings. Bill Vasaledes. He's out  
20 of Astoria. Michael P. Joseph, who is my  
21 husband's ex-lawyer. Richard Katz again, my  
22 husband. Tim Corbo, the clerk of Matthew  
23 Cooper. All the clerks need to be evaluated.  
24 They're all trading bonds without our  
25 permission. All of our cases are being traded



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 in the court room for CRIS. For the judges.  
3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay.  
4 MS. STARK: Uh-uh. C-R-I-S.  
5 Their private retirement systems. That's why  
6 we're held hostage for ten years because  
7 they're trading, they're bonding our cases.  
8 They're bonding our slavery and our labor.  
9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay Evette.  
10 MS. STARKS: So they make money.  
11 I'm not done. Judges --  
12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.  
13 MS. STARK: Judges retire with \$7  
14 million, \$5 million. Nobody knows about it.  
15 They're not taxed by the IRS. Are you any of  
16 those judges? I'm wondering. That's all I  
17 have to say.  
18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara Dipper.  
19 MS. STARK: Enforce the law.  
20 Prosecute crooked judges. They are the  
21 heads.  
22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara Dipper.  
23 MS. DIPPER: My name is Sara  
24 Dipper. I am here on behalf of Punish 4  
25 Protecting with Francesca Amato. I am one of

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 her many assistants, and I have worked very,  
3 very vigorously for her for the past two years  
4 advocating for other families as well as  
5 myself.

6 I hold in my hand a copy of the  
7 children's bill of rights and I have never  
8 ever seen this upheld held in family court not  
9 once. Do you understand? Not even once. I  
10 have seen -- I will list the attorneys that  
11 have completely ignored and judges that have  
12 completed ignored these things. Ann Weaver.  
13 Kelly Brady, who is the AFC for my children,  
14 who if she is zealously representing my  
15 children she doesn't even speak to them.

16 CPS workers Lea Sackett, who gave  
17 testimony in court to the fact that my child  
18 had his head put through the wall by his  
19 father but yet that case was unfounded. No  
20 credible evidence of child abuse. He has a  
21 scar on the back of his head from that.

22 Laurie Miller who gave a false  
23 report in court. False testimony on record.  
24 As well as Clea French, who indicated me in a  
25 case on absolutely no fact whatsoever. I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 appealed it and it was overturned.

3 As well as Jillian Hill and she was  
4 presented with pictures of my son's face with  
5 a handprint across it where he was hit by his  
6 father. And there was no credible evidence of  
7 child abuse in that case either.

8 I am so sick and tired of missing  
9 my children. I guarantee every one of you up  
10 there have a child or grandchild or niece or  
11 nephew that you all will love very much and  
12 you would go to the ends of the earth to  
13 protect all of them. Am I correct? Of course  
14 you would. So, I would lay down in fire  
15 before I would ever let somebody harm my  
16 children. But I don't have the opportunity to  
17 protect them because I have one hour a week  
18 under paid supervised visitation.

19 I am so tired of the fake family  
20 court system. Yes, I said fake family court  
21 because it is not in fact a court system.  
22 It's a for-profit business. The judges are  
23 administrators in that business. Yet they  
24 sign orders every single day destroying  
25 children's lives, destroying parents' lives.

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Keeping the protective parent who is trying to  
3 keep their child safe away from them. Why?  
4 Why is the court system doing that? Explain  
5 that. I would love an answer for that  
6 please.

7 Thank you very much Francesca.  
8 It's all about money. It's all about the  
9 fraud.

10 If the CPS worker who was up here  
11 earlier stated how they lose sleep over their  
12 stressful jobs and whatnot, it holds no  
13 comparison to the amount of nights that I have  
14 laid awake in my bed worrying about the safety  
15 of my children and every other child and  
16 family that I advocate for. I do this every  
17 day, 25 hours a day, eight days a week, and I  
18 do it because I want to change the system.  
19 This system needs to be abolished. These  
20 judges need to be arrested and put in prison.

21 I will name the judges at this  
22 point that I am absolutely going to see behind  
23 bars. I will not rest until that happens. Do  
24 you all understand that?

25 Joan Posner, who destroyed my life,

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 out of Dutchess County. Took my children from  
3 me. Kept me from my children for an entire  
4 year. I couldn't even speak to my children.  
5 I understand that there are other mothers and  
6 fathers that have gone through that longer,  
7 but every single minute you are not able to  
8 have your child know that they are safe it is  
9 absolute torture no matter how long it goes  
10 on.

11 Joan Posner. Tracy McKenzie. Who  
12 signed an order stating that I am not allowed  
13 to speak to Francesca. Last time I checked I  
14 had the freedom of speech. I have every  
15 single right to uphold my First Amendment  
16 freedom of speech. Joan Posner signed a gag  
17 order saying I am not allowed to post things  
18 on Facebook. Guess what? World, listen to me  
19 on Facebook. I don't care. Any social  
20 media. I am not afraid of these people. I am  
21 not afraid of what they are trying to do to me  
22 any longer because they backed me into a  
23 corner and I will not back down any longer. I  
24 got up off my knees because I am sick and  
25 tired of this.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The last judge I will name is also  
3 Joseph Agito, who is the supervising judge  
4 over in the Ninth Judicial District. He took  
5 my children from me again. After Posner  
6 already had done that. He took my children  
7 from me after my life was threatened by my  
8 children's father. I apparently coached my  
9 children in that situation. That is  
10 absolutely ridiculous.

11 As far as I am concerned, I have  
12 never ever seen any attorney for the children  
13 zealously represent their clients. If you are  
14 representing a client how you do represent  
15 them if you don't even speak to them? Please  
16 tell me that. Because as far as I'm  
17 concerned, Kelly Brady, who my is children's  
18 AFS, has only talked to children maybe a  
19 handful of times. She does not know my  
20 children. She does not know me.

21 I'm so tired of hearing well, you  
22 have to do this, you have to do that. I've  
23 done everything that the court has asked me to  
24 do. Everything. And I still don't have my  
25 children back. Why?

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 They allow children to be, as well  
3 as on top of keeping them from their parents,  
4 loving parents, they overmedicate children to  
5 chemically restrain them so they don't have to  
6 deal with all the emotion and the trauma that  
7 these children experience.

8 So, as far as I am concerned, the  
9 pediatricians who prescribe that medication,  
10 the judges who allow that, the attorney for  
11 the children who allow these atrocious,  
12 disgusting drugs to be prescribed -- my son is  
13 on Risperdal. There is a lawsuit that was won  
14 because men can grow breasts on that  
15 medication. I begged to have my son taken off  
16 of that medication and it has not happened.  
17 He is ten years old, my little boy, and he  
18 should not be on that medication because the  
19 reason he is on it is to keep him calm and  
20 keep him quiet because nobody wants to deal  
21 with his emotions.

22 As far as I am concerned, Letitia  
23 James, our attorney general, we served her  
24 January 21st and she had 48 hours to shut down  
25 the family court system and it's still running

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 right now. Why? She needs to be held  
3 accountable. She's the one who is supposed to  
4 be the one who is watching these judges.  
5 There's no checks and balances in family  
6 court. None whatsoever. If that is her job  
7 as the attorney general then she needs to do  
8 it.

9 As everybody that is in this room  
10 and all the CPS workers that were in this room  
11 earlier, quite honestly, I've only met maybe  
12 three or four good CPS workers and all the  
13 rest of them they're corrupt. In Dutchess  
14 County the corruption is basically in the  
15 water. I'm telling you. I have seen it  
16 firsthand time and time again. Not only in my  
17 case but in all the cases I advocate for.

18 I am tired of hearing moms cry to  
19 me, fathers cry to me, I miss my children. I  
20 need to be with my children. I need to know  
21 they're safe. I am tired of laying awake and  
22 crying and missing my children, holding their  
23 stuffed animals, hugging their blankets and  
24 crying. There are certain days that I cannot  
25 even bring myself to get out of bed because of



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the PTSD and the depression that I suffer from  
3 because of this system.

4 We need to abolish the system and  
5 arrest these judges and arrest these people  
6 that have abused us. The social workers. The  
7 people that have abused us should not be able  
8 to walk around freely. They should be behind  
9 bars.

10 As far as I'm concerned, Joan  
11 Posner retired in 2018 and when I put her  
12 behind bars that's where she will stay for the  
13 rest of her retirement. Mark my words. I  
14 will not rest until I know children are safe  
15 and until I know that this actually changed  
16 something and this is over because there is no  
17 reason that any parent or child should ever  
18 have to suffer through this again.

19 If any CPS worker or anybody  
20 involved in this, a judge, attorney, whoever  
21 they may be, can take your child from you that  
22 day and go home and sit across from the dinner  
23 table and look at their child and tuck them  
24 into bed and get them up in the morning and be  
25 able to hug them and kiss them any time they

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    want to, why am I deprived that right? Why is  
3    everybody else deprived that right? There is  
4    no reason for that whatsoever. God gave me  
5    the ability to bear my children. I was  
6    blessed by the Lord to have my children. So  
7    how dare any man step on that. Thank you very  
8    much.

9                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:     Mark Ronald  
10   Simon.

11                  MR. SIMON:     Good evening  
12   everyone. Condolences to the families,  
13   Justyna. I'm here as a father, a grief  
14   father, a minister and concerned neighbor.  
15   There are two sides to the story. I know this  
16   may not fit the agenda of this committee right  
17   now but you need to hear from families like  
18   myself and the people that have spoken  
19   recently. I'm speaking from my own  
20   experiences with the family court, with CPS.

21                  We were victims of CPS in Nassau  
22   County on and around 2015 by unverified  
23   complaints by Dr. Bronz Coxio and Lisa Marti  
24   from Long Beach School District.

25                  In summary, my family and I were

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 victims of Hurricane Sandy and we were  
3 rebuilding our home and there was a false  
4 allegation of neglect. Long story short, with  
5 the assistance of our public advocates, one of  
6 them in the room, Dr. Marcus from Brooklyn,  
7 and also concerned neighbors, the claims were  
8 dismissed and they filed the case as  
9 unfounded.

10 My question to this committee is,  
11 why aren't the wrong doers that made these  
12 unverified complaints and frivolous reports  
13 not punished?

14 Currently, I'm a victim of  
15 constructive fraud, malicious prosecution and  
16 identity theft. Magistrates at Kings Family  
17 Court are Nicholas J. Pollos, Elizabeth  
18 Shannis and supervising Judge Amanda White are  
19 all guilty of misrepresentations, conspiracy  
20 against me at the Kings Family Court.

21 It has been over a decade, a decade  
22 of me making complaints to state assemblymen,  
23 attorney general, the president, Congress. A  
24 decade, I want to emphasize that, against  
25 these wrongdoers. Of recent, this is new

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   discovery now, of recent, after reviewing the  
3   court filing with Dr. Marcus from Brooklyn,  
4   usually when I went on my own to review the  
5   court file at Kings Family Court they would  
6   say there's certain paperwork in there  
7   that's -- what's the word they used? That  
8   it's proprietary or you can't view certain  
9   paperwork in the file. It's not  
10  confidentiality. Restrictive or something.

11                   Now, just side bar, I've been in  
12  other venues dealing with foreclosure because  
13  of what family court has done to me and my  
14  family. I was able to view files in supreme  
15  court and federal court. Why is it in this  
16  venue, family court, I'm not able to view the  
17  whole file? That's another question I have  
18  before this venue here.

19                   Due to new discovery, they  
20  mistakenly left an application that was filled  
21  out by my now 18 year old daughter's mother  
22  and it alleges that I was married to her and  
23  divorced. This is a lie. I was never married  
24  to my children's mother. We were young. Over  
25  a decade ago. But I've just found out that I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have been maliciously prosecuted against under  
3 false allegations. They had it in their file  
4 that we were married.

5 I'm in the process of giving notice  
6 to this fraudulent court. I've tried over the  
7 decade to redress this issue. I've never been  
8 served properly. There's no proof of service  
9 on the record. There's no proof of  
10 jurisdiction. I have hired attorneys. I did  
11 it on my own. It's just a mess. They keep  
12 adjourning, adjourning and no redress.

13 Prior to this I filed a petition  
14 for visitation with my daughter in 2003. Long  
15 story short, within that decade all my  
16 visitation was violated by the mother.

17 When the Judge Amanda in Queens  
18 Family Court, this is where the mother alleged  
19 she lived, she ordered more visitation for  
20 me. The mother maliciously used the court  
21 system as a sword against me. Maliciously  
22 filed two police reports during the era of  
23 President Obama's era of reformation with  
24 domestic violence and stuff like that.

25 Filed malicious, frivolous police

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    reports against me leading to my 11 year  
3    tenure at New York City Transit as a bus  
4    operator termination. Mind you, this time I'm  
5    married with four sons with my wife, and I  
6    can't tell you the amount of stress it's put  
7    on my marriage and my relationship with my  
8    daughter. Not even seeing my daughter, who is  
9    now 18 years old, that hates me because she  
10   says I gave up on her.

11                   I painfully decided to not fight  
12   and withdrew my petition for my first born  
13   daughter. And the family court has failed my  
14   daughter. The family court is not a venue of  
15   adjudication. Nor just -- it's not just nor  
16   or fear. It must be abolished. I stand with  
17   Francesca Amato and the abolishment of the  
18   family court and the child support agency.

19                   In closing, there is emoluments  
20   violations going on with these state actors.  
21   Myself and others give verbal notice, verbal  
22   notice that investigations be ordered by  
23   remonstrance directly with the legislature  
24   will be filed to revoke business licenses and  
25   persecute bad state actors. Thank you for

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 your time.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.

4 Anthony Cibell.

5 MR. CIBELL: Thank you for having

6 me. I'm going to go a little bit over three

7 minutes. First, I'd like to give notice to

8 the American flags there with their gold

9 fringe. We know what that means.

10 I'm going to say what I said

11 yesterday in front of our legislature. From

12 what I have witnessed thus far in the year and

13 change that I've had to deal with the family

14 courts and Child Protective Services, I can

15 tell you that these individuals are not in

16 fact government and are not de jour through

17 their private corporate statuses.

18 These courts are being run as banks

19 and involved in daily systemic fraud whilst

20 tearing families apart through methods of

21 coercion, intimidation and the fact that there

22 is no one that has accountability over their

23 nefarious acts while acting under color of

24 law.

25 The reason why I believe that it is

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   all too common to hear that these people that  
3   we go to for help don't have the jurisdiction  
4   or tell us that it's a civil matter is because  
5   they do not wish to impede on the state's  
6   ability to generate this blood money of Title  
7   Four funding from social security. While no  
8   one may be perfect no one deserves to deal  
9   with these tyrants as they are far worst than  
10  the enemy combatants that I once faced called  
11  the Majilis over in Iraq.

12                   I took an oath years ago to protect  
13  the Constitution of the United States against  
14  all enemies both foreign and domestic. These  
15  judges have also taken a very similar oath  
16  under the Constitution and have once sworn to  
17  act under it and uphold it. Yet they are  
18  not. That is treason.

19                   While today I am glad to say that I  
20  have identified the domestic threat, family  
21  courts don't offer any constitutional  
22  protection as they are private and not in fact  
23  courts of record.

24                   Make no mistake, when I might be  
25  mentioning family court let's not forget the



1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    other courts that handle matrimonial matters  
3    which are under Title Four programs. The  
4    judges in both venues are not acting in the  
5    capacity of judges. They're paid  
6    administrators under contract with Title Four  
7    agencies. That means that their judicial  
8    performance is tainted due to their emoluments  
9    rendering them in no way impartial. You heard  
10   it. These courts are not only defrauding  
11   health and human services and the United  
12   States government but they're operating as  
13   banks through their grants and bonds that they  
14   create off of each case.

15                   These courts are not upholding the  
16   United States Constitution as well as the New  
17   York State Constitution. Yet the judges are  
18   New York State judges.

19                   The Constitution of the United  
20   States has a 13th Amendment that no longer  
21   appears on current copies of the  
22   Constitution. The intent of this missing 13th  
23   Amendment was to prohibit lawyers from serving  
24   in government. I am sure that all of you in  
25   this crowd here tonight have heard the term a

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    licensed attorney. Get ready for this in case  
3    you guys don't know. There is no such thing  
4    as an attorney license to practice law. The  
5    United States Supreme Court held a long time  
6    ago that the practice of law cannot be  
7    licensed by any state. This was so stated in  
8    a case named Schwarick versus Board of  
9    Examiners 352 US 232 1957.

10                   The issue today is that too many  
11    people trust the concept of having an  
12    attorney. Having an attorney makes you a ward  
13    of the court. According Legal US dot com, a  
14    ward is defined as a person, usually a minor  
15    or incompetent who has a guardian appointed by  
16    them to care for and take responsibility for  
17    that person. As officers of the court, these  
18    lawyers are bar British accredited registry  
19    members are loyal to no other than that of  
20    their Titled Four D and E gods and the British  
21    crown, which they have sold their souls to.

22                   Most of their day includes lying to  
23    clients to entice them, deceiving parents and  
24    leading them into more conflict and conspiring  
25    with Child Protective Services to manufacture

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   lies. By applying the Corrupt Motive Doctrine  
3   or Powell Doctrine to this current CPS Title  
4   Four equitable fake court child trafficking  
5   crisis, we can all prove, and I say we can all  
6   prove here, the families that have been  
7   victimized by this system. That any evidence  
8   of a corrupt motive, any perjured testimony  
9   and acts done in bad faith demonstrate  
10  illegitimate and fraudulent acts, thus  
11  rendering everything done to us as fruit of  
12  the poisonous tree and that they were done  
13  knowingly seeking a preordained result most of  
14  the time done in ex-parte fashion. These  
15  courts prey on families and rake in massive  
16  federal funding.

17                   This is a human rights crisis and  
18  consists of many federal crimes. Our state  
19  attorney, Letitia James, was put on verbal  
20  notice on January 8 of 2020 about these  
21  criminal enterprises which are masquerading as  
22  serving in the children's best interests.

23                   The attorney general was also  
24  served notice by affidavit on January 21, 2020  
25  in which we broadcasted live on Francesca

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Amato's page in which now has resulted in 19.5  
3 thousand views.

4 We had informed her that we knew  
5 that she did not create this mess but she does  
6 have the power to stop it as it is happening  
7 under her watch. The state attorney general  
8 has not yet responded to the people of the  
9 state of New York. Instead she wishes to  
10 focus her energy on tweets and things going on  
11 in Missouri and instigating a propaganda  
12 agenda of insinuating that the NYPD is  
13 targeting MTA fare evaders only because of  
14 their skin color.

15 Consider this all of you a verbal  
16 FOIL request. Keeping in mind that you work  
17 for us and not the other way around. We know  
18 who the major stakeholders are in this  
19 industry. Maximus Incorporated is under Soros  
20 Fund Management. That means George Soros.  
21 The guy that rounded up the Jews and he worked  
22 for the Nazis, his own people, but now the  
23 Internet wants to change history and says he  
24 was a victim. 31 percent of their money comes  
25 from New York State alone and they're

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 operating in many countries.

3 To our state attorney general,  
4 you're supposed to work for us not for the  
5 those who profit from human rights abuses  
6 which are protected under the uniformed  
7 commercial code. Because the United States  
8 Constitution or New York State Constitution  
9 doesn't apply in this venue.

10 Here is a list of what I'm asking  
11 you, telling you, putting you on verbal  
12 notice. A comprehensive financial report,  
13 either a comprehensive annual financial  
14 report, a CAFR or a court registry investment  
15 system like Evette Katz mentioned earlier,  
16 CRIS, of the following entities.

17 Suffolk County Supreme Court, 234  
18 Griffith Avenue, Riverhead, New York 11901.  
19 400 Carlton Avenue, John P. Callahan Jr.  
20 Courthouse, Central Islip, New York 11722.  
21 One Court Street Riverhead, New York 11901.  
22 210 Center Drive Arthur Cromarty Court Complex  
23 Riverhead, New York 11901. 3105 Veterans  
24 Memorial Highway, first floor, Ronkonkoma, New  
25 York 11779. Any others admitted.

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Suffolk County Family Court, 400  
3 Carlton Avenue John F. Callahan Courthouse  
4 Central Islip, New York 11722. 210 Center  
5 Drive, Arthur M. Cromarty Complex, second  
6 floor, Riverhead, New York 11901. Any others  
7 admitted.

8 Suffolk County Child Protective  
9 Services.

10 Two. Presentment of the legal  
11 structure, including type of entity,  
12 certificate of incorporation, tax status,  
13 capital structure, including identification of  
14 all shareholders slash owners.

15 Articles of incorporation bylaws  
16 for the following entities. Suffolk County  
17 Supreme Court et al. Suffolk County Family  
18 Court et al. Suffolk County Child Protective  
19 Services.

20 Three. Detailed report of all  
21 sources of income slash proceeds on a  
22 case-by-case basis, names admitted, for fiscal  
23 year 2019 for the following entities. Suffolk  
24 County Supreme Court, Suffolk County Family  
25 Court and Suffolk County Child Protective

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Services.

3 One more thing. Laws. I hear the  
4 people mentioning laws. This is total  
5 lawlessness and it's protected under uniform  
6 commercial code and our kids are considered  
7 commerce. That's the problem here.

8 When people say that CPS is being  
9 weaponized against them it's no conspiracy  
10 theory. Even Nancy Pelosi's son herself, Paul  
11 Pelosi, who my good friend Patrick Howie, a  
12 great reporter, he covered this story that  
13 Paul Pelosi used CPS to steal three children  
14 of his girlfriend Karina Fang.

15 If CPS is going to exist, this is  
16 what I'm going to tell you guys, that they  
17 should all be wearing body cameras. Believe  
18 me, that will shut down their business a lot  
19 and the state won't be able to make that much  
20 money anymore.

21 If our state really cared about  
22 families these courts would have adopted  
23 criminal court evidentiary standards and  
24 burned the proof a long time ago. Letitia  
25 James was put on notice and I'm holding her

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 criminally responsible for in the death of  
3 Thomas Valva.

4 Whoever was talking earlier, I  
5 believe it was the commissioner of CPS,  
6 mentioned the policies and procedures of CPS  
7 is a total liar. She's knowingly provided  
8 false information and should be arrested.  
9 These people have sold their souls and lie on  
10 a daily basis as they just did tonight. And I  
11 also need to inform you that I have two  
12 insiders in CPS agencies in New York State.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Anthony, if  
14 you could just please wrap it up.

15 MR. CIBELL: Yes. These fake  
16 courts are actually being run as banks with  
17 grants as well as bonds and securities created  
18 off of each case. The judges are in position  
19 of emoluments and there needs to be  
20 investigations ordered by remonstrants like my  
21 great friend just said to the legislature to  
22 revoke business licenses and prosecute them.

23 One more thing. Two or three more  
24 things. Today at 4:21 p.m., Daniella Royce of  
25 ABC 7, who claims that she saw me speak



1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 yesterday, she contacted me and wanted to know  
3 about this story. And she said that I sounded  
4 like a conspiracy theorist when I said that  
5 these courts are doing all this stuff that I  
6 just brought before you. And she even  
7 questioned Justyna's credibility as being a  
8 good parent when she spoke to me.

9 Also, Judge Lorentz, the other day  
10 I happened to be passing by, I'm not even from  
11 Long Island.

12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Anthony  
13 please.

14 MR. CIBELL: I saw him walking,  
15 escorted by heavy brass police laughing  
16 crossing the street. You know what it is?  
17 You know what you got to do to make this  
18 right. I just want you to know that you guys  
19 were all put under notice tonight and we will  
20 hold you under 18 USC 44 which is misprison of  
21 felony and under the misprison of treason, 18  
22 USC 2382. Thank you.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.  
24 Dorothy Price Hill. Certainly you have time  
25 to speak but if you could try to keep it as

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 close to the three minutes.

3 MS. HILL: Yes. Absolutely.

4 Thank you and good evening. I work on Wall  
5 Street for over 20 years so I'm sort of used  
6 to burning the midnight hour so thank you to  
7 everyone.

8 I just want to first and foremost  
9 say to Justyna, and I was at the first vigil,  
10 my heart completely goes out to you. That  
11 Friday when I got the news I couldn't sleep.  
12 I have two children of my own. I lived in  
13 Germany not too far from the Polish border. I  
14 spent many wonderful times in Poland. There's  
15 nothing I know that can ever bring him back.  
16 Our love for you and we will always be there  
17 for you and your children.

18 I saw Gia last night. She's the  
19 youngest of the three girls and I asked her  
20 first if I could hug her and she let me. It's  
21 about love. We're all going to come together  
22 and we're all going to be there. So thank  
23 you.

24 My story goes back to 2006. I was  
25 a single mom living on the Upper East Side

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2     working in private equity with a very good  
3     job. I had full residential legal custody of  
4     my twins after my first husband, who is now a  
5     fugitive living in the Middle East, Brooklyn  
6     born American man, I found hardcore porn  
7     basically snuff porn. I don't know if any of  
8     you know about that. But that was when my  
9     bubble burst and my innocence was really  
10    shattered.

11                   He through the server at me when I  
12    told him I was going to take it to the NYPD.  
13    We were living on Central Park South. Really  
14    living the dream life. My children were at  
15    Christ's Church Day School, a private school  
16    where the Trump children also went. I was  
17    very active in our church living a very happy  
18    life. I met a man online from Nassau County  
19    on a friendship dating site. He didn't show  
20    me his photo right away. I thought that he  
21    was sort of shy.

22                   A month or two later we finally had  
23    a date in the city, and I got to know him over  
24    time and I thought it was sort of an anomaly.  
25    Wasn't the kind of typical guy that I dated.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I gave him a chance. The person I gave a  
3 chance to is now under investigation for the  
4 murder of many women here on Long Island.

5 I'm going to tell you right now,  
6 the family courts are so incredibly corrupt.  
7 I found out today that the CPS is  
8 electronically monitoring my 18 year old son's  
9 email, which is a federal felony. I am the  
10 president of a fintech company based in  
11 California. Based on all of my background  
12 having worked for Goldman Sachs and McKenzie.  
13 We are developing software solutions for banks  
14 to prevent money laundering from child sex  
15 trafficking, organized crime, drugs  
16 trafficking, arms trafficking.

17 When I confronted my second  
18 husband, Christopher Wolf, and I will go  
19 public and I have gone public as most of you  
20 know. And by the way, Patrick Ryder  
21 Commissioner of Nassau County Police believes  
22 me, which is very nice. I went to Dartmouth  
23 College with Senator Gillenbrand. She's my  
24 classmate. Our other classmate is Alex Azar.  
25 Alex is a wonderful man. He runs the

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Department of Health and Human Services in  
3 Washington and reports to President Trump.  
4 I mentioned to him at our 30th  
5 Dartmouth reunion what was going on and he  
6 said Dorothy, call me. We will talk. We will  
7 help you.

8 Fast-forward. I am the one who  
9 wrote the 80 memo to the FBI about this child  
10 sex trafficking out of Suffolk County and the  
11 illegal secret parties being held in Oak Beach  
12 being hosted by Joseph Brewer. My husband's  
13 very good friend. And by Jimmy Burke, the  
14 former Suffolk County Police chief, who, by  
15 the way, the porn that was found in his duffle  
16 bag contained allegedly two of the Gilgo  
17 victims.

18 Fast-forward. I have gone to the  
19 FBI. I have gone to Congressional Congressman  
20 Suozzi, who refuses to return my calls.  
21 Congressman Pete King was very kind and helped  
22 me. The bottom line is that there's  
23 additional DNA in the Gilgo case that I have  
24 not yet submitted. I submitted human hair and  
25 dried human skin samples to the NYPD because

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Suffolk County Police refused to take it. And  
3 guess what? They laughed at me when I went to  
4 them. And so did the Nassau County Police  
5 when I told them that jewelry that was found  
6 on Peaches and her little daughter, that's my  
7 jewelry that was stolen out of my jewelry box  
8 by Christopher Wolf who went to CPS in January  
9 2019, my second husband, no kids thank God,  
10 said to CPS she's violent. I had to leave our  
11 marriage. Dorothy's violent. All of you who  
12 know me, I love to give hugs I'm  
13 affectionate. I'm not violent.

14 Guess what? Three weeks later CPS  
15 went to the Devito home in Manhasset on Castle  
16 Ridge Road to my son, 17 years old, using  
17 forms 1021 and 1024 and kidnapped my son,  
18 placed him in foster care in Bay Shore. He  
19 ran away I found out. Then they went to court  
20 and accused me of child neglect because I did  
21 not pick him up from probation after he  
22 pummeled me in the ribs and I had to go to  
23 Manhasset Northwell for emergency. My son has  
24 a conduct disorder, which is diagnosed.  
25 Probably from all the trauma of watching his

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    mother fight for justice in the Gilgo case.  
3    But that's going to be blown wide open I  
4    assure you. My daughters are doing  
5    spectacularly well at Carnegie Mellon  
6    University.

7                   The bottom line is that Judge Ellen  
8    Greenburg is personally responsible for the  
9    harm done to my children. Also for not giving  
10   me an order of protection against Chris Wolf  
11   who strangled me in our home at 315 Manhasset  
12   Woods Road and is telling CPS I'm the violent  
13   one. Let them tell you one thing. Sadistic,  
14   psychopaths with secret lives of sex parties  
15   and online porn addictions don't make good  
16   dads. And they certainly don't make very good  
17   witnesses as well.

18                  His employer has fortunately come  
19    forward and told me they will fully cooperate  
20    with the investigation because I will show you  
21    right now that Megan Waterman, one of the  
22    Gilgo victims, told her mom, mom, you wouldn't  
23    believe some of the clients that I have on  
24    Long Island. They include judges. Thank  
25    you.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Meta J.

3 Mereday. Dr. Burchell M. Marcus.

4 MR. MARCUS: Greetings to one and  
5 all in the neighborhood. My name is Dr.  
6 Burchell M. Marcus. I'm community director  
7 for the borough of Brooklyn and I'm also the  
8 Brooklyn advocate.

9 I have been on this journey  
10 fighting against CPS for over 20 years. I've  
11 witnessed too many atrocities. I was one of  
12 the local investigators on the Nix Mary Brown  
13 case in Brooklyn when the children were  
14 neglected and Nix Mary Brown was killed. It  
15 broke my heart. And from then on I took it  
16 very seriously to investigate how the system  
17 works.

18 As of today, every time I step into  
19 a CPS office they seem to be scared of me  
20 because I have the laws on my side. I'm  
21 speaking of common laws not admiralty laws  
22 that's being performed in these courts. We  
23 are not at sea. We are on land. Admiralty  
24 courts have to go. All crimes are commercial  
25 and when you deem our people, human beings, as



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 products you violating common law.

3 I have a master's in constitutional  
4 law. I speak at colleges and universities.  
5 And what I have seen over the years they don't  
6 want us to speak at some universities because  
7 we are exposing too much of truth. I just  
8 want to ask real quick, how many of you have a  
9 law degree or how many of have you studied  
10 law? Could you raise your hands if you have  
11 any knowledge of law. I guess not. Silence  
12 is acquiescence.

13 Now, it's your job to abolish,  
14 dismantle CPS and ACS. I'm going to fight  
15 until I die and make sure that these courts  
16 and this organization called CPS is no longer  
17 in effect. We have to abolish it. Some of  
18 these courts that are practicing maritime  
19 admiralty law, as my colleague just mentioned,  
20 the flags you have behind you are maritime  
21 flags. They're not the flags of the United  
22 States of America. They're the flags of the  
23 United States for America. Is difference.

24 If you study law, read Blacks Law  
25 Dictionary, it will tell you about all these

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2       codes that we have been prosecuted under. Too  
3       many families -- I have two cases right now  
4       where ACS walked into the hospital and took  
5       people's children away from them. That's a  
6       crime. Under the Social Security Act of 1935  
7       it clearly states that no agent should remove  
8       any child without the consent of the parent.  
9       Read it. ACS is violating human rights. They  
10      are in violation of human rights. We have an  
11      attorney here. He can speak on that.

12                   Stop playing games with people. We  
13      are not persons. We are human beings. We are  
14      people. Black's Law Dictionary says that a  
15      person, the definition of a person is a child  
16      or one who cannot speak for themselves. So, I  
17      am saying to each and every one of you it's  
18      your duty to stand up. It's your duty to stop  
19      this atrocity from happening. Too many lives  
20      are on the ballot. It's time to shut it  
21      down. It's time to shut it down. If you  
22      don't take action to shut it down you all  
23      don't need to be sitting up there. You don't  
24      need to be sitting up there.

25                   They spoke about the bonds. Each

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 and every case, all crime of commercial, each  
3 and every case that goes into these admiralty  
4 courts are being traded on the stock market.  
5 Just go and check Dunn and Bradstreet. You  
6 will see your name on Dunn and Bradstreet.  
7 Your social security and your birth  
8 certificates are being traded around the  
9 world. Go and check it out. Stop deceiving  
10 the people. Thank you very much.

11 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.  
12 Adelina Blanco.

13 MS. BLANCO: Good evening. My  
14 name is Adolina Blanco, and I am a resident of  
15 Nassau County. I am here to talk about two  
16 different sides of CPS. One, the side that  
17 failed me when I was a teenager. When I went  
18 to talk to my counselor about what was going  
19 on in my home and they did absolutely  
20 nothing. To the point where I had to leave my  
21 home because they did absolutely nothing. I  
22 turned out great by the way. I guess being  
23 out on the street at 16 years old taught me a  
24 lot. Taught me how to survive. Taught me how  
25 to be a fighter.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And I believe in this, everything  
3 happens for a reason. It was God's intent to  
4 have me here tonight because this is my first  
5 time here. And listening to everybody, I  
6 wasn't going to discuss the second side.  
7 Okay? I was just going to talk about me. But  
8 now I have to bring up the second side.

9 2015 my husband is arrested.  
10 Because a scorned ex-girlfriend made a false  
11 allegation against him. Okay? Her daughter,  
12 that does not happen to be his child although  
13 he has a child with her, according to CPS made  
14 an allegation. There was no investigation.  
15 Within 24 hours he was arrested. Okay?  
16 Discovery was withheld from us. He could not  
17 even defend himself. Okay? Put up my house.  
18 Bailed him out. Three days later he had to go  
19 back to where? Family court. Okay? Because  
20 it wasn't enough for this woman that she  
21 already had him arrested.

22 So now here comes family court.  
23 Okay? 2015. Okay? It took us until November  
24 of 2016 to have a trial because he would not  
25 and he will never take a plea deal. Because

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 first and foremost, the first allegation that  
3 was made we were out of the country. He was  
4 not here. He was five hours away by plane.  
5 Okay? That's one.

6 When we finally got the discovery  
7 we found that the child upon questioning by  
8 the detective, the arresting detective, when  
9 questioned has she ever done anything to  
10 herself, she said well, you know, two days ago  
11 my mother did tell me to take something and  
12 put it somewhere. I'm leaving certain things  
13 out because she is a child that was instructed  
14 by her mother to do something.

15 You know who should have went and  
16 got arrested? Her mother. Okay?

17 Upon his acquittal, she decided  
18 that she needed to take the next step which  
19 was family court. So finally, in 2018,  
20 everything in family court was cleared. So we  
21 said well, finished. You get to see your  
22 other daughter that you haven't seen since  
23 2015. And he did the same thing that this  
24 gentleman did. He said I am so afraid of what  
25 she can do to me that I do want to even see my

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 child. Okay?

3 Think that's enough? No. Not  
4 enough for her. She went after his job.  
5 Which is the same thing that happened to that  
6 gentleman. My husband lost his job. He was  
7 working for the state. On an allegation that  
8 he was acquitted for. Upon testimony in  
9 court, okay, the mother lied 19 times. 19  
10 times. The daughter lied 30 something times.  
11 It took a jury of his peers 20 minutes to  
12 acquit him on trumped up charges. Because  
13 remember what I said, it was one allegation.  
14 Okay? Then one allegation became 18 and I  
15 became pretty good at being an investigator.  
16 Okay? I had to help my husband run 24 hours  
17 of the day for every other day that he was  
18 alleged.

19 And there is corruption. There is  
20 corruption in the court system. Which Ellen  
21 Greenberg was my husband's judge too. Judge  
22 Aaron, who already retired, made a guest  
23 appearance at a hearing that was held against  
24 my husband. The same judge that allowed a  
25 woman that lied, okay, that gave her an order

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 of protection and now I know this, and this is  
3 why I say everything happens for a reason. At  
4 the time that she made the allegation she  
5 stated that his older daughter that was in his  
6 custody was her child. And that child is not  
7 her child. So, for six months, okay, his  
8 daughter couldn't even see him and he had full  
9 sole custody of her from a previous marriage.

10 So we have a problem here. A big  
11 problem. I forgot my paper. So I'm going to  
12 try to remember every CPS worker's name that  
13 came to my house. Okay? Vanessa Skeets.  
14 Wait. Let's do it in order. Ms. Arnold.  
15 Which did absolute no investigating. Vanessa  
16 Skeets. Which was going to hit the home run.  
17 Lorraine. Who I call the cleaner because she  
18 was an aged woman, and when I said to her do  
19 you have a son? She said yes. I said I  
20 honest to God pray no one ever does this to  
21 your son. Okay?

22 We are in what, 2020, right? The  
23 woman is still going around slandering my  
24 husband's name. Slandering my name. Telling  
25 people she has an order of protection out

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 against me. Guess what? She can't. We have  
3 no familiar tie. That I knew. Okay?

4 So we have to dismantle CPS and we  
5 have to hold everybody accountable for it. He  
6 has children that he didn't get to see because  
7 of this for about a year. Okay? Then after  
8 that he has a child that he hasn't seen since  
9 2015.

10 And I know it's late but I'm  
11 disgusted by the fact that CPS got to go home  
12 and they didn't hear us. And when you guys  
13 took your turn I know some people were making  
14 noise. I was not. I was quiet and I was  
15 paying attention. And I noticed and I  
16 realized that you guys were trying to extend  
17 the time. I know how it works. I attend  
18 board meetings all the time. Okay? So I  
19 apologize if we kept you here so long. But we  
20 all voted you in place. So just like we voted  
21 you in we can vote you out. So if you're not  
22 going to do your job that is what we intend to  
23 do.

24 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Steven  
25 Kleinbart. Is Sara with you? Do you want to



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 come up together?

3 MR. KLEINBART: I'm Steven  
4 Kleinbart. I am a survivor. Not as the  
5 typical survivor that spoke before or others.  
6 But I was taken from my parents with reasons I  
7 won't get into that now. And it was not as  
8 what others claimed as not nearly as bad as  
9 was mentioned before. And had it just been  
10 that I could have forgiven it and moved on,  
11 here with my wife, if they only would have  
12 left that part alone. But they continued to  
13 go after me, my wife, my daughter and my  
14 parents and that's why I am mentioning it  
15 now. I would not have been willing to mention  
16 it otherwise.

17 Now, I state several times by a  
18 place where I saw a sign which I believe is  
19 what every child should feel. It shows a  
20 child sitting in a tree reading a book saying  
21 this may not be Buckingham Palace but it's  
22 home to me. That is a general feeling of how  
23 any child is to feel by their parents. To  
24 claim that a child will feel better in another  
25 place or that the parents are unable to care

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 for the child, without any evidence of course,  
3 is no reason at all to take a child away.

4 In December 2016 there was a  
5 headline in the New York Post, ACS Doesn't  
6 Care, and that was after the death of Jaden  
7 Jordan, another child who was left to die by  
8 social services. And he was another incident  
9 of someone whose death was preventable. So,  
10 there are numerous, certainly most, instances  
11 of these cases when there is no evidence they  
12 make everything wrong. There is evidence they  
13 say there's no evidence.

14 I would like to add on that there  
15 is an order to remove postings from the news  
16 and not only is it unconstitutional but it's a  
17 laughing matter. As a courtesy, I am not  
18 giving names here. All involved know who they  
19 are and all involved in the abduction of our  
20 daughter and we've been through court. We've  
21 already disproven every one of their claims  
22 with irrefutable evidence. So if she remains  
23 in this court it's hostage.

24 So all involved I'm giving you a  
25 courtesy notice. You have thus far dug your

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2       own graves. And if you continue any action to  
3       continue this noncase you have buried  
4       yourselves and you have caused yourselves to  
5       be the shame of the world and you will be in  
6       the news for that as a result of your own  
7       actions. Thank you.

8                   MS. KLEINBART: As you just heard  
9       from my husband Steven, I am Sara. CPS has  
10      been trying to force us to divorce. Yes, you  
11      hear that. CPS of Kings County has been  
12      trying to divorce us for four and a half years  
13      due to three things.

14                  One, that I made up that my  
15      daughter has autism, which was diagnosed by  
16      nine neurologists. Can you even make up  
17      autism? Can you?

18                  The second thing is educational  
19      neglect. Despite the fact that we have state  
20      of New York records, transcripts and proof she  
21      was never once neglected. On the contrary.  
22      From January 25, 2016 to October 15, 2018, the  
23      day of her abduction, she went from grade zero  
24      to fourth grade. Two and a half years of  
25      seven days a week nonstop, Steven and Sara

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 Kleinbart, mom and dad of Hanna Kleinbart,  
3 worked 24 hours a day with hired help to get  
4 our daughter to verbalize, to communicate, to  
5 socialize. Yet we were considered neglectful  
6 parents by CPS.

7 The third reason why our daughter  
8 was abducted in addition to what Steven stated  
9 was, because mom created on February 11, 2017  
10 pneumonia. Can a human being create  
11 pneumonia? I was held hostage and was taken  
12 away from my daughter for six months. Just  
13 now, April 4, 2019, for six months because I  
14 prayed in front of my daughter six feet away.  
15 CPS stated it's detrimental. It's life  
16 threatening if I pray in front of her. That  
17 is unconstitutional.

18 Tonight, just before Steven and I  
19 came here, three hours, CPS gagged us. We  
20 were not able to talk. Not able to write. My  
21 daughter has autism. She has not been allowed  
22 to write anything. When she does they say we  
23 are harming her. She's a visual learner. The  
24 state of New York and the county, the district  
25 stated she must be not more than six student

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 ratio. Three teachers. CPS placed her last  
3 year in second grade and blamed us that now  
4 she's two years behind in academics.  
5 Furthermore, she is in a class ratio of 30  
6 students one teacher. A child of autism,  
7 autonomic nerve disease, asthma. They threw  
8 her medication in the garbage. She has not  
9 seen her GI in a year and a half. Can a  
10 parent place a feeding tube into their child?

11 CPS stated I, mom, placed a feeding  
12 tube into my child and had my daughter at age  
13 eight years old state to her legal age  
14 attorney mom harmed you right? by doing  
15 surgery on you. I have no medical degree for  
16 the record. Can I do that? Tell me how CPS  
17 didn't lie to my face.

18 Judge Bendervale, Jr. of Kings  
19 County, New York stated on October 15, 2018,  
20 the day of the abduction, there is over 20,000  
21 records. Nothing against these parents and  
22 this family. Yet why was she abducted? Why  
23 was she locked off from her entire family?  
24 Why did CPS create two false birth  
25 certificates? How is that legal? How? Yet

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 everyone is silent.

3 We wrote numerous letters to the  
4 fraud department. That brings another thing.  
5 CPS wrote in over 19 times parents are  
6 lunatics. The child is not disabled. Guess  
7 what? April 11, 2019 Steven and I found out  
8 from social security state of New York  
9 disability, ACS, I cannot mention the name at  
10 the moment due to legal proceedings, the  
11 agency that is holding my daughter hostage and  
12 the foster-supposed family are all collecting  
13 \$733 a month since the day of her abduction.  
14 How can you state CPS is excellent when they  
15 lie and fraudulently money laundering against  
16 us.

17 One more tip of the iceberg. Get  
18 ready for this everyone in this room. We,  
19 here, are approved eight consecutive years by  
20 the very agency under the state of New York as  
21 foster parents. Adoption parents. And one  
22 more. We are also entitled to have children  
23 around the clock in our house. Which we do  
24 have. We had hundreds of kids, I don't even  
25 know how many, who've walked through our

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 door. Children who were beaten, abused  
3 neglected, where CPS failed.

4 There was a child of 17 years old  
5 who became crippled, blind and deaf and 80  
6 percent paralyzed because CPS refused to help  
7 this child. We have many more cases that I  
8 can state but it will take at least another  
9 two hours and I don't want to take anyone  
10 else's time.

11 But each of you sitting there, you  
12 go to sleep, hang out by coffee shops, go on  
13 vacations. CPS stated Steven and I are no  
14 good because our daughter, when she was eight  
15 years old, requested to have a birthday party  
16 by the president at the White House. Guess  
17 what? We surprised her. First we did home  
18 schooling. 7:35 a.m. Yes, you hear right.  
19 Every morning our daughter was up at six a.m.  
20 because that's what she wanted. She had play  
21 time. She had three friends nearby who also  
22 played with her. One of them was a home  
23 schooled child. And guess what? 10:30 a.m.  
24 she got break and we made that party at the  
25 White House.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 We were told we're negligent. Is  
3 it is? Three hours. 7:30 to 10:30 a.m. doing  
4 schooling on her vacation. We are told we are  
5 negligent.

6 Now listen to this and then I shall  
7 try to close for the night.

8 Steven and I are standing here.  
9 CPS has stated to us we will be most likely in  
10 prison on February 25, 2020. February 25,  
11 2020. Why? Because people around the globe  
12 opened up a Go Fund Me to help us raise the  
13 money for the legal fees because on October  
14 17, 2019 was the first day in court. Since  
15 April 14, 2016 our voice was heard. And  
16 that's why they want to put us in prison. No  
17 due process. We didn't get ever once served  
18 by the judge, not by CPS, not by our  
19 attorneys. My attorney stated April 24, 2019,  
20 The reason why your daughter was taken was  
21 because CPS needs a certain amount of  
22 children. They are short. They need their  
23 money. They need a paycheck and I do too. I  
24 have it in writing. So no one can state I do  
25 not have that.



1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The next words she wrote to me was  
3 beyond shocking. ACS doesn't care about you  
4 or your child. They don't care if she lives  
5 or dies. Don't worry. Everything is good.  
6 But just keep it in the background your child  
7 may die under CPS.

8 Now how is CPS helping? None of us  
9 slept. Not a single person in my community  
10 has slept. When three units of the police  
11 department were called by CPS to surround my  
12 home -- yes, you hear right -- and stated to  
13 me, and that my husband was right behind me  
14 and stated the following. You have two  
15 options. One, go to prison now and you don't  
16 see your child. Two, we take your child now  
17 and you don't get arrested at this time. How  
18 is that a help of CPS? Nothing was found  
19 against us. We have clear, clean records.  
20 How is that? I demand an answer.

21 My daughter is suffering --

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara if you  
23 could just wrap it up please.

24 MS. KLEINBART: She's been  
25 through CPS six months in a corrupt system

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    under the guidance of social workers that  
3    they're teaching her to state she wants to be  
4    adopted. Yet, they took away a year and a  
5    half of all her related services and just a  
6    week ago they stated in court mom and dad are  
7    neglectful because they refuse to give therapy  
8    to the child. How is that for a system of CPS  
9    helping families and parents reunite?

10                   I hope you take this to heart and  
11   you bring our children home. We don't need  
12   any more deaths of Thomas, Jaden or Zimmery  
13   and many, many hundreds of thousands or more.  
14   End this anti-Semitism. End human  
15   trafficking. You want a job? There are  
16   plenty. Don't waste our taxpaying monies.  
17   Don't use special education children with  
18   disabilities just because they cannot voice  
19   their own. We are here. Please help every  
20   one of them.

21                   I end with a heart broken of  
22   another victim of Thomas. He is placed on my  
23   daughter's bed. Another child. That's  
24   another reason why they're keeping my daughter  
25   away. Because somebody who interviewed us

1 Health - 2-5-20  
2 publicized on social media her bedroom.  
3 That's not a reason to imprison me or my  
4 husband. It's not a reason to take kids  
5 away. I demand this end.

6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.  
7 Victoria Navaro.

8 MS. NAVARO: Hi. My name is  
9 Victoria Navaro. My son Ray turned one in  
10 July. He was taken from me in August because  
11 a lieutenant of the Suffolk County Second  
12 Precinct took the information from my ex about  
13 17 unfounded reports that hospitals and  
14 doctors made for my child that CPS unfounded  
15 because there wasn't enough evidence.

16 Like these people here were saying  
17 that there's not enough credible evidence. I  
18 don't know why doctors don't have or aren't  
19 credible when they're the ones making the  
20 reports and documenting an eight month old  
21 child being brought back to his mother with  
22 bruises all over his body and CPS as well.  
23 It's unfounded.

24 So ACS in Queens took that. Took  
25 it because the lieutenant said I had

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Munchausens. He called the law guardian in  
3 Queens and said she has Munchausens. She's  
4 imaging things. There were no bruises there  
5 and there were pictures that day and when he  
6 came back to me the following day he had more  
7 bruises.

8 When I went to court I was ambushed  
9 by the law guardian for my child and the  
10 attorney for my ex who made the entire custody  
11 hearing about what this lieutenant had said.  
12 There was no report. There was no affidavit.  
13 He wasn't even there. And my child, when I  
14 left court that day a custody order was signed  
15 behind my back under my petition. The three  
16 of them went behind my back to another judge  
17 two days later attempting to file a neglect  
18 petition. They used that order that went  
19 behind my back that I never got a copy of  
20 until October. I never even knew it existed.

21 I was put through a fast track  
22 neglect proceeding. I was forced -- I sat in  
23 a room with social workers who tried to force  
24 me to sign a handwritten document that said I  
25 never saw any bruises and neither did the

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2   doctors because that's what the lieutenant  
3   told them. That the doctors had told him that  
4   there were no bruises. That's how much damage  
5   a police officer, like her ex-husband, that's  
6   how much damage they can do because people  
7   take them at their word. That's how much  
8   power they have. He's still a lieutenant  
9   somewhere. They just moved him around but  
10  he's still there.

11                   So are the two officers that threw  
12  me in Stony Brook that day because they didn't  
13  want -- they wanted to protect my ex. They  
14  wanted him to take the baby home so that he  
15  could come back with more bruises the  
16  following day.

17                   I do accounting for a living. I  
18  feed numbers. I don't imagine things. My  
19  baby never had a US passport and suddenly by  
20  last Friday he was out of the country to a  
21  nonextradition country. And they told me 24  
22  hours after he was taken. How did he get a  
23  passport? Who helped him get a passport to  
24  get out of this country? I can never get him  
25  back.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And this is what I have to live  
3 with. Pictures of unfounded reports. This is  
4 the social worker holding the baby. Taking  
5 the pictures that were never reported. This  
6 is what an uppercut on my baby looks like. Do  
7 you really think these people have star  
8 players? That's what a star player is.

9 Now my baby is gone and he has a  
10 four year old brother who he hasn't seen in  
11 over six months. Does he even remember his  
12 brother? My son asks for him all the time.  
13 He says Mommy, when is Ray coming home? I  
14 don't know what to tell him anymore because  
15 he's not even in the US. This is the amount  
16 of damage they can do.

17 No offense to the police but they  
18 contributed. I have Munchausens. No doctor  
19 has ever claimed Munchausens. And the 17  
20 reports that the doctors and hospitals made on  
21 behalf of my child are being used against me  
22 in court because I imagined all of this.  
23 Imagined it? My baby was breast feeding when  
24 they took him from me. They need to go. They  
25 need to be abolished. They really do. I have

1                   Health - 2-5-20  
2    hundreds of pictures of bruises on my baby.  
3    All of them are unfounded.  
4                   LEGISLATOR WALKER:       That was our  
5    last speaker. I thank you all for coming here  
6    tonight. I thank you for staying. I know  
7    it's a long night for all of you. Please get  
8    home safe all of you.

9                   (Meeting was adjourned at 12:35  
10   p.m.)

11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATION

I, FRANK GRAY, a Notary  
Public in and for the State of New  
York, do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing is a true and  
accurate transcript of my stenographic  
notes.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have  
hereunto set my hand this 15th day of  
February 2020

-----

FRANK GRAY